Committee Date

23-Mar-2011

Application Type

Full

**Application Ref** 

NP/11/066 **Grid Ref**:

SN13310059

Applicant Agent

South Terrace Properties Ltd Mrs A Dallimore

Proposal

Alterations to create self-catering hotel suites with 3

commercial units

Site Location

Royal Lion Hotel, 1, High Street, Tenby, Pembrokeshire,

**SA70 7EX** 

# Summary

This application seeks consent for alterations to this listed building to provide an apartment/hotel with three commercial units on the ground floor. The application raises issues relating to Commercial Units, Infrastructure Payments the acceptability of an Apart/Hotel, the partial demolition of a listed building, design and amenity considerations and other matters.

The proposal is considered to be acceptable in terms of the uses proposed, and the demolition of the rear extension and its replacement with a new extension are not considered to adversely affect the character and setting of the listed building, and will enhance the Conservation Area. The proposal will also protect the privacy and amenity of adjacent properties.

The application is recommended for approval subject to the resolution of issues relating to the loss of an internal staircase, fenestration and dormer details and subject to the commitment to providing a road improvement under application NP/11/068 through a Section 106 agreement.

# Consultee Response

**Tenby Conservation Forum**: Concern - We are concerned about the retention of as much as possible of the historic structure of Lavalin House. In particular, we would wish to see the retention of the staircase.

We are glad to see that the staircase window and elements of the staircase itself have been retained at the Royal Lion site but are concerned with the proposal to make the entrance to the hotel suites next to this. As noted above, White Lion Street is an important thoroughfare and the inevitable periodic blockage that would be caused whilst vehicles stopped to discharge residents and their luggage is simply not acceptable. We advocate that the ground floor layout of this part of the site should be reconsidered to make the entrance from the High Street.

We wish to see more effort to retain or re-use the main Lavalin House 1850s staircase, and the first floor door and doorcase as specified by the Parks Conservation Officers internal survey.

This is not the only respect in which the ground floor proposals for the Royal Lion site are not satisfactory. They fail to reflect the integrity of the existing spaces in what is a historic building. We recommend that any permission should be subject to a redesign of this area to meet this requirement and that in points above.

**Tenby Chamber of Trade & Tourism**: Reply - Support the principle of the redevelopment of these key sites in Tenby but no comment specific to this application.

**Tenby Civic Society**: Reply - Many problems we and others identified in the previous application in 2010 have been rectified in the new designs; we welcome the real progress being made towards a workable set of proposals. We have spent many hours examining schemes on these sites over recent years and still see a few problems which can be put right to enable an approval to be given.

**PCC - Transportation & Environment**: Reply - No objection in principle subject to the road improvement proposed in NP/11/068 being carried out and on receipt of clarification with regard to pedestrian ramps and access to the bike store.

The Georgian Group: No objection

Welsh Water: Conditional Consent

**Environment Agency**: Conditional Consent

**Dyfed Archaeological Trust**: Conditional Consent

Tenby Town Council: Approve

Countryside Council for Wales: No Response Received

PCC - Head of Public Protection: No Response Received

### **Public Response**

No public response received.

### **Policies**

Local Development Plan

LDP Policy 01 - National Park purposes and duty

LDP Policy 02 - Tenby Local Service and Tourism Centre

LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities

LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity

LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

LDP Policy 20 - Scale of Growth

LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design

LDP Policy 30 - Amenity

LDP Policy 31 - Minimising Waste

LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage

LDP Policy 36 - Loss of Hotels and Guest Houses

LDP Policy 45 - Affordable housing

LDP Policy 49 - Retail in the National Park

LDP Policy 50 - Town and District Shopping Centres

LDP Policy 52 - Sustainable Transport

LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic

# **National Policy**

PPW4 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability

PPW4 Chapter 05 - Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast

PPW4 Chapter 08 - Transport

PPW4 Chapter 09 - Housing

PPW4 Chapter 10 - Planning for Retailing and Town Centres

PPW4 Chapter 12 - Infrastructure and Services

PPW4 Chapter 13 - Minimising and Managing Environmental Risks and Pollution

TAN 02 - Planning and Affordable Housing

TAN 04 - Retailing and Town Centres

TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning

TAN 12 - Design

TAN 18 - Transport

TAN 22 - Planning for Sustainable Buildings

### Officer's Appraisal

#### **Background**

Planning permission was refused last year for the change of use, refurbishment, alteration and extension of this hotel to provide 15 apartments and retail units on the ground floor. The application was refused on design grounds, the impact on the privacy and amenity of neighbouring properties, the lack of affordable housing in the scheme, the loss of the hotel use and the lack of information in respect of noise insulation and its impact on the listed building. As such it was considered that the proposal did not meet a number of adopted planning policies. (NP/10/127).

### **Current Application**

The current application seeks consent for alterations to the building to provide self catering suites with a hotel reception and three commercial units on the ground floor. Applications for listed building and conservation area consent have been made under references NP/11/067 and NP/11/070.

The application was accompanied by a design and access statement, a supporting statement in relation to the partial demolition of a listed building, an archaeological statement, a bat survey, and a transport statement.

## Officers Considerations

This application is on the agenda as it is one of a suite of applications relating to the re-development of Tenby.

The Royal Lion Hotel is a Grade II listed building and is situated in a key location on the corner of the High Street and White Lion Street and occupying an exceptionally prominent location on the frontage leading into the town centre and overlooking North Beach. The proposal would retain the existing hotel use but alter it to an "apart/hotel" which is essentially self catering suites serviced by a central reception. The application also proposes the removal of the later addition to the rear of the hotel and fronting Upper Frog Street and its replacement with a new extension. The overall development would provide 15 suites and three commercial units, two fronting Upper Frog Street and being used for A1 (retail uses) and one fronting the High Street and being used for A3 (food and drink uses).

In the context of the policies set out above, the application raises a number of key issues and these are:

- Commercial Units
- Infrastructure Payments
- Acceptability of an Apart/Hotel
- · Partial demolition of a listed building
- Design and Amenity
- Other matters (servicing, access, parking, drainage)

#### Commercial Units

This application proposes the provision of three new commercial units in this development being a mix of A1 and A3 uses. As set out in the general report, the overall provision of commercial uses throughout the redevelopment schemes is acceptable in terms of comparative floor areas and there is no objection to the provision of these units in this scheme.

Furthermore as a "stand alone" proposal these commercial units are additional to those that have existed in the past and are acceptable uses for this town centre location. As such the proposal for these commercial units would be supported.

# Infrastructure Payments

As set out in the general report, the scheme for the redevelopment of the former Gatehouse site includes improvements to the road junction at The Norton and White Lion Street and provides pavements outside the new development and alongside the Royal Lion Hotel. The provision of this infrastructure is a welcome contribution as part of the combined proposals and will resolve a long standing problem.

The road improvement to provide a pavement on the south side of White Lion Street is not included in this particular application (being proposed under NP/11/068). Therefore as a stand alone proposal this application would not secure this improvement, and which is considered to be necessary with the hotel reception and entrance accessed from White Lion Street. Therefore, should this application be considered in isolation to the other schemes, this infrastructure improvement is likely to be required as part of any permission. This has not been explored at this time as it is provided through the combined schemes under consideration.

# Acceptability of an Apart/Hotel

The current scheme proposes 15 self catering suites which are described as an apartment/hotel whereby self contained facilities are available but are managed and serviced through a central reception and office. The suites are both one and two bed units and are substantial in size. There is some concern that these suites appear as self contained flats and could be occupied as such, thus undermining the requirement under policy 36 of the LDP to control the loss of hotels and guest houses.

Case law has however held that the provision of self contained suites of this manner would fall under the same use class as a hotel and as such any loss of hotel use could not be argued. It is imperative however that the suites are controlled through planning conditions to ensure that they are only available for short term letting and are operated as a hotel use. There is therefore no objection to this proposal subject to the imposition of such conditions.

# Partial Demolition of a Listed Building

The application includes the demolition of an extension to the rear of the hotel. The demolition of small parts of listed buildings is not subject to the same stringent criteria as those for the demolition of a whole or substantial part of a listed building as set out in Circular 61/96 and referred to in the report relating to applications NP/11/068 and 069 in respect of the demolition of the cinema building. Nonetheless consideration needs to be given as to whether the demolition would adversely affect the character and setting of the listed building and in this case, whether its loss would conserve or enhance the Conservation Area.

The extension proposed for demolition is late C19 and is subservient in scale and detail to the main wing and appears to have been built in two stages, infilling part of the rear yard. It is utilitarian in character, the only notable feature being a glazed lantern which is now derelict. The interior of the wing is devoid of any features. In this particular case there is no objection to the demolition of this extension which does not have any intrinsic aesthetic, historic or architectural merit. Its loss (subject to replacement with a new, more appropriate extension or treatment of the rear of the building) would also enhance the appearance of the Conservation Area when viewed from Upper Frog Street.

# Design and Amenity

The proposal would replace the extension referred to above with a three storey extension, set back from the arched opening boundary wall, with fenestration and stuccoed elevations to match the rest of the building. The north end of Upper Frog Street is characterised by the rear elevations and former service yards for the sea-facing High Street properties and there are no formal elevations along this stretch of the street. The new wing acknowledges the informal character of its neighbours and is similarly subservient to the seaward facing terrace. The proposal is considered to be a marked improvement on the previous proposal and respects the character of the listed building and is considered to be an acceptable solution. The design also retains the arched openings at street level in the boundary wall to provide recessed shop fronts to the new commercial units.

The previous proposal also raised concerns with regard to the impact of the new extension on the privacy and amenity of adjoining residential properties. The extension has been reduced in scale and the external terrace has been removed from the proposals as an amenity space and will be used for maintenance only. No windows are proposed in the side elevation facing the principal windows of the adjacent flats and as such it is considered that the privacy and amenity of adjacent properties are protected by this scheme.

The proposals also include the rationalisation of the rather random fenestration on the White Lion Street elevation, alterations to the roof and internal alterations, including the removal of a staircase in part of the building. The Authority's Conservation Officer has some concerns with these proposals, and discussions are ongoing to address these concerns. A verbal update on these matters will be given at the meeting.

#### Other Matters

It will be noted that no objections have been received from statutory consultees with the exception of the Highways Officer who requires the road improvement referred to above to be provided as part of this development. A number of consultees also require conditions to be imposed on any permission.

In addition, in view of the constraints of both this site and Tenby generally it is imperative that the means of construction, hours of working, storage etc are agreed. The full details of this will not be known until the contract is let but it is considered that a condition should be imposed requiring these details to be approved.

#### Conclusion

In conclusion it is considered that the alterations to this hotel to provide an apartment/hotel are acceptable in principle. However, further discussion is required with regard to the loss of the internal staircase, and the detailing of fenestration and dormers. Subject to the satisfactory resolution of these matters and the commitment to carry out the road improvement under NP/11/068, it is considered that this proposal is acceptable.

#### Recommendation

That subject to the commitment to carry out the road improvement under NP/11/068, and the satisfactory resolution of the issues relating to the internal staircase and the details of the fenestration and dormer, that planning permission be granted subject to conditions relating to timing, finishes and colours, archaeology, restricting the use of the suites to hotel and occupancy times, restricting the use of the commercial units to A1 and A3 respectively, restricting window openings in the south east elevation and restricting use of the terrace as a garden/amenity area, requiring approval of a methodology of working, and any others recommended by consultees.

