### Application Ref: NP/22/0482/FUL

**Case Officer** Rob Scourfield **Applicant** Mr & Mrs Titterton

Agent Mr T Colquhoun, Tim Colquhoun Architects Ltd

**Proposal** Remodelling of front facade and altering existing flat roof

to form roof terrace

Site Location Goscar House, Crackwell Street, Tenby, Pembrokeshire,

**SA70 7BY** 

**Grid Ref** SN13460047

Date Valid 09-Aug-2022 Target Date 07-Dec-2022

This application has been referred to Planning Committee for decision as conditional support for the scheme has been offered by Tenby Town Council, which is contrary to the Planning Officer's recommendation for refusal.

# **Consultee Response**

**Tenby Town Council:** No objection on the proviso that the amenity of

neighbouring properties is preserved

**Tenby Civic Society**: Concerns as to potential impact on amenity of neighbours

and potential vehicular damage to proposed bay windows

Natural Resources Wales: No adverse comment: advisory note suggested

PCNPA Ecologist: No response at the time of this report

PCC Highways: No adverse comment No adverse comment

### **Public Response**

The application has been appropriately advertised, and response have been received from six parties at the time of this report. The material issues raised include:

- Impact on the amenity of neighbours' residential accommodation and existing terraces, through loss of privacy, potential noise nuisance and lighting.
- Potential overshadowing
- Inconsistency with design concept of original development in terms of preserving amenity of neighbouring properties
- Potential precedent and creation of visual items such as outdoor furniture, umbrellas, plants etc. at high-level
- Impact on biodiversity
- Control of building works and access
- Impact on the setting of adjoining listed buildings
- Impact on the character and appearance of Tenby Conservation Area

A number of issues were raised in terms of lease agreements, these not considered material planning matters.

#### Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website –

Local Development Plan 2 - Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022

Page : 86

Page 173 of 234

LDP2 Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty

LDP2 Policy 08 - Special Qualities

LDP2 Policy 11 - Nationally Protected Sites and Species

LDP2 Policy 14 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

LDP2 Policy 29 - Sustainable Design

LDP2 Policy 30 - Amenity

**PPW11** 

SPG16 - Sustainable Design & Development

TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning

TAN 12 - Design

TAN 24 - The Historic Environment

### **Constraints**

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m
Ancient Monument - within 500m
Recreation Character Areas
Article\_4\_Directions
Affordable Housing Submarkets
Seascape Character Areas
Conservation Area Tenby
Landscape Character Area
Special Area of Conservation - within 50m

# Officer's Appraisal

Goscar House fronts onto Crackwell Street, within Tenby Conservation Area. It has views over the harbour and forms part of the famous view of the town. The three-storey house forms part of a development granted planning permission in 2016, remodeling a storage depot serving a retail frontage on High Street. The façade emulates the Victorian style of the town, detailed in painted render with timber canted bay/sash windows. There is a flat roof behind a low parapet.

Planning permission is sought for the remodeling of the facade and alteration of the existing flat roof to form a roof terrace. NP/22/0483 is a planning application for a similar proposal at the adjacent property, Sea House.

The proposed scheme is considered contrary to the relevant policies set out in the LDP and Planning Policy Wales (2021). It is not considered to preserve or enhance Tenby Conservation Area or the setting of surrounding listed buildings. As such, the application is recommended for refusal

# **Relevant Planning History**

NP/10/0378 – conversion, extension and change of use to provide six holiday units and undercroft parking. Withdrawn 3/11/10

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022

Page : 87

Page 174 of 234

NP/14/0095 – planning permission granted on appeal in 2014 for the conversion, extension and change of use of the buildings to the rear of 46 High Street to provide 4 residential units.

NP/16/0331 – amend planning consent NP/14/0095 to create an additional dwelling ground floor flat (flat 5) and to replace the former garage/parking to extend House 1 providing an additional bedroom, plus several internal alterations to other flats/dwellings that in turn alter the openings and fenestration to the front elevation. Planning permission granted 8/12/2016

NP/15/0224 – 46 High Street – balustrade enclosure to area of flat roof adjacent to flats 2 and 3. Planning permission granted 16/06/2016

NP/15/0225. – 46 High Street – balustrade enclosure to area of flat roof adjacent to flats 2 and 3. Listed building consent granted 16/06/2016

NP/21/0755/CLE – Tiffany House. Existing flat roof used as a terrace and existing French doors. Certificate of lawful use granted 24/03/2022

NP/22/0206 – Tiffany House. Roof extension to allow additional bedroom/lounge, renovation of front elevation. Planning permission granted 26/05/2022

# **Current Proposal**

The proposal comprises: -

- The remodeling of the façade. In tandem with Sea House adjacent (NP/22/0483), it is proposed to re-cast the plain frontage to reflect the traditional Victorian buildings of the town. Re-rendering is proposed, with rustication added at ground-floor level. The existing day windows are to be replaced with ones of better proportions and traditional detail; these set to the outer bays of the houses to create symmetry. The inner bays are to be detailed with traditional single French doors with decorative metal balconies, replacing the existing plain ones. All proposed joinery is of traditional design with painted finish. This element of the proposal is supported, considered to enhance the character of the conservation area and fit well within the setting of surrounding listed buildings, the details of which the scheme reflects.
- Alteration of the existing flat roof to form a roof terrace. Again, this forms a scheme in tandem with NP/22/0483). This comprises: -
- The raising of the front parapet by 800mm (Sea House) and 500mm (Goscar House) to remove the existing step between both parapets.
- ➤ The construction of an upstand roof around the sides and rear (north) of both properties with hipped corners. The outer face is to be finished in slate to give an impression of a conventional roof. The total height above the existing flat roof is 2100mm. With a proposed void beneath the decking (associated with a rainwater harvesting system), the remaining upstand of approximately 1700mm forms a parapet/screen with vertical inner face, this also clad in slate.

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022

- A central roof extension to provide the bulkhead for an internal access stair to the roof terrace. This measures some 2600mm by 5400mm deep, clad in slate, the front and rear faces pitched. Flat roof with solar panels. The extension allows access east and west to Goscar and Sea Houses respectively and forms the main element of the division between each roof terrace, the boundary continued southward by a louvred fence of similar height to the perimeter roof. The stair extension projects marginally higher.
- ➤ The creation of a viable roof terrace to each house, approximately 3600mm by 7300mm deep to Goscar House and 4400mm (tapering to 3800mm) by 7300mm deep to Sea House.

# **Key Issues**

The application raises the following planning matters: -

- Principle of Development
- Siting and sustainable design
- Amenity
- Listed Buildings
- Conservation Area
- Biodiversity

### Principle of Development

Future Wales – The National Plan 2040 (FW which was adopted on 24th February 221 and is the National Development Framework for Wales – is the national tier of the Development Plan. Policy 4 Supporting Rural Communities states that Strategic and Local Development Plans must identify their rural communities, assess their needs and set out policies to support them. On page 104, Future Wales states that: National Park Authorities are unique planning entities with a specific remit to reflect the distinctive characteristics of their areas... and that Future Wales policies respect the functions of National Parks in terms of their statutory purposes...

Tenby is a Tier 1 Service and Tourism Centre and proposals to LDP Policy 2 permits proposals which contribute to the protection and enhancement of the town's special qualities. Policy 8 of the LDP identifies that the priorities to conserve and enhance the special qualities of the National Park include ensuring that the historic environment is protected and where possible enhanced. The assessment of these policies depends on detailed matters of siting and sustainable design as well as consideration of Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas which are addressed below.

Siting and Sustainable Design

In terms of policy 29:

 Criterion a. The proposed roof terrace is not considered to pay regard to place and local distinctiveness in creating a high-level open-fronted roof terrace across two properties on the north sea-front of Tenby. Whilst the slated upstand gives the impression of a traditional roof from certain angles, as well

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022

as creating a degree of screening, it is considered that the typical ingredients of a roof terrace - tables, umbrellas, plants and the like - will be visible when looking at the properties from the harbour area, in addition to the actual users of the terraces. Roof terraces and balconies exist across Tenby's north front, some historic (e.g., the balconies at 8-9 Belle Vue, listed Grade II) and many associated with modern redevelopment (e.g., Royal Victoria Court). These are not of roof-top form, having no real impact on Tenby's roof-scape. A number of roof-top terraces exist set back from the street frontage and not prominently visible from the public realm. Two examples in very close proximity include those at 46 High Street and Tiffany House (as referenced above). In contrast, the current proposal is for a roof-top terrace over two prominent sea-front properties, the scale and design considered alien. The proposed roof terrace therefore is considered neither to conserve or enhance the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park.

Amenity and Privacy.

In terms of LDP Policy 30: -

- Criterion a. It is considered that the proposed roof terrace would create visual intrusion on the quality of the environment currently enjoyed by people living, nearby to the development. The proposed terrace is within close proximity of properties to the north, including Northcliffe House and Tiffany House. The terrace at Goscar House lies approximately 1300mm away from the terrace of Northcliffe House at its nearest point, the windows of the latter some 5 - 5.5 metres away. The terrace at Sea House lies some 3 metres from the existing terrace of Tiffany House and some 7 metres from its windows. When redevelopment was originally proposed under NP/10/0378, pitch-roofs and dormers were proposed, resulting in objections due to impact on amenity. Under NP/14/0095, the roofscape was maintained at the existing height, with an additional parapet and a mansard roof to the west (the latter separate to Goscar and Sea Houses). This was considered to retain the privacy and amenity enjoyed by neighbours. The current proposal to some extent reintroduces some roof-scape at a lower level and neighbours have raised concern as to loss of light. A daylight and sunlight test undertaken by the agent confirms that the development has no detrimental impact in this respect. The loss of views comprises another issue raised, one not material in planning terms. Objections as to potential external intrusive lighting may be controlled via appropriate conditions. Whilst the roof upstand at 1700mm offers a degree of screening, it also creates a feature that would appear overbearing to the immediate neighbours in Northcliffe House and Tiffany House. In terms of the wider impact on the environment, the creation of a large rooftop terrace in this prominent location is considered intrusive.
  - Criterion b. The scale of the proposed roof terrace is considered incompatible with the surroundings, spanning two properties, introducing a feature alien to the surrounding roofscapes by virtue of the open three-sided false roof. Whilst roof terraces exist in close proximity, they are set back from the street frontage and not readily visible
  - Criterion d. The development is considered visually intrusive this will be considered further below in the context of the setting of surrounding listed

buildings and the impact on the character and appearance of Tenby Conservation Area.

# Listed Buildings

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and the provisions of TAN 24 (The Historic Environment) requires that special regard be paid to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. LDP Policy 8 advocates that the historic environment is protected, and where possible enhanced. There are a number of listed buildings within close proximity (including Northcliffe House) whilst viewed from the harbour area, Goscar House with Sea House enjoys a fine setting with several listed buildings each side (Bridge Street and Crackwell Street), the roofscape of High Street above and the group around The Sluice below. This collectively forms part of the 'iconic' view of Tenby Harbour. The surrounding historic roofs are mostly fronted by parapets, some concealing low-pitched roofs, others with more prominent pitches including dormers. Goscar and Sea Houses follows the parapet design, the roof behind flat. Due to the topography (the houses being tall relative to the narrow Crackwell Street), the proposed roof alterations will not be seen at close range from the public realm, but rather as part of the streetscape viewed from the harbour area. The proposed hipped design and use of natural slate provide a degree of traditional form and recessive material, but from many angles, the false form of the roof bounding the terraces will be apparent, notably when furnished and in use. As such the proposed roof terrace is not considered to preserve the setting of the surrounding listed buildings and is considered contrary to LDP Policy 8. With regard to the proposed remodeling of the façade, there is no concern in this regard.

#### Conservation Area

Section 72 of the 1990 Act requires that when considering planning applications, special attention must be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the area. In this regard, the concerns parallel those laid out in terms of the setting of the listed buildings which predominate in this part of the conservation area. As such, the proposal neither preserves or enhances the character of the conservation area.

#### **Biodiversity**

An objector has noted the presence of nesting seagulls - a protected species - on the roof of the buildings. The agent was advised (on 21/09/22) to seek the advice of an ecologist. In the absence of an ecological report at the time of this report, there is insufficient information to determine the application in accordance with LDP Policy 11, but a report may be provided prior to the date of the Committee.

In terms of concerns raised as to the timing and nature of the construction works, this may be addressed by an appropriate condition were the recommendation for approval.

#### Conclusion

The proposed scheme in terms of the proposed roof terrace is considered to cause an unacceptable level of adverse impact on the amenity of neighbouring properties and is not considered to preserve the setting of surrounding listed buildings and is not considered to preserve or enhance the character of Tenby Conservation Area. In addition, insufficient detail has been received with regard to protected species.

However, in terms of the proposed remodelling of the façade, this is considered acceptable in terms of impact on amenity, the setting of listed buildings and the character and appearance of the conservation area.

The current application - which covers both elements - is considered contrary to Policies 2, 8, 11, 14 and 30 of LDP2, as well as sections 66 and 72 of the 1990 Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas Act and cannot be supported.

In reaching a recommendation, regard has been given to the requirements of sections 3 and 5 of the Well Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. It is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards the Welsh Ministers' well-being objective of supporting safe, cohesive and resilient communities.

#### Recommendation

Refuse for the following reasons: -

- Policy 2 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that land use priorities in Tenby will be to ensure development permitted contribute to the protection and enhancement of the town's special qualities. The development with regard to the roof terrace is therefore considered contrary to the adopted policy.
- 2. Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that development must preserve the special qualities of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and that the historic environment be protected and where possible, enhanced. The development namely the proposed roof terrace is not considered to protect or enhance the historic environment. The development with regard to the roof terrace is therefore considered contrary to adopted policy.
- 3. Policy 11 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that development likely to have an adverse impact on the conservation value of nationally protected sites will only be permitted on a conditional basis. With insufficient information to hand, the development with regard to the roof terrace is considered contrary to adopted policy.
- 4. Policy 29 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that development will be expected to be well-designed in terms of place and local distinctiveness. The alien design of the proposed roof terrace is therefore considered contrary to adopted policy.

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022

- 5. Policy 30 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that development will not be permitted where it has an unacceptable impact on amenity. The development namely the proposed roof terrace is considered to cause an overbearing outlook for the immediate neighbours at Tiffany House and Northcliffe House, as well as having the potential to disturb the privacy of neighbours. The development with regard to the roof terrace is therefore considered contrary to adopted policy.
- 6. Section 66 of the Planning (listed buildings and conservation areas) Act 1990 and the provisions of TAN 24 (The Historic Environment) requires that special regard be paid to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. The development with regard to the proposed roof terrace is not considered to preserve the setting of surrounding listed buildings.
- 7. Section 72 of the Planning (listed buildings and conservation areas) Act 1990 and the provisions of TAN 24 (The Historic Environment) requires that when considering planning applications, special attention must be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the area. The development with regard to the proposed roof terrace is not considered to preserve the setting of surrounding listed buildings.

































