Committee Date: 23-Mar-2011
Application Type: Listed Building
Application Ref: NP/11/067
Grid Ref: SN13310059
Applicant: South Terrace Properties
Agent: Mrs A Dallimore, C2J Architects
Proposal: Alterations to create self-catering hotel suites with 3 commercial units
Site Location: Royal Lion Hotel, 1, High Street, Tenby, Pembrokeshire, SA70 7EX

Summary

Listed Building Consent is sought for the partial demolition of the rear section of the Royal Lion Hotel to facilitate alterations to the building to provide self catering suites and commercial units.

The extension proposed for demolition is a later addition of little aesthetic, architectural or historic merit and there is no objection to the demolition of this part of the listed building. The proposed extensions and alterations are also not considered to adversely affect the character of the listed building or its setting in principle. However further discussion is required in relation to the loss of the internal staircase and the detailing of the windows and dormers. Subject to the satisfactory resolution of these matters it is recommended that Cadw be advised that there is no objection to listed building consent being granted.

Consultee Response

Tenby Conservation Forum: Concern - About the retention of as much as possible of the historic structure of Lavali House. In particular, we would wish to see the retention of the staircase.

The Georgian Group: Reply - The consultation information did not provide any plans of the elevations as existing so it is difficult to make comparisons between existing and what is proposed. From looking at the information provided, the proposed extension to the rear of the building generally seems to be in keeping with the existing building. Although larger in scale than the extension it is replacing, it remains subservient to the main building. It is however a pity that the proposed scheme has not worked with the existing structure at the rear of the building. Although a later addition, it is part of the buildings historic development and its scale and architectural character adds interest to Upper Frog Street.

The plans make few references to the proposed alterations to the interior aside from the notation on the ground floor plans stating that the original decorative ceiling and wall features are to be retained in No.2. The list description makes reference to this plasterwork and its retention is of course welcome. The list description also refers to the interior of No.1 being much
altered on the ground floor for hotel use. The floor plans show a number of changes to the interior but it is not clear whether any of the changes proposed involve any significant historic fabric such as plasters, timber work, doors, stairs and floors, or alterations to the historic internal plan form. While the long period of hotel use may have resulted in numerous alterations over the years, where there is surviving historic fabric, it should be conserved and used to inform replication where necessary in repair.

**Tenby Chamber of Trade & Tourism**: Reply - The Chamber consider these sites to be very important to the economic future of Tenby and following consideration by the members at the monthly meeting last week we would like to reiterate the comments submitted back in May 2010.

The business community of Tenby continues to be concerned about the economic sustainability of Tenby as a tourist destination. We consider that it is critically important to retain a mix of accommodation for our visitors, and are disappointed that the plans for the hotel remain the same and squeezed in behind the apartments.

We note that the proposed apartment block still contains a high number of small apartments rather than larger family sized units. They are likely to be purchased as second homes or holiday lets, and will be empty for much of the year thereby making little contribution to the Tenby community and economy.

Although the plans show a 162 seat cinema the economic viability of a stand alone single screen cinema is doubtful. Entertainment facilities are sorely needed in this tourist resort and this is an ideal opportunity to provide a multi-functional entertainment area that could include a cinema.

This is the perfect, once in a lifetime, opportunity to widen White Lion Street, to improve pedestrian safety on both sides of the road and to ease manoeuvring at the junction of larger delivery vehicles and ideally the small local buses.

**Dyfed Archaeological Trust**: Conditional Consent

**Tenby Town Council**: Approve

**Public Response**

No public response received.

**Policies**

Local Development Plan:
There is no statutory requirement to have regard to the provisions of the development plan in considering applications for listed building consent.
However, there should be a general presumption in favour of the preservation of listed buildings with the primary consideration being the statutory requirement to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

National Policy
PPW4 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
TAN 12 - Design
Circular 61/96 - Conservation Areas

Officer's Appraisal

Background

Listed building consent was refused last year for the change of use, refurbishment, alteration and extension of this hotel to provide 15 apartments and retail units on the ground floor. The application was refused on design grounds and the impact of the proposals on this Grade II listed building. (NP/10/128).

Current Application

The current application seeks consent for alterations to the building to provide self catering suites with a hotel reception and three commercial units on the ground floor. Applications for planning permission and conservation area consent have been made under references NP/11/066 and NP/11/070.

The application was accompanied by a design and access statement, and a supporting statement in relation to the partial demolition of a listed building.

Officers Considerations

This application is on the agenda as it is one of a suite of applications relating to the re-development of Tenby.

The Royal Lion Hotel is a Grade II listed building and is situated in a key location on the corner of the High Street and White Lion Street and occupying an exceptionally prominent location on the frontage leading into the town centre and overlooking North Beach. The proposal would retain the existing hotel use but alter it to an "apart/hotel" which is essentially self catering suites serviced by a central reception. The application also proposes the removal of the later addition to the rear of the hotel and fronting Upper Frog Street and its replacement with a new extension. The overall development would provide 15 suites and three commercial units, two fronting Upper Frog Street and being used for A1 (retail uses) and one fronting the High Street and being used for A3 (food and drink uses).

This application is for listed building consent and therefore consideration of the proposal is confined to matters relating to the partial demolition of a listed
building, and the impact of the proposals on the character and appearance of the listed building. In this instance therefore the matters for consideration are the demolition of the rear extension and the acceptability of the new extension and alterations in relation to the character and setting of the main building.

**Partial Demolition of a Listed Building**
The application includes the demolition of an extension to the rear of the hotel. The demolition of small parts of listed buildings is not subject to the same stringent criteria as those for the demolition of a whole or substantial part of a listed building as set out in Circular 61/96 and referred to in the report relating to applications NP/11/068 and 069 in respect of the demolition of the Playhouse cinema building. Nonetheless consideration needs to be given as to whether the demolition would adversely affect the character and setting of the listed building and in this case, whether its loss would conserve or enhance the Conservation Area.

The extension proposed for demolition is late C19 and is subservient in scale and detail to the main wing and appears to have been built in two stages, infilling part of the rear yard. It is utilitarian in character, the only notable feature being a glazed lantern which is now derelict. The interior of the wing is devoid of any features. In this particular case there is no objection to the demolition of this extension which does not have any intrinsic aesthetic, historic or architectural merit. Its loss (subject to replacement with a new, more appropriate extension or treatment of the rear of the building) would also enhance the appearance of the Conservation Area when viewed from Upper Frog Street.

**Design**
The proposal would replace the extension referred to above with a three storey extension, set back from the arched opening boundary wall, with fenestration and stuccoed elevations to match the rest of the building. The north end of Upper Frog Street is characterised by the rear elevations and former service yards for the sea-facing High Street properties and there are no formal elevations along this stretch of the street. The new wing acknowledges the informal character of its neighbours and is similarly subservient to the seaward facing terrace. The proposal is considered to be a marked improvement on the previous proposal and respects the character of the listed building and is considered to be an acceptable solution. The design also retains the arched openings at street level in the boundary wall to provide recessed shop fronts to the new commercial units.

The proposals also include the rationalisation of the rather random fenestration on the White Lion Street elevation, alterations to the roof and internal alterations, including the removal of a staircase in part of the building. The Authority’s Conservation Officer has some concerns with these proposals, and discussions are ongoing to address these concerns. A verbal update on these matters will be given at the meeting.
Conclusion
In conclusion it is considered that the alterations to this hotel to provide an apartment/hotel are acceptable in principle. However, further discussion is required with regard to the loss of the internal staircase, and the detailing of fenestration and dormers. Subject to the satisfactory resolution of these matters, it is considered that this proposal is acceptable.

Recommendation
That subject to the satisfactory resolution of the issues relating to the internal staircase and the details of the fenestration and dormer, that Cadw be advised that the application is considered to be acceptable subject to appropriate conditions relating to the details of the finishes, architectural detailing and colours.