Application Ref: NP/13/0265

Application Type: Full  
Grid Ref: SM85870364  
Applicant: Mr George Geear  
Agent:  
Proposal: Replacement of rotten, single glazed, sliding sash windows with UPVC double glazed sliding sash windows. Exterior of new windows to be coloured light grey  
Site Location: Custodians Dwelling, Chapel Bay Fort, Angle, Pembroke, Pembrokeshire, SA71 5BE  
Case Officer: Rob Scourfield

Summary

Planning permission is sought to replace the existing timber sliding sash windows at the Custodian's House with UPVC double glazed sliding sash windows, their external face to be coloured grey. Planning permission is required as the permitted development rights were removed from the property as a result of an appeal decision (ref. T/APP/L9503/A/99/513237, paragraph 18), dated 14th October 1999.

The proposed scheme is considered to be acceptable, having regard to the relevant policies set out in the LDP and Planning Policy Wales (2012) and all other material considerations. The application is therefore recommended for approval, subject to conditions.

The application is reported to the Development Management Committee because the views of the Community Council are contrary to the recommendation of your officers.

Consultee Response

CADW - Welsh Historic Monuments: No objection - The replacement windows have been chosen to be as close to the original design, scale and colouring as possible and this will minimize any negative impacts on the monument's setting.

Angle Community Council: Objecting - The proposed materials were considered inappropriate for the building and the location

Public Response

The application has been appropriately advertised, and no responses have been received at the time of this report.
Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
PPW5 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment

Officer's Appraisal

Background & Description

Chapel Bay Fort is situated within the Conservation Area to the north-west of Angle, reached via a private road. The fort, begun in 1890, is a scheduled ancient monument and a Grade II listed building, the last designation including ancillary structures to the east of the main moated fort. The building is listed as a 'complete C19 fort including important early buildings constructed in mass concrete' and is being restored as a military museum and visitor attraction.

The custodian’s dwelling is a modern dwelling, constructed after 1999 within the scheduled fort itself (the footprint of the house itself is not included within the scheduled area). The house occupies the site of the former officer's mess and is designed in the style of the surviving structures on site, but is not a replica of any of the buildings shown on the original plans for the fort.

There are no other dwellings within proximity.

Relevant Planning History

NP/07/397 - conservation and restoration of fort, change of use to allow access to scheduled ancient monument as museum. Planning permission approved 25/10/2007

NP/98/439 - dwelling for keeper/custodian. Refused 21/12/1998; allowed on appeal 14/10/1999


Current Proposal

The proposal is to replace all of the existing (defective) timber sliding sash windows in upvc (grey-coloured) to a similar small-paned pattern.
Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:-

- Visual amenity
- Setting of the Scheduled Ancient Monument and Listed Building
- Other Material Considerations

Visual Amenity

Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) refers to the special qualities of the National Park and list priorities to ensure that these qualities will be protected and enhanced. Policy 15 of the LDP seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria 'a', 'd' and 'e' resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion, that would fail to harmonize with/enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park, and would lose/fail to incorporate important traditional features.

The custodian's house is a modern structure, its features reflecting the military style of the surrounding fort structures. The house does not incorporate any historic fabric and as such the proposed replacement of the windows has a neutral effect in the context of criterion 'e' of Policy 15. In the context of criteria 'a' and 'd', being situated within the fort compound, there are only limited views of the custodian's house from the public right of way to the south of the fort with even less being visible from the access road and surrounding area. More distant views of the roofline exist from the south-eastern approach to the village. The proposal would not therefore have a negative impact on the landform and landscape character of the National Park, neither does it conflict with the priorities listed in Policy 8. Additionally, the proposal does not affect the character of the Conservation Area or its setting.

Setting of the Scheduled Ancient Monument and Listed Building

As the legislation relating to ancient monuments takes precedence over that for listed buildings, the part of the fort only covered by listing is the area to the east, which lies well away from the custodian's house, neither being visible from one another.

In terms of the more immediate setting of the Scheduled Ancient Monument, Cadw's advice takes priority. Cadw advises that the proposal would give rise to no direct physical impacts as the house itself not being part of the Scheduled Ancient Monument. It further advises that the impact on the setting of the Scheduled Ancient Monument is likely to be minimal, the proposed windows matching the originals as close as possible in terms of design, scale and colouring.
Other Material Considerations

Legislation and guidance pertaining to the historic environment does not preclude the use of modern materials such as upvc where they are not considered to have a negative impact. The proposed upvc windows are of sliding sash design, similar in style to those existing and are double-glazed in an exposed area. The proposed windows will not be prominently visible from a public viewpoint, the host dwelling itself is of modern construction and the proposal is considered to be acceptable by Cadw in the context of the Scheduled Ancient Monument and its setting. As such, the proposal is considered to be acceptable.

Conclusion

The proposed scheme is considered to be acceptable in terms of visual amenity, the setting of the scheduled ancient monument/listed building and all other matters. As such, the proposal complies with the relevant national and local policies and is recommended for approval subject to conditions.

Recommendation

That the application be approved subject to conditions relating to time and compliance with plans.
N.B. SAMPLE ABOVE HAS "HORNS" WHILST WINDOWS IN CUSTODIAN'S DWELLING WILL NOT.