Application Type: Full
Reference: 10/508
Grid Ref. SN026392
Applicant: Mr John Curtis,
Agent: Mr Pick Ian Pick Associates Ltd
Proposal: Proposed new stables and horse walker for existing racing stables
(resubmission of NP/10/289)
Site Location: Fforest Farm, Dinas, Newport

Description:
This is a full application for the erection of new stables and a horse-walker for the racing stables at Fforest Farm, Dinas. Apart from changes to the visibility splays on the site's access onto the A487(T) and the provision of additional explanatory information, the scheme is an identical proposal to that which was refused by the Committee in August last year. Although the current scheme no longer raises highways objections from the Welsh Assembly, the applicant has not revised the design of the scheme. Consequently the proposal is still considered to be detrimental to the special qualities of the National Park, and is therefore recommended for refusal.

The application has been brought before the Development Management Committee because Newport Town Council has supported the proposal, which is contrary to the officer recommendation for refusal.

Consultee Response:

NEWPORT TOWN COUNCIL: As this application appears to be very similar to application NP/10/289, we would like to reiterate our original comments.
"We strongly support this application as the location of the site appears to be ideal. This innovative diversification will create a new opportunity in the area by the provision of a substantial horse racing stables.
We hope that this development will also create long term sustainable jobs independent of the tourist industry."

We welcome local enterprise and wish to encourage local sustainable jobs.

Recommend - Approval

ENVIRONMENT AGENCY WALES: No comment received
TRANSPORTATION & TECHNICAL SERVICES: Trunk Road therefore response must come from Trunk Road Agency.
HEAD OF PUBLIC PROTECTION: No objections
TRUNK ROADS AGENCY: Conditional consent

Public Response:

The application has been advertised, and at the time of writing the report no responses had been received.

Officers Appraisal:

Policies:
LDP Policies –
Policy 1 – National Park Purposes and Duty
Policy 7 – Countryside
Policy 8 – Special Qualities
Policy 9 – Light Pollution
Policy 11 – Protection of Biodiversity
Policy 13 – Historic Landscapes, Parks and Gardens
Policy 15 – Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
Policy 29 – Sustainable Design
Policy 30 – Amenity
Policy 31 – Minimising Waste
Policy 32 – Surface Water Drainage
Policy 42 – Employment Sites and Live / Work Units
Policy 52 – Sustainable Design
Policy 53 – Impacts of Traffic

PPW 3 Chapters -
Chapter 4 – Planning for Sustainability
Chapter 5 – Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast
Chapter 6 – Conserving the Historic Environment
Chapter 7 – Supporting the Economy
Chapter 8 – Transport
Chapter 12 – Infrastructure and Services
Chapter 13 – Minimising and Managing Environmental Risks and Pollution

Technical Advice Notes -
TAN 5 - Nature Conservation and Planning
TAN 6 - Planning for Sustainable Rural Communities
TAN 12 - Design
TAN 18 - Transport
TAN 22 - Planning for Sustainable Buildings

Supplementary Planning Guidance –
Sustainable Design; and
Landscape Character Assessment.

Officers Appraisal:

Background & Description
This is a full application for the erection of new stables and a horse-walker, and alterations to the existing access, at Fforest Farm, Dinas. The farm lies to the north of the A487 (T) road and is currently a mixed use of dairy farming and horse racing, the latter of which has been occurring since March 2003. The farm buildings and existing stables lie approximately 500 metres down-hill from the A487 (T), on the valley side of the Cwm Forest. The existing agricultural buildings, including stabling for eleven horses lies to the south of an existing sand ménage. The farm is accessed down a single carriageway track, to the east of which runs part of the gallops. The track is also a public right of way. The Pembrokeshire Coast National Footpath runs along the coastline, approximately 100m away to the south of the farm.

Current proposal
An identical application for stables and horse walker was refused by the Development Management Committee in August last year. The application was refused because it provided insufficient information to fully consider the application; because the proposed stables would be detrimental to the special qualities of the National Park; and because it would cause highways safety issues on the Trunk road.

The current application differs from this refused scheme in that additional information has been provided explaining the nature of the business, and that the visibility splays to the existing access will be improved. During the processing of the application the ridge heights of the stables was reduced from 5.0m to 4.4m. The application proposes a stable block to the north of the existing stables measuring approximately 24.2m x 30.9m x 4.4m. The floor level of the building would be set at 53.5m AOD. It would provide stabling for 28 horses plus four feed and bedding bays, arranged along two aisles. The land is to be levelled to allow the siting of the stables and the horse
DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE  Agenda No: 2

walker, with embankments to the east and south. The stables would be constructed of pre-cast concrete paneling with dark grey box sheeting above, with fibre cement anthracite coloured sheeting to the roof. A line of trees would be planted along the southern elevation of the stables.

The horse walker would be located to the north of the proposed stables, adjacent to the hedgebank, and would measure approximately 12m in diameter, by 3.6m high. It would be constructed of timber panelled boarding to the walls, with profile sheet roofing.

A new access to the yard that lies between the stables and horse walker would be created in the hedgebank lying to the east of the site. The existing field access in the north-east corner would be blocked up with stone and earth hedging.

The application has been supported with the following information:-
- A Design and Access Statement;
- A Transport Statement; and
- An Arboricultural Implication Study.

Key Issues
This application raises the following planning matters:-
- Planning history;
- Impact on the National Park;
- Highways, parking and servicing matters;
- Employment matters;
- Impact on the water environment, including drainage and pollution prevention measures;
- Landscaping matters;
- Historic Landscape matters;
- Amenity matters; and
- Sustainability.

Apart from minor alterations to the height of the building, the current application proposes the same scheme as was refused by the Development Management Committee in August last year. However in order to address the Welsh Assembly’s objection the access visibility splay to the farm are proposed for alteration. The design of the stables has not been altered. In considering the current application, the material considerations that need to be addressed are whether the previous reasons for refusal have been overcome.

Impact on the National Park. One of the reasons for refusal on the previous application was that the large barn and horse walker were considered to be detrimental to the special qualities of the National Park. Its location, size, design and disparate siting from the other farm buildings on site was considered to result in a large and intrusive building in the open countryside that was unsympathetic to the special qualities of the National Park. The resubmitted application has made no change to either the design or location of the horse walker or the stables building, although with this application it has been explained that there are already 40 horses in training at the farm, and that in addition to the trainer, the racing stables employs an assistant trainer, five full-time stable hands and three part-time workers. The proposed 28 stables provided in the American barn would be in addition to the eleven stables already on site. In addition to the National Park’s statutory requirements to conserve and enhance natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage, and promote opportunities for the enjoyment and understanding of the special qualities of those areas by the public, there is also a duty to foster the economic and social well-being of the local community. The National Park Authority is sympathetic to applications seeking to achieve the latter duties, but this has to be acceptable under the overarching mantle of conservation interests. Although the applicant has provided more information about the operation of the stables, and as before has sought to reduce the stables’ visual impact in the landscape by lowering it down into the slope reducing the ridge height by 600mm and providing planting screening, both this building and the horse walker are considered to have a significant visual intrusion into the landscape, including from a number of public viewpoints. The detrimental impact of the proposal on the landscape is enhanced by its disparate relationship to the existing farm buildings on the site. The combined effect of the existing and proposed development is spread over a wide area, rather than being
concentrated in a single location. Although the employment benefits of the proposal cannot be
ignored and are supported, this benefit does not over-ride the harm of the buildings on the special
qualities of the National Park. The proposal has not addressed the reasons for refusal cited on the
earlier application, and therefore it must once again be recommended for refusal.

Highways Matters. The application again seeks the use of the existing farm access onto the A487
Trunk Road, although with this application the visibility splays to the access have been proposed for
improvement. The Welsh Assembly has not raised an objection to the scheme this time,
considering that the use does not intensify the use of the site and that the proposal is for an
upgrade of facilities for the existing horses, with no associated rise in employment levels. As a
result they raise no objections subject to conditions being attached concerning the provision of the
improved visibility splays and surfacing works.

Employment Matters. One of the National Park’s duties is to foster the economic and social well-
being of their communities. The application has provided a number of differing figures for the
numbers employed by the racing stables. The figures vary from 5 full time and 3 part time, to 10 full
time and 3 part time. Notwithstanding the inconsistency of the information provided, in such cases
the conservation and protection of the landscape takes precedence over employment opportunities,
and due to the detrimental impact of the building on the National Park, it is again recommended for
refusal.

The Water Environment. Both the Environment Agency and the Public Protection Team at the
County Council have been consulted on the application. Stables and the associated waste from
them can have a serious impact on the water quality of an area, causing pollution problems if not
carefully managed. The Public Protection Team have raised no objection to the proposal. The
Agency requires SUDs for surface water run-off, and they raise no objection to the proposal subject
to conditions concerning surface water disposal, the storage and management of manure and
slurry, the storage and oils, fuels, and chemicals, and infortatives concerning the management of
clinical waste and culverting watercourses.

Landscaping. The application has sought to minimise its impact in the landscape through a number
of measures, including being set down into the landscape, proposed tree planting and the
reinstatement of a hedgebank that is currently an access. An arboricultural report has been
submitted with the application and proposes measures to protect the existing trees on site. This has
raised a few issues that need addressing, such as the clarification of tree and hedgebank protection
measures, and a requirement for a mix of native species tree planting rather than just ash. These
matters could be dealt with by condition.

Historic Landscape. The farm and proposed stables lie within the Historic Landscape of Newport
and Carningli. The impact of development on Historic Landscapes is a material consideration in the
processing of planning applications. As with the concerns about the impact of the proposal on the
National Park’s character and appearance, the size, location, design and cumulative impact with the
existing development of the proposed stables is considered to harm the Historic Landscape, and
this also forms a reason for refusal.

Amenity. The remote location of the proposal means that in terms of potential nuisance it has no
impact on neighbouring residents. In terms of wider visual amenity, the comments in the sections
above are pertinent.

Sustainability. Both national and local policy promote sustainable development. Policy 29 of the
Local Development Plan sets out criteria for sustainable design, amongst other things. The
Development Plans Section have been consulted as to the sustainability of the proposal and have
formed a view that many of the usual requirements for sustainable buildings would not be
appropriate for stables. They approve of the use of low energy lighting, and require the use of
sustainable materials and rainwater disposal. It is felt that these matters could be dealt with by
condition.

Conclusion

10/508

Page: 12

26 January 2011
This is an identical proposal to that previously refused by the Authority in August of last year. Although the highways reason for refusal has now been overcome, those concerning the impact of the proposal on the National Park have not. As a result the application is once again recommended for refusal because of its detrimental impact on the National Park and Historic Landscape.

Recommendation:
Refuse.

Reasons
1. Policy 1 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan requires development within the National Park to be compatible with the conservation or enhancement of the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage, and public understanding and enjoyment of those qualities. Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seeks to protect the special qualities of the National Park. Policy 13 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seeks the protection of Historic Landscapes, Policy 15 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that development that adversely affects the qualities and special character of the National Park will not be permitted. Policy 29 requires all development to demonstrate an integrated approach to design and construction and be well designed. Policy 30 states that development will not be permitted where it has an unacceptable impact on amenity. The proposal by reason of its location, siting, form, scale, bulk, height, materials, detailing, and contextual relationship with the existing landscape and farm buildings, is considered to be unsympathetically sited within the landscape and of a size and form that fails to harmonise with or enhance the character of the National Park and the Historic Landscape. The proposal is therefore considered contrary to these policies and detrimental to the special qualities of the National Park and the Historic Landscape.

Other Material

Detailed Plans
• FS/01 (received 23 November 2010);
• FS/02 (received 17 November 2010);
• FS/03 (received 17 November 2010);
• FS/04 (received 17 November 2010);
• FS/05 (received 17 November 2010);
• FS/06 (received 17 November 2010);
• FS/07 (received 17 November 2010);
• IP/NB/01 Elevations (received 11th January, 2011)
• IP/NB/01 Sections (received 11th January, 2011)
• FS/08 (received 17 November 2010);
• IP/LN/C2 (received 22 November 2010);
• 001-0250-A (received 17 November 2010);
• 002-0250-A (received 17 November 2010);
• 003-0250-A (received 17 November 2010);
• TR-01 – Tree Constraints Plan (received 17 November 2010); and
• TR-01 – Tree Protection Plan (received 17 November 2010).