

**Application Ref: NP/22/0121/LBA**

<b>Case Officer</b>	Rob Scourfield		
<b>Applicant</b>	Mr M Conner		
<b>Agent</b>	Mr Mike Smith		
<b>Proposal</b>	Replacement of bar with conference room and facilities. Creation of storage areas, construction of viewing deck and generator house (retrospective)		
<b>Site Location</b>	Thorne Island Hotel, Angle, Pembroke, Pembrokeshire, SA71 5BE		
<b>Grid Ref</b>	SM84610383		
<b>Date Valid</b>	22-Feb-2022	<b>Target Date</b>	04-Oct-2022

**The recommendation can be made by Committee but needs to be referred to CADW for the final decision given the Grade II\* listed status.**

**Delegated Status**

Not applicable, as the property is Grade II\* listed.

**Summary**

Thorne Island Fort, a Grade II\* listed building lies on a small island just north of West Angle Bay. The fort was built 1853-54 as an outer defence to Milford Haven against Napoleonic threat. Characterised by massive ashlar-faced walls, the fort was converted to a hotel by 1947 when sash windows were inserted. After a period of neglect, the fort has been refurbished since 2017.

The proposed scheme is considered to be acceptable, having regard to the relevant policies set out in the LDP and Planning Policy Wales (2021) and all other material considerations. The application is therefore recommended for approval, subject to conditions.

**Consultee Response**

**Angle Community Council:** Objecting due to potential visual impact of proposed conference centre (on original scheme) – No objection on revised scheme

**Natural Resources Wales:** No objection 12/09/23 (following re-consultation and omission of jetty).

**PCNPA Ecologist:** No Objection

**Dyfed Archaeological Trust:** No adverse comment

## **Public Response**

The application has been appropriately advertised, and no responses have been received.

## **Constraints**

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m  
Site of Special Scientific Interest - within 50m  
Heritage Coast - within 100m  
Historic Landscape  
NPA Foreshore - within 25m  
Potential for surface water flooding  
Affordable Housing Submarkets  
Seascape Character Areas  
Within Site of Special Scientific Interest consult NRW / Planning Ecologist\_20m  
Landscape Character Area  
Special Area of Conservation - within 50m  
Listed Building

## **Policies considered**

As this application is for Listed Building consent, section 16 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires the local planning authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest. There is, therefore, no statutory requirement to determine the application in accordance with the policies of the development plan.

Planning Policy Wales Technical Advice Note 24 (The Historic Environment) 2017 is a material consideration, with guidance provided by Conservation Principles for the Sustainable Management of the Historic Environment of Wales (Cadw, 2011).

## **Officer's Appraisal**

Thorne Island Fort is an irregular polygon in plan, built with seaward battery to contain open-mounted guns. The landward side comprises three single-storey ranges of brick-vaulted ashlar-faced barrack and ancillary buildings around a courtyard with the armoury at the west end of the south range. The armoury is protected by a solid half-round bastion built out from the exterior wall. Facing east and west are parapets with apertures for small-arms fire. The entrance doorway has a heavily voussoired arch, dated 1854. The entrance is reached via stone/concrete steps from the jetty, the latter a later concrete structure. The interior of the fort is well-preserved, typified by brick-vaulted chambers and ashlar walling with small-paned sash windows. Much of the fort's original infrastructure remains. Of the later hotel work, a later C20 block-built bar sits incongruously on the west-facing battery.

The proposed scheme is considered to be acceptable, having regard to the relevant policies set out in the LDP and Planning Policy Wales (2021) and all other material

## Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

considerations. The application is therefore recommended for approval, subject to conditions.

A consideration of works requiring planning permission is contained within the accompanying planning application (NP/22/0120)

### **Relevant Planning History**

NP/99/0587 – Alterations and extensions. Planning consent approved.

NP/99/0588 – Alterations and extensions. Listed building consent approved

NP/00/0427 – Extension to accommodate cable car transfer from West Angle. Approved.

NP/18/0401 – Enlargement of aperture to insert hardwood sash window. Listed building consent granted.

NP/20/0120 - Emergency repair works to Thorne Island storage areas, generator house, cliff reinforcement, works to viewing deck, improvements and upgrading of existing bar in retrospect - planning application under consideration.

### **Current Proposal**

As submitted, the proposal comprises:-

- Construction of a multi-purpose room. This is to be constructed on the parapet of the armory range within the existing parapets (the south, east and west elevations are built off the parapets. The structure measures some 19.1 metres by 7 metres providing a conference room to the west and toilet facilities to the east. The structure is to be timber-framed and clad in concrete boarding (to withstand the harsh maritime conditions). Simple glazing, including screen-glazing over the west parapet to gain views down the Milford Haven. The roof is to be zinc-clad, the main section flat, the southern section sloping down to the parapet. On the flat section is an array of inclined solar panels. The design philosophy is simple and modernist, the low rectilinear form and scale intended to reflect the design of the fort and not be unduly prominent when viewed from the headland/coastal path.
- Construction of a viewing deck, a raised mass-concrete structure set against the south-west parapet of the battery, some eight metres in diameter with inset steps.
- Construction of a generator house. A modest block-work structure some 2.2 x 1.3 metres in plan with metal-sheeted mono-pitched roof. Metal doors and louvres. Oil tank alongside. Site lies alongside access steps to north-east occupying platform of former ancillary building.
- Creation of storage areas via enclosure of small yards each to north and south ends of barracks ranges. Both areas roofed over in standing-seam zinc.

## Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

As such, the application can be supported subject to conditions.

In terms of Cadw's Conservation Principles:-

1. **Evidential value.** The constructional history of the fort is well-known and recorded. The proposed scheme has little impact on the fort's historic fabric, the multi-purpose room set above and within the existing parapet walls, the generator house set on an existing platform. The viewing deck and storage areas comprise works which are acceptable in design and readily reversible. The contemporary nature of the conference centre adds a legible feature to the fort consistent with its present use.
2. **Historical Value.** The scheme preserves one of the most prominent of the group of Napoleonic defences guarding the Milford Haven from potential attack of Pembroke Dockyard. The fortifications are of very high historical value and figure prominently in the history of the county.
3. **Aesthetic value.** The scheme is considered appropriate in scale, style and detail in terms of the character of the building and its setting.
4. **Communal value.** The building's communal value as 'a Listed as a well-preserved fort of Palmerston's Haven defences' remains unaltered.

In terms of the comments received from Angle Community Council and the Friends of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, the proposed modernist conference centre has been omitted in favour of a smaller multi-purpose room of more conservative rectilinear design. It is considered that the present scheme pays 'special regard to the desirability of preserving the building, its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest' as is required by Section 16 of the 1990 Act. The room has been designed to reflect the rectilinear character of the fort and to reduce visual impact (both in scale and through use of materials of neutral appearance).

### **Conclusion**

The proposal is considered to be appropriate in terms of size, scale and detail. It is considered to comply with the requirements of Technical Advice Note 24, and Cadw's Conservation Principles. As such, the application can be supported subject to conditions.

In reaching a recommendation, regard has been given to the requirements of sections 3 and 5 of the Well Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. It is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the Act's sustainable development principle through its contribution towards the Welsh Ministers' well-being objective of supporting safe, cohesive and resilient communities.

## Recommendation

That Cadw be notified that this Authority is minded to grant Listed Building consent subject to the following conditions:

1. The works hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of the five years from the date of this consent.  
**Reason:** As required by Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended).
2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents: [insert plan nos. with revision references, if relevant.]  
**Reason:** In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 14 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).
3. Prior to the commencement of further works, further drawings or specifications (as applicable) @ 1:10/20 or samples shall be submitted and approved in writing by the local planning authority of the following:-
  - Proposed cladding of multi-purpose room (including the colour)**Reason:** To protect historic environment interests whilst enabling development. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 - Policy 8 (Special Qualities) and Planning Policy Wales (Edition 10, December 2018) – Chapter 6 (Distinctive and Natural Places)
4. Prior to the commencement of any further works, a method statement shall be submitted and approved in writing by the local planning authority will reference to:-
  - The fixing of the conference room to the structure of the fort (including fixings to base, walls and parapets)
  - The interface between fort structure and the roofs of the storage areas
  - The provision of drainage and services to the conference room (with details of pipes, ducts etc)**Reason:** To protect historic environment interests whilst enabling development. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 - Policy 8 (Special Qualities) and Planning Policy Wales (Edition 10, December 2018) – Chapter 6 (Distinctive and Natural Places)
5. Before occupation of the development hereby approved, the protected species mitigation proposed within the original bat report (a bat box) shall be implemented and be retained as such in perpetuity.  
**Reason:** In the interests of maintaining the special qualities of the landscape and habitats of the National Park through the protection, creation and enhancement of links between sites and their protection for amenity, landscape and biodiversity value. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 - Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 11 (Protection of Biodiversity), 14 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 30

## Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

(Amenity) and to comply with the Wildlife & Countryside Act 1981 (as amended), the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2017 and the Environment (Wales) Act 2016. Supplementary planning guidance for biodiversity can be found at <https://www.pembrokeshirecoast.wales/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/Post-Cons-Bio-SPG-Eng-1.pdf>

### **Informative**

#### **PROTECTED SPECIES**

Where any protected species listed in Annex 8 of Technical Advice Note (TAN) 5: 'Nature Conservation and Planning' (September 2009) (or as subsequently amended) is found to be present on the site (or other identified part) to which this permission relates, no works of site clearance, demolition or construction shall take place in pursuance of this permission unless a licence to disturb any such species has been granted in accordance with the appropriate regulations and legislative framework set out in Annex 7 of the aforementioned TAN 5 and a copy of any licence thereof has been produced to the satisfaction of the local planning authority.