Application Ref: NP/11/419

Application Type: Full
Grid Ref: SN11563564
Applicant: Mr & Mrs Butler
Agent: Mr W Harries, Harries Design & Management
Proposal: Conversion & extension to existing cottage and outbuildings to create two-bedroomed dwelling & creation of new access.
Site Location: Penbanc Cottage, Brynberian, Crosswell, Pembrokeshire, SA41 3TQ
Case Officer: Andrew Richards

Summary

This application is before Development Management Committee for consideration as the applicant is related to a member of staff.

Penbanc is an historic, originally thatched, Pembrokeshire cottage situated adjacent to the B4329 and forming part of an informal cluster of properties between Brynberian and Crosswell. The site is perched on the side of the valley in a landscape of rectangular fields and well defined by traditional hedgebanks, nearby properties are a mixture of traditional small holdings and detached cottages either adjacent to the highway or laying just off within distinct curtilages. Whilst not a formal village this cluster is indicative of the informal settlement pattern typical to north Pembrokeshire.

The proposal involves the sensitive renovation and modest extension of this existing traditional Pembrokeshire cottage and outbuilding together with the provision of a new vehicle access. The proposal is considered to offer a good balance between the refurbishment and conservation of the cottage whilst ensuring the building is maintained to a level that provides a positive impact on the amenity and character of the area. This building will also provide an important contribution to the National Parks built heritage through the retention of this rare vernacular smallholding cottage which is of local historic importance.

The materials and finishes are considered to respect the original cottage and outbuildings with the proposed modest extension of a design and form which is considered to be traditional in nature within this area. The inclusion of renewable technology on the rear roof slope and other measures together with the use of traditional local materials will ensure the scheme meets the requirements of sustainable development as set out in the Local Development Plan.

Consultee Response

Eglwyswrw Community Council: Concerns that existing access is not accurate. Community Councillors insist that the access on drawings has never been used and request the application is brought before Development Management Committee.

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 14th December 2011
PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: No response received at the time of this report
Environment Agency Wales: No response received at the time of this report
Countryside Council for Wales: No response received at the time of this report

Public Response

The application has been appropriately advertised, and no responses have been received at the time of this report.

Policies considered

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 07 - Countryside
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 13 - Historic Landscapes Parks and Gardens
LDP Policy 14 - Protection of Buildings of Local Importance
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage
LDP Policy 33 - Renewable Energy
LDP Policy 52 - Sustainable Transport
LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic
PPW4 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
PPW4 Chapter 05 - Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast
PPW4 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
PPW4 Chapter 08 - Transport
PPW4 Chapter 09 - Housing
PPW4 Chapter 12 - Infrastructure and Services
PPW4 Chapter 13 - Minimising and Managing Environmental Risks and Pollution
SPG03 - Sustainable Design
SPG06 - Landscape Character Assessment Study, June 2009
SPG08 - Validation of Planning Applications
SPG10 - Parking
SPG14 - Renewable Energy
TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning
TAN 08 - Renewable Energy
TAN 12 - Design
TAN 15 - Development and Flood Risk
TAN 18 - Transport
Officer's Appraisal

Background
Penbanc is an historic, originally thatched, Pembrokeshire cottage situated adjacent to the B4329 and forming part of an informal cluster of properties between Brynberian and Crosswell. The site is perched on the side of the valley in a landscape of rectangular fields and well defined by traditional hedgebanks, nearby properties are a mixture of traditional small holdings and detached cottages either adjacent to the highway or laying just off within distinct curtilages. Whilst not a formal village this cluster is indicative of the informal settlement pattern typical to north Pembrokeshire.

History
The property has no planning history.

Constraints
Biodiversity as bat roost in near vicinity
Historic Landscape of Mynydd Preseli

Current Proposal
The application seeks full planning permission for the renovation and modest extension of the existing traditional Pembrokeshire cottage and outbuilding together with the provision of a new vehicle access.

Key Issues
The application raises the following planning matters:-
Policy
Siting and Sustainable Design
Character and Historical Importance
Amenity and Privacy
Access and Parking
Landscaping
Biodiversity
Land Stability
Drainage
Other Material Considerations

Policy:
In planning terms the application relates to an existing dilapidated dwelling situated in open countryside. The building is of traditional cottage design and dates back to early nineteenth century. Policy 1 stresses the importance of enhancing the natural and cultural heritage of the Park whilst Policy 7 allows for residential conversion of appropriate building in the countryside. This policy sets out the type of development that may be acceptable in countryside locations and includes the conversion of appropriate buildings to a range of uses, including residential use.

In this instance the site is located well over 1km away from any identified Centres and the applicant has advise that the nearest regular public bus service is 2.5km distance. As such the site is not considered to be realistically
accessible by means other than the private car. TAN6 allows for development to meet local needs in non-accessible locations (para 2.2.3). In accordance with the Local Development Plan, this would be affordable housing provision. If the development is not viable to convert the building to an affordable dwelling, then the lack of accessibility will need to be considered against other material considerations, such as the historic or architectural merit of preserving the building through its conversion.

The applicant has submitted details of how the need to travel can be minimised within a travel plan. Paragraph 8.7.1 of Planning Policy Wales, bullet point 4 highlights the need for planning authorities to take into account the willingness of a developer to promote travel by public transport, walking or cycling, or to provide infrastructure or measures to manage traffic to overcome transport objections to the proposed development. The applicant has demonstrated some alternatives to car travel at this location which can be considered in determining this application. Paragraph 9.13 of TAN18:

Transport advises that; ‘the weight to be attached a travel plan when determining a planning application will depend upon the extent to which it (or parts of it) can be secured through a planning condition or obligation and the extent to which it affects the acceptability of the development proposed.’

Policy 14, places weight on the retention of buildings of local importance and allows their use/conversion where the distinctive appearance, architectural integrity or their setting would not be significantly adversely affected. The Authority's conservation officer has been consulted on this element and his consideration is included in this report below.

Character and Historical Importance:
Penbanc Cottage is a rare vernacular survival of a smallholding, centred on a cottage with downslope cow-house forming a ‘longhouse’ type plan. The date is probably early C19 and subsequent alterations have been minimal – the addition of corrugated sheeting over thatch and the re-glazing of the windows. Typically, the rubble walls are limewashed, the stone laid in lime and clay mortar. The plan of kitchen with simne-fawr and small parlour is typical of the early C19: the recess beside the simne-fawr was probably associated with a stair to a half-loft.

There were many examples of such holdings in upland areas of north Pembrokeshire and Cardiganshire. The vast majority have been lost, rebuilt or altered beyond recognition. Despite some disrepair, this cottage is a very good example and satisfies Policy 14. The Authority is currently looking into the possibility of Cadw spot-listing this building and an update will be given at the committee meeting. The scheme proposed is sympathetic in character with careful thought made in balancing the refurbishment and conservation of the cottage. Your conservation officer is of the view that the cottage is clearly of ‘local importance’ and possibly worthy of listing (including with the proposed renovation). The proposed finishes are appropriate and the general form is well-preserved. Some minor amendments to the renovation would be considered necessary by the Authority's Conservation Officer which includes:
Internal partitions; Greater thought is needed to preserve the original plan of kitchen and parlour divided by a passage, even if just the retention of short 'butts' of wall indicating the former layout. More ideal would be the replication of sections of the partitions e.g. to the front half.
Parlour chimney; It would be good to see this reinstated – it was clearly lopped off when the corrugated roof was added
That as much original masonry be retained as possible through the use of underpinning/stitching rather than rebuilding
Details required of the type of thatch proposed, reed being the traditional local type.

The proposal also includes a plan indicating the full extent of areas that require re-building to match the original construction method which has been carefully considered by the conservation officer and are appropriate to ensure the retention of this important building and its use without adversely affecting its visual appearance or its setting.

Siting and Sustainable Design:
The proposed scheme is considered to offer a sympathetic refurbishment of this traditional Pembrokeshire cottage, with the reinstatement of many original features including the thatch roof over the main cottage. The cottage and adjoining outbuilding are currently in a poor state of repair and will be partly reconstructed to maintain the structural integrity of the buildings without major rebuilding works. A new roof structure will be provided over both structures with thatch being provided over the main cottage using the existing pitch, a new Welsh slate roof will be provided over the outbuilding with butt jointed ridge tiles to match. All existing openings within the cottage will be retained with minor re-siting and enlargement of openings within the outbuilding, the modest extension provided on the rear of the adjoining outbuilding will be provided in a lean-to form and have grey sinusoidal corrugated tin to the walls and roof.

The extension will be screened from adjoining public areas and will only be viewed from the vehicle entrance to Maes-y-Bryn over the existing traditional hedgebank. The scale of this extension is very modest and provides space for a utility and bathroom in a design and form which does not adversely impact on the historic architecture of the cottage. The new slated roof will have two flat plate solar collectors incorporated on the rear roof slope to provide an element of renewable energy, these are considered to be modest in scale and will not adversely affect the visual appearance of the property or its setting.

The detached outbuilding located within the north east corner of the site will be refurbished with re-pointed stonework, new vertical oak cladding and grey sinusoidal corrugated tin to the pitched roof which will match the existing pitch. The east gable elevation will provide access into the structure via a timber boarded door and also provides natural daylight via a new modest window. This structure will provide a garden storage area including cycle and log storage. To the outside adjacent to the east elevation an area is set aside for bin storage which is screened from the roadside by the existing hedgebank.
The applicant proposes to lime wash the existing stone walls within the site with a terracotta / ochre finish to the cottage and a white finish to the outbuildings. New cut slate cills will be provided and white washed stone heads over to the outbuilding, new timber painted windows and doors will be provided throughout with single glazing to the cottage element and double glazing to the outbuilding.

Amenity and Privacy:
The cottage is sited on this extensive plot and is well screened from several adjacent properties through mature boundary treatments and distance between the properties. The site provides adequate amenity space with secure garden areas away from the adjacent B road. The adjoining property known as Maes-y-Bryn is the closest to the site with its vehicle access running alongside the cow-house element. Where there are new windows proposed these are provided either with the orientation away from this unit or provided with obscure glazing to serve the new bathroom. To the rear of Penbanc the small garden area will also be well screened from Maes-y-Bryn by mature boundary treatments and a 1.5 metre high close boarded timber fence. As such, it is considered that there will be no adverse impact on the adjacent neighbour’s privacy or amenity.

Access and Parking:
The proposal includes a new access off the B4329 set back from the road to achieve required visibility splays and new wing sections of traditional hedgebank. The new access is considered to be acceptable and provides adequate area off the adjacent road to pull into without impacting on other road users passing. Access into the site is via a new gated entrance onto a gravel surface which is to be used for parking and turning, this area is also enclosed from the main garden area via a new section of hedgebank with a pedestrian access gate and meandering footpath and steps through the garden area to the dwelling. The existing pedestrian access adjacent to the entrance to Maes-y-Bryn will be maintained but improved with a new stone wall being provided on a rounded splay to also improve the vehicle access to the adjacent vehicle entrance.

Landscaping:
The proposed scheme incorporates the removal of several trees from within the site to facilitate the reinstatement of the boundary hedges as well as ensuring the retention of trees through their quality and visual importance. The drawings clearly indicate which trees are to be retained including the root protection areas around them which shall be protected during any works on site. In addition several trees and a small section of hedgebank will need to be removed to provide the new access and ensure the re-building work on the detached out-building. The Authority’s Tree and Landscape officer has been consulted and supports the proposal.

The proposal includes a comprehensive scheme of replanting to the front hedge row with native species including; hawthorn, hazel, dogwood, spindle and holly. A new boundary stone wall will be provided to the north east corner.
fronting the roadside with a rendered masonry wall extending further back into the site which forms the boundary wall between Penbanc and Maes-y-Bryn. This wall will allow ease of access around the property for maintenance and links into the existing traditional hedgebank at the rear of the site which also butts up to the gable of the adjoining out-building.

Biodiversity:
Protected species have been identified using the site, with possible occasional use of the building by individual bats but mainly as feeding route from the adjacent dwelling known as Brynmeurig where there is a known roost. Based on this, the report has identified bat friendly features and also an area within the new roof over the outbuilding to accommodate a bat roost which the applicant has incorporated on the proposed plans. The Authority’s ecologist and the Countryside Council for Wales have been consulted on this application but no responses have been received at the time of writing this report.

Drainage:
The surface water runoff will discharged via new cast iron guttering and down pipes into water butts and any overflows with then discharge into the surface water drain located within the site to the north east corner. The water collected within the water butts will be re-used within the garden area to reduce the use of water from mains supply. In respect of foul water discharge, this will be directed to a package treatment works sited within the site, any water runoff from this plant will then discharge into the surface water drain already identified above.

Other Material Considerations:
The applicant has submitted details required of Policy 7(d) outlining the lack of viability if affordable housing is required. Officers have carefully considered these details and conclude that based on these details the proposed scheme to renovate and extend the existing cottage is not financially viable to provide this development as affordable housing. The renovation and extension proposal is considered to offer the most appropriate long term benefit to the building given its important historical architectural value. This application was submitted before the affordable housing policy was fully implemented and the proposal is not for a conversion as such, and therefore the affordable housing policy under Policy 7(d) could not strictly be applied.

Conclusion

The proposal involves the sensitive renovation and modest extension of this existing traditional Pembrokeshire cottage and outbuilding together with the provision of a new vehicle access. The proposal is considered to offer a good balance between the refurbishment and conservation of the cottage whilst ensuring the building is maintained to a level that provides a positive impact on the amenity and character of the area. This building will also provide an important contribution to the National Parks built heritage through the retention of this rare vernacular smallholding cottage which is of local historic importance.
The materials and finishes are considered to respect the original cottage and outbuildings with the proposed modest extension of a design and form which is considered to be of a traditional nature within this area. The inclusion of renewable technology on the rear roof slope and other energy saving measures together with the use of traditional local materials will ensure the scheme provides and meets the requirements of sustainable development as set out in the Local Development Plan.

Amended drawings have now been received from the agent to address the points raised by the Authority’s conservation officer and are considered to be acceptable. As such the application is recommended for approval subject to appropriate conditions.

Recommendation

That the application be delegated to officers to issue conditional permission on receipt of satisfactory consultation responses.

Planning conditions will relate to:
Development to commence within 3 years
Development in accordance with the approved plans
To limit the extent of re-building works
Highway requirements
Stonework to match the existing
Limit external lighting
Removal of permitted development rights
Any other relevant conditions as proposed by the outstanding consultations

Additional Material

Decision Drawings
1159/01/C (dated 11/10/2011)
1159/04/D (dated 29/11/2011)
1159/05/D (dated 29/11/2011)
1159/06/A (dated 29/11/2011)
1283 (dated 11/10/2011)
Tree Survey (dated 11/10/2011)