Application Ref: NP/12/0302

Application Type: Full
Grid Ref: SS09569904
Applicant: Mr D Mitchell
Agent: Mr Alan Jones, Harold Metcalfe Partnership
Proposal: Alterations and extension to extend existing flat roof over garage with new terrace above and new single storey extension at first floor level on rear elevation to replace existing conservatory.
Site Location: Whitewell House, Whitewell Holiday Park, Lydstep, Tenby, Pembrokeshire, SA70 7RY
Case Officer: Emma Langmaid

Summary

The application is reported to committee because the officer recommendation is contrary to the views of the Penally Community Council.

Planning permission is sought for a single storey rear extension and for some external alterations to the eastern elevation and existing single storey garage at Whitewell Cottage, Lydstep – the cottage is the owner’s accommodation at Whitewell Holiday Park. Whitewell Cottage is a traditional stone built Pembrokeshire cottage, which has been altered over the years. The proposed single storey rear extension replaces an existing conservatory, which is in a poor state of repair and therefore its replacement with the extension in matching materials is considered acceptable. The other external alterations include the insertion of rooflights and the insertion of two pairs of double doors in the eastern elevation to allow access to the roof of the garage, including a small enclosure fence on the roof of the garage and two small steps to allow access to the garden (largely at the same level due to onsite topography). The proposed insertion of the doors in the end elevation and associated works to use the roof as a terrace is considered to have a detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the property and therefore, on balance, the application is considered to be unacceptable and is recommended for refusal.

Consultee Response

Penally Community Council: No objection
Ecologist - Pembrokeshire County Council: Reply - No further action required however the applicant must be aware that bats may still be found in roof spaces and if evidence is found work must stop.

Public Response

A site notice has been erected and no responses have been received at the time of this report.
Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website -
http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
PPW4 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
SPG05 - Sustainable Design
TAN 12 - Design

Officer’s Appraisal

Background

Whitewell Cottage is part of what is now Whitewell Caravan Park located to the north-east of Lydstep along the A4139. The fields to the south, between the house and the main coast road are used for camping whilst to the north there is an established static caravan complex. Buildings to the west support this complex with a cottage, offices and ancillary facilities. The surrounding area is rural with a mix of land uses, but in the main farming and holiday complexes at Lydstep Haven and Celtic Haven.

History

02/111 – garage – approved 10th May 2002

Constraints

- Special Area of Conservation within 500m
- LDP Mineral Safeguard
- Biodiversity issue
- Ancient Monument – within 50m
- Potential for surface water flooding

Current Proposal

The application proposes a single storey extension to the rear of the property and the insertion of doors in the eastern elevation plus associated works to enclose the roof of an existing garage to use it as a roof terrace.
Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:-

- Visual Amenity;
- Amenity and Privacy and
- Other considerations.

Visual Amenity:

Policy 15 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria 'a' and 'b' resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion and/or, that would be insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape. Policy 30 of the LDP seeks to avoid development that is of an incompatible scale with its surroundings (criterion 'b') or is visually intrusive (criterion'd').

The application site is a traditional Pembrokeshire farmhouse; with stone and painted rendered walls, slate roof and a mixture of upvc and timber framed windows and doors. The cottage sits within a complex of buildings, now associated with the use as a holiday park. Glimpse views of the cottage are available from the main coast road, although the cottage is set well back from the road by a large field (used in the summer months for camping) and is partly screened by boundary vegetation.

The proposed single storey rear extension will replace an existing conservatory which is in a poor state of repair and totally out of keeping with the traditional cottage. The extension will be built with materials to match existing and has been designed in such a way that the character of the cottage is preserved and it is therefore considered acceptable.

However, the proposed insertion of doors to the side elevation enabling access to the roof of the garage, which would be used as a roof terrace, in combination with the small railings which will enclose the roof space is considered to be detrimental to the character and appearance of the cottage and therefore overall visual amenity.

Amenity and Privacy:

Policy 30 of the LDP refers to ‘amenity’ in general seeking to avoid incompatible development and significant adverse impact upon the amenity enjoyed by neighbouring properties particularly where the development is an inappropriate use, is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings, development leads to an increase in traffic, noise, odour or light or the development is visually intrusive.

The proposed single storey extension is to the rear of the property and replaces an existing conservatory. The use of the roof of the garage as a terrace, allowing the occupiers to sit outside away from on looking residents of
the caravan park could be a cause for concern. However the cottage is a part of a complex of buildings and these are all in association with the use of the whole site as a caravan park meaning that the actual cottage is relatively isolated from other permanently occupied residential dwellings. The extension and alterations are therefore considered acceptable with regard to amenity and privacy.

Other considerations:

PCNPA Tree and Landscape Officer commented that insufficient information has been provided and has indicated that there is a TPO nearby. The plan provided showing the group TPO show it to be some distance from the cottage and during the site visit no significant trees were identified. However, the existing boundaries are made of up of a mix of vegetation and it is therefore considered appropriate that a condition could be attached to require submission of a landscaping scheme, including the protection of trees in accordance with BS:5837, and as such this would not be a reason for refusal.

Conclusion

Whilst the proposed single storey rear extension is considered to be acceptable, the proposed insertion of doors and associated works to utilise the roof of the garage as an enclosed outdoor area are considered to have a detrimental impact of the character and appearance of the cottage and as such the proposal is recommended for refusal.

Recommendation

Refuse

Conditions/Informatives/Reasons

The proposed insertion of double doors in the eastern elevation and the proposed railings to the roof of the existing garage by reason of their siting and design are considered to be detrimental to the character and appearance of Whitewell Cottage and the immediate vicinity. As such the proposal is contrary to Policy 15 (criteria 'a' and 'b') and Policy 30 (criteria 'b' and 'd') of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan.