Application Ref: NP/22/0571/FUL

Case Officer Kate Attrill

Applicant Mr & Mrs R & G Lewis

Agent Mr Wyn Harries MRICS, Harries Planning Design

Management

Proposal Demolition of existing agricultural buildings and extend

residential curtilage to allow extensions to host dwelling,

new garage, stables/storage building.

Site Location Lleine, Nevern, Newport, Pembrokeshire, SA42 0NY

Grid Ref SN09304332

Date Valid 25-Oct-2022 Target Date 18-Oct-2023

This application is being considered by the Development Management Committee as the Community Council have objected to the development.

Consultee Response

Nevern Community Council: Recommend Refusal - reiterate the objections previously stated.

PCNPA Planning Ecologist: Conditional Consent PCC - Public Protection: Conditional Consent PCC - Drainage Engineers: Conditional Consent

PCC - Transportation & Environment: No adverse comments

Public Response:

A site notice and neighbour notification letters were posted in accordance with requirements of the *Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012.*

No third-party representations were received, except for the Community Council objection.

The Community Council objected to the original plans, which were initially revised to remove the manège and scale back the design in line with officer recommendations. A further consultation was sent to Nevern Community Council on receipt of the amended plans in August and another recommendation of refusal was received from the Community Council in September. This read:

Nevern Community Council reiterate the objections previously stated. Councillors are unable to put forward any new comments on the resubmitted plans, (Demolition of existing agricultural buildings and extend residential curtilage to allow extensions to host dwelling, new garage, stables/storage building). As these are exactly the same as previously submitted except for the removal of change of use to equine and provision of sand school on adjoining land together with associated external works. Nevern Community Council recommend refusal.

Whilst Nevern Community Council state there is no difference in the plans, there has been a substantial reduction in the height of the 1.5 storey original proposal to a single storey extension to the original dwelling, with the removal of the easternmost

extension, and the existing barn (milking parlour) is now shown to be refurbished insitu rather than attached to the dwelling.

The manège was then added back in by the applicant's agent following soil testing which demonstrated that the land was not in the Best and Most Versatile (BMV) agricultural land categories as defined in Sections 3.58 and 3.59 of PPW11.

Policies considered:

Planning Policy Wales 11 (PPW11)

Future Wales - The National Plan 2040 (FW which was adopted on 24th February 2021)

TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning

TAN 06 - Planning for Sustainable Rural Communities

TAN 12 - Design

TAN 23 - Economic Development

TAN 24 - The Historic Environment

Local Development Plan 2 (LDP2) (September 2020)

LDP2 Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty

LDP2 Policy 07 - Countryside

LDP2 Policy 08 - Special Qualities

LDP2 Policy 09 - Light Pollution

LDP2 Policy 10 - Sites and Species of European Importance

LDP2 Policy 11 - Nationally Protected Sites and Species

LDP2 Policy 14 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

LDP2 Policy 29 - Sustainable Design

LDP2 Policy 30 - Amenity

LDP2 Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage

LDP2 Policy 59 - Sustainable Transport

LDP2 Policy 60 - Impacts of Traffic

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website –

Local Development Plan 2 - Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

SPG02 - Landscape

SPG07 - Biodiversity

SPG16 - Sustainable Design & Development

Constraints

Recreation Character Areas Affordable Housing Submarkets Seascape Character Areas Landscape Character Area

Officer's Appraisal

Summary

This application is recommended for approval, subject to a range of recommended conditions. Since receipt, there have been a number of revisions to made to the scheme to make it capable of officer support.

The application is now considered to meet the requirements of the relevant policies of the Authority's adopted Local Development Plan 2 (LDP2), Future Wales and national planning policy.

Site and Context

The site lies immediately adjacent to the 'C' road between Newport and Moylegrove on the north side. There have been a number of extensions since the original cottage form which subsisted from the late 1800's through to the 1953 maps. Between then and 2019, a larger residential curtilage had been formed to the rear of the house and substantial agricultural buildings formed to the west of the house.

The landscape here is very open, and the site lies within the Pen Afr to Pen y Bal Seascape Character Area (SCA 3), and the Cemaes Head Landscape Character Area (LCA 25).

The LCA is described as having 'dramatic sea cliffs form[ing] the northern boundary of this large tract of rolling farmland at the northern extremity of the National Park. A gently rolling, predominantly farmland landscape, with fields enclosed by hedgebanks that, together with the scattered farmsteads, small woodland blocks and quarries contribute to the overall mosaic pattern.

The management guidance for the Landscape Classification is to: maintain the local vernacular of stone buildings to conserve the scale and rural character of villages, hamlets and farmsteads.

Relevant Planning History

NP/07/271- Extension for disabled occupant - Approved NP/08/114 - Change of material to extension - Approved NP/17/0353/NMA - Non-material amendment to extension roof - Approved NP/18/0511/FUL - Single storey extension to north-east elevation. Small extension to residential curtilage to northwest (retrospective) - Approved

Description of Proposal

Lleine sits within a large plot, located on the northern flank of the minor coastal road which links Newport and Moylegrove. The house faces onto the road, with an access and driveway to the front of the cottage, landscaped gardens to the side and rear, and pastureland beyond. The property is a detached single storey cottage with stepped extensions bookending the original cottage form.

The site falls outside any Centre or Rural Centre, as defined for the purposes of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan 2; and the proposed extensions would be to an existing dwelling and its residential curtilage.

The application has been substantially revised since its original submission, with the description of 'annexe' being removed from the plans, the proposed manège initially removed, and the extensions to the adjacent barn being scaled back from a first-floor extension to single floor only.

There is also demolition of the large agricultural buildings on site, with proposed replacement of a pair or lower buildings for use as stabling and a storage shed with two sections of photovoltaic (PV) panels on the roof facing south-west.

The manège had been removed from the southern end of the development as the land was graded as Best and Most Versatile (BMV) agricultural land and was shown on the Welsh Government agricultural land classification predictive map as being subgrade 3a, but was subsequently re-assessed following detailed surveys as being 3b and then re-included with the application proposals.

Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:

Policy and Principle of Development Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park Landscaping & Biodiversity

Policy and Principle of Development:

Future Wales – The National Plan 2040 (FW) which was adopted on 24th February 2022 and is the National Development Framework for Wales – is the national tier of the Development Plan. Policy 4 of FW (Supporting Rural Communities) states that Strategic and Local Development Plans must identify their rural communities, assess their needs, and set out policies to support them. On page 104, Future Wales states that: National Park Authorities "are unique planning entities with a specific remit to reflect the distinctive characteristics of their areas... and that Future Wales policies respect the functions of National Parks in terms of their statutory purposes..."

The site lies outside any centre boundaries as defined by Local Development Plan 2 and is therefore classified as Countryside where development must be strictly controlled. Policy 07 of LDP2 sets out the types of development that are acceptable, in principle, in the countryside and includes a rural enterprise or recreational activity where a countryside location is essential or new farm buildings are justified for agricultural purposes.

Extensions to existing properties are usually acceptable where they accord well with the design, form, and character of the host dwelling and where extensions remain subservient in scale and form to the existing property.

The plans originally submitted as part of the application showed a rear extension to the main dwelling and a separate 2-storey 'annexe' to the north-west of the main dwelling. As a separate building, it contained all the facilities to support independent day-to-day living and would be tantamount to a new dwelling in the countryside; and in line with officer discussions, this was revised to remove the annexe element of the proposals.

The 2-storey nature of the extensions was not considered to be subservient to the main dwelling and Officers also requested that this was removed, and amended plans were then submitted by the applicant.

The application proposes the demolition of the existing agricultural buildings, the erection of a stables and storage building and a change of use to equine and the provision of a sand school (manège) on adjoining land.

In principle, the proposals as amended are considered justified in a countryside location and to accord with the principles of Future Wales and Policy 07 (Countryside) of the LDP2. Detailed matters relating to design are considered below.

Agricultural Land Classification:

Planning Policy Wales Edition 11 contains very specific guidance about how to assess proposals on high value agricultural land.

Paragraph 3.59 states that 'considerable weight' should be given to protecting such land from development because of its special importance, and that agricultural land in Grades 1, 2 and 3a should only be developed if there 'is an overriding need for the development', and either previously developed land or land in lower agricultural grades is unavailable, or available lower grade land has an environmental value recognised by a landscape, wildlife, historic or archaeological designation which outweighs the agricultural considerations.

Land is categorised into one of the following grades:

Grade 1: Excellent quality agricultural land

Grade 2: Good quality agricultural land

Grade 3a: Good to moderate quality agricultural land

Grade 3b: Moderate quality agricultural land

Grade 4: Poor quality agricultural land

Grade 5: Very poor quality agricultural land

Planning policy defines grades 1 to 3a as the 'best and most versatile' agricultural land. This is about 10 to 15% of the land in Wales. Planning applications and local development plans should include survey evidence when they cover grade 1, 2 or 3a land.

The land subject of this development was shown on the Welsh Government Agricultural Land predictive map as being of 3a quality, but this can only be accurately determined by a detailed field survey.

An Agricultural Land Classification (ALC) survey was prepared by consultants for the applicant's agents and sent to the Welsh Government for review who have assessed the report and agreed that the surveyed land can be re-classed as subgrade 3b, which then falls outside of the land which must be preserved according to Technical Advice Note 6 (Planning for sustainable rural communities) Annexe B6 and Planning Policy Wales 11.

There is therefore not a PPW11 or TAN6 reason for refusing the siting of the manège, but detailed landscape impacts should still be considered.

Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park:

Policy 08 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan 2 (LDP2) is a strategy policy which refers to the special qualities of the National Park and lists priorities to ensure that these qualities will be protected and enhanced.

Policy 14 of the LDP2 seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria (a) and (b) resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion and/or, that would be introducing or intensifying a use which is incompatible with its location. Criteria (c) and (d) resists development that would fail to harmonise with or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park and/or fails to incorporate important traditional features.

Policy 29 of LDP2 requires all development proposals to be well designed in terms of place and local distinctiveness (criterion (a)).

The site lies within the Pen Afr to Pen y Bal Seascape Character Area (SCA 3) and the Cemaes Head Landscape Character Area (LCA 25) as described within the adopted Landscape Character Supplementary Planning Guidance document (June 2011/September 2020).

The LCA is described as having 'dramatic sea cliffs form[ing] the northern boundary of this large tract of rolling farmland at the northern extremity of the National Park. A gently rolling predominantly farmland landscape with fields enclosed by hedgebanks that, together with the scattered farmsteads, small woodland blocks and quarries contribute to the overall mosaic pattern'.

The management guidance for the Landscape Classification is to: maintain the local vernacular of stone buildings to conserve the scale and rural character of villages, hamlets and farmsteads.

The site has undoubtedly seen significant changes since the original smallholding/dwelling was building in the 1800's. The large agricultural buildings to the west of the dwelling are of a significant scale, dominating the siting of the house, and the removal of the very long building on the western end is undoubtedly a landscape improvement.

The double-gabled stabling/storage building to the western side of the development site is undoubtedly an improvement to the scale and impact on the landscape in terms of the current impact, and this will be further screened by the addition of a traditional Pembrokeshire hedgebank to the west and north of the proposed horseriding area/manège. Conditions to prevent external lighting of the development site (which will include this area) have been suggested to ensure that there is no additional light pollution caused, and a condition restricting this area to domestic use only has also been suggested.

The rear extensions to the house do not exceed the current ridge height in line with current design guidance, nor extend the frontage of the cottage.

A previously consented scheme adjoining the eastern side of the front elevation was approved in October 2018 which allowed a fully glazed eastern elevation set back from the frontage and this is shown on the original block plans for the application.

A set of patio doors will be visible in the streetscene on approaching from the east, but this is not a significant area compared to the size of the elevation, and further landscaping to the eastern boundary could help to soften this impact.

Aluminium bifold doors are proposed, with matching natural slate to the roof.

Subject to the conditions identified as necessary above, the detailed design elements are now considered acceptable and to comply with Policies 08,14 and 29 of LDP2.

<u>Landscaping & Biodiversity:</u>

To comply with Planning Policy Wales 11 (2021) and the *Environment (Wales) Act* 2016 planning authorities are expected to ensure every development positively contributes to biodiversity. The Tree and Landscape Officer was consulted with the original proposals and responded to state that further information was required. His comments read:

'Drawing 13a shows retained trees and hedges, along with some trees proposed for removal; however, information has not been provided as to their protection during the development. Retained trees, hedgebanks and hedges on and immediately adjacent to the proposed development site are at risk of:

Physical damage above ground through contact with plant machinery Chemical damage to root zones through use of concrete and other contaminants in proximity to trees.

Mechanical damage below ground through compaction of root zone by machinery and equipment, as well as risk of root damage during any excavations.

Drawing 13a also shows proposed planting to delineate the sand school, along with internal fencing boundaries which is also acceptable and meets the S6 duty (*Environment (Wales) Act 2016*); however, the site-specific details of the proposed landscaping will be required prior to commencement. Due to the nature of the site, it is considered that these matters can be conditioned (pre-commencement). Accordingly, a condition requiring further detail has been suggested.

The PCNPA Ecologist was consulted on the application but noted that the scoping report submitted only covered the buildings proposed for demolition, and not the dwelling, so an updated scoping report has been requested. Biodiversity enhancement in the form of a bat box and the additional Pembrokeshire hedgebank were welcomed.

The additional scoping survey has taken place and is expected to be submitted before the date of the Committee meeting, and a verbal update will be supplied.

The application is therefore considered to comply with the Local Development Plan, Planning Policy Wales and the *Environment (Wales) Act 2016*.

Well-being

This report takes account of the duty placed on Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority as a public body, by the *Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015* to carry out sustainable development. The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under Section 3 of the *Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015* has been considered. This report is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives set out in the Act.

Conclusion:

It is considered that the proposed extensions to both cottage and curtilage are not overwhelming in mass or extent and will not have an adverse impact on the existing character of the main house.

The proposal would meet the relevant policy requirements of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan 2, Future Wales and national planning policy as set out in Planning Policy Wales 11, and TAN 6.

Recommendation:

APPROVE, subject to the following conditions:

1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.

Reason: Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).

- 2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:
 - Proposed Block & Location Plan Drawing Number 16A
 - Proposed Floor Plans Drawing number 17 rec'd 10/11/2023
 - Proposed Elevations Drawing Number 18 rec'd 10/11/2023
 - Proposed stable / floor plans / elevations / section 10A

Reason: In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 – Policies: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 08 (Special Qualities), 14 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

 Prior to the erection of any external lighting on the approved site a light mitigation strategy, including measures to reduce light spillage onto foraging habitats for bats shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that animal and plant species and habitats listed under the *Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010* are adequately protected, and to protect and enhance the character and appearance of the site and its setting within the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 – Policies: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 08 (Special Qualities), 12 (Local Areas of Nature Conservation or Sites of Geological Interest) and 14 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National

Park).

- 4. No development shall commence until details of existing ground levels and proposed finished ground and floor levels have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
 - **Reason:** In order to be clear on the levels of the development approved to provide for a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 Policies: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 08 (Special Qualities), 14 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 29 (Sustainable Design) and 30 (Amenity).
- 5. The materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the extension shall match those used in the existing building.
 Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan 2 Policies 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty) and 14 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park).
- 6. Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of the *Town and Country Planning* (*General Permitted Development*) *Order 1995*, (relating to extensions to, and changes to the external appearance of, the dwelling and to development or the siting of a caravan within the curtilage of the dwellinghouse), no development of Parts 1, 2 and 5 of Schedule 2 to that Order (or any Order revoking or reenacting that Order) shall be carried out without specific planning permission being obtained.

Reason: To preserve the character of the area. Local Development Plan – Policies: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 08 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 30 (Amenity).

- 7. No development, demolition or site clearance shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority a scheme relating to the immediate landscape. The approved scheme shall include the following details:
 - Clarification of planting / landscaping proposals
 - Scale plan on proposed site layout showing precise site-specific locations
 - Schedules of plants (trees and hedges)
 - Plant species
 - Plant supply sizes
 - Proposed numbers of each proposed species
 - Hedge planting density and method (e.g. double staggered)
 - Implementation programme / timescale / phasing of planting
 - Management and replacement of failures details

The proposed development shall be completed in full adherence to the details submitted to, and approved by this authority. Any variations to the details of the documents and plans must only be undertaken after the proposed variations have been approved in writing by this authority.

Reason: In the interests of maintaining a suitable scheme of landscaping to protect the visual amenity of the area, to maintain the special qualities of the

landscape and habitats through the protection, creation and enhancement of links between sites and their protection for amenity, landscape and biodiversity value. Local Development Plan 2 – Policies: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 14 (Conservation and enhancement of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 30 (Amenity), SPG 02 (Landscaping), SPG 07 (Biodiversity), Technical Advice Note (TAN) 5: Nature Conservation and Planning (2009), Technical Advice Note (TAN) 10: Tree Preservation Orders (1997).

8. All retained trees and hedges shown on the landscaping plan 13a and any trees whose canopies overhang the site shall be protected in accordance with BS5837: 2012 Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction — Recommendations, the details to be previously approved in writing by the local planning authority. The protection measures shall be erected in accordance with the approved details before any equipment, machinery or materials are brought onto the site for the purposes of the development, and shall be maintained until all equipment, machinery and surplus materials have been removed from the site. Nothing shall be stored or placed within any Construction Exclusion Zone, and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered, nor shall any excavation be made, without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

Reason: To prevent detrimental impact to trees, hedges and other landscape features which contribute to the amenity, landscape & biodiversity of the site and surrounding area. Local Development Plan 2 – Policies: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 14 (Conservation and enhancement of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 30 (Amenity), SPG 02 (Landscaping),SPG 07 (Biodiversity), Technical Advice Note (TAN) 5: Nature Conservation and Planning (2009), Technical Advice Note (TAN) 10: Tree Preservation Orders (1997).

9. There shall be no associated commercial use of the manège/sand school outside of the use as ancillary to the occupation to the dwelling known as Lleine.

Reason: In order to control development in the countryside and in accordance with the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan 2: 01 (National Park Purposes and Duty), and 8 (Special Qualities)

10. Notwithstanding the submitted drawings, the agricultural buildings shall be clad in black or dark grey box profile sheeting (and not green as specified in the drawings), or if a different colour, a scheme shall be submitted for approval to the Local Planning Authority and such scheme as is agreed shall be implemented and retained thereafter.

Reason: The use of green profiled sheeting does not respect a traditional colour of materials and would look alien in this countryside location, not conforming to Policy 29 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan 2 (LDP2).

11. If evidence of contamination is found in or around the development area, development must not proceed until a report on potential contamination of the site has been prepared by an appropriately qualified person and submitted to

and approved by the local planning authority. This report shall include a phased investigation approach, incorporating risk assessment, to identify the extent of contamination and any measures required to remediate the site, including post-development monitoring. Where remediation works are required, the development shall not be occupied/used until a Validation Report, to show that the works have been satisfactorily carried out, has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure that risks from land contamination to the future users of the land and neighbouring land are minimised, together with those to controlled waters, property and ecological systems, and to ensure that the development can be carried out safely without unacceptable risks to workers, neighbours and other offsite receptors.

















