Application Ref: NP/13/0091

Application Type: Full
Grid Ref: 
Applicant: Ms Lynette Rees
Agent: Mr David Scott, Heritage Designs
Proposal: The erection of a one & a half storey dwelling, associated access, parking and turning area.
Site Location: Land between Morwynt and Llyndale, Parrog Road, Newport, Pembrokeshire, SA42 0RG
Case Officer: Julia Evans

Summary

This is a full application for the erection of a one-and-a-half storey dwelling, associated access, parking and turning area, at land between Morwynt and Llyndale, Parrog Road, Newport. The proposal has been carefully considered against all material considerations and the relevant national and local development plan policies. On balance it is recommended for refusal for the following four reasons: its harmful impact on the special qualities of the National Park and Newport Conservation Area; insufficient tree and landscaping details; highways safety matters; and unacceptable amenity arrangements. The proposal is considered contrary to national and local policy and is therefore recommended for refusal.

The application is referred to the Development Management Committee because Newport Town Council has supported the scheme.

Consultee Response

PCC - Transportation & Environment: Objecting
PCNPA Buildings Conservation Officer: Objecting
PCNPA Tree & Landscape Officer: There are no Tree Preservation Orders on or immediately adjacent to the proposed development. The site is within the Conservation Area. Further information is required to enable a response to be made.
PCNPA Access Officer: No objection
Newport Town Council: No objection
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional Consent
Dyfed Archaeological Trust: Conditional Consent
Environment Agency Wales (NRW): Conditional Consent
Ecologist - Pembrokeshire County Council: No adverse comment
Public Response

The application has been advertised and neighbour notifications undertaken. Three responses have been received, making the following comments:-

- The proposed dwelling will intrude into the views of the Parrog;
- The dwelling will be approximately a metre above the road level and will therefore be visually intrusive;
- On street parking is already a major issue in the area, particularly during holiday periods. The parking area proposed is small and may be difficult to use which will increase on street parking;
- A stable block has been permitted in the garden of the property to the rear of the proposal. It would directly face the proposed dwelling, with approximately 2 – 3 metres between the two buildings;
- Overprovision of car parking space on the site;
- Hyfrydle has been sold off separately from its garden and is now used as a second home;
- The dwelling is considered to be in keeping with the area, although removal of permitted development rights for extending the building should occur so as ensure that its scale does not exceed that of neighbouring properties;
- Construction management conditions are required to protect neighbouring amenity; and
- Construction management measures are needed to protect the existing landscaping on site, plus a full ecological survey is required.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

Circular 61/96 - Conservation Areas
LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 03 - Newport Local Centre
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 13 - Historic Landscapes Parks and Gardens
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 31 - Minimising Waste
LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage
LDP Policy 44 - Housing
LDP Policy 45 – Affordable housing
LDP Policy 52 - Sustainable Transport
LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic
PPW5 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
PPW5 Chapter 05 - Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast
PPW5 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
PPW5 Chapter 08 - Transport
PPW5 Chapter 09 - Housing
PPW5 Chapter 12 - Infrastructure and Services
PPW5 Chapter 13 - Minimising and Managing Environmental Risks and Pollution
SPG04 - Planning Obligations
SPG05 - Sustainable Design
SPG06 - Landscape
SPG08 - Affordable Housing
SPG12 - Parking
SPG13 - Archaeology
SPG17 - Conservation Area Proposals
TAN 02 - Planning and Affordable Housing
TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning
TAN 12 - Design
TAN 18 - Transport
TAN 22 - Planning for Sustainable Buildings

**Officer's Appraisal**

**Background**

This is a full application for the erection of a one-and-a-half storey dwelling, at land between Morwynt and Llyndale, Parrog Road, Newport. The site was originally garden to a residential property to the north, Hyfrydle, which has subsequently been sold off separately. The garden measures approximately 252 metres square, and lies to the western side of the highway, elevated above it by approximately a metre. It is bounded on all sides by hedges and hedge banks. Residential properties and their gardens bound the site to the north, south and west, whilst across the road to the east are several pairs of semi-detached houses. Those properties to the west of the road are Victorian semi-detached dwellings on narrow plots with large side gardens.

**Constraints**

The site lies within the town centre and it's Conservation Area. It is also within a Historic Landscape.
Relevant Planning History

The previous applications relating to the site are:-

Current Proposal

The current application seeks full planning permission for a detached one-and-a-half storey dwelling, with new vehicular access and turning space. The property would be orientated with its ridge aligned in an approximate north-south orientation. The proposed dwelling would measure approximately 9.0m x 10.9m x 6.4m at its maximum extent, have solar panels to its rear roof elevation. There is a stone porch proposed to the front elevation, with the main house being smooth painted render under a natural slate roof. Two pitched roofed dormers would be located in the front roof. The property would have a finished floor level of 2.8m AOD. Foul sewage would be disposed of by mains sewer, whilst surface water would be disposed of through a sustainable drainage system.

A new access would be provided to the south-eastern corner of the garden, leading onto the proposed turning head. A cycle shed is proposed to the south-western corner of the site, although the application has not been supported with any elevational details of it. The applicant proposes the retention of the existing hedgerows that bound the site.

The application has been supported with the following information:-
- A Design and Access Statement;
- A Code for Sustainable Homes Pre-Assessment Report, stating that the proposed dwellings would reach a Code 3 Level;
- An arboricultural report.

Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:-
- Principle of the development;
- Impact on the special qualities of the National Park, setting of the Conservation Area, and landscaping;
- Impact on the Historic Landscape Area;
- Affordable housing matters;
- Sustainable design;
- Highways matters;
- The water environment and drainage matters;
- Protected species and habitat matters; and
- Privacy and amenity matters.
**Principle of the Development and Planning History:**

The site lies within the centre boundary for Newport, whereby the principle of new residential development is acceptable, subject to it satisfying the other policy requirements of the Local Development Plan. The applicant undertook pre-application discussions concerning the development of the site for a single dwelling, and was advised that this would not be appropriate due to the harm it would result in to the special qualities of the National Park and the Conservation Area. Notwithstanding this advice, the applicant has submitted the application that is before the Committee today.

**Impact on the Special Qualities of the National Park, the Conservation Area, and Landscaping Matters:**

Policies 3, 8, 13, 15, 29, and 30, in particular, in the adopted Local Development Plan seek to protect the special qualities of the National Park, including the pattern, diversity, and character of the landscape and villages, nature conservation habitats, and the historic environment, including the character and appearance of Conservation Areas. Development that is visually intrusive, that fails to incorporate traditional features and is insensitively sited in the landscape will not be supported. The area is also registered by Cadw as a Landscape of Historic Interest.

The site lies to the western side of Parrog Road, elevated above the highway. The character of either side of the road is quite distinct: to the east there are a number of regularly spaced and sized semi-detached dwellings, set back behind the road by small gardens. To the west there is a much more spacious and open character, with large side gardens separating semi-detached Victorian houses. The paddocks to the rear of these dwellings also lie within the Conservation Area, and contribute to the open, spacious and semi-rural character of this side of the road. The Adopted Newport Conservation Area Statement identifies these characteristics as of integral importance to the character and appearance of the area, including “major importance” of the contribution that the hedge banks and boundaries have to this.

The proposed dwelling would result in a loss of the spacious semi-rural character of the Conservation Area by filling in a gap within the loose-knit pattern of houses and their gardens along the western side of the road. This loss would be emphasised by the removal of a large amount of the existing hedge bank that borders the site in order to achieve visibility splays. This, plus the associated provision of a parking and turning area, would substantially change the semi-rural character of the area by urbanising this side of the road. The application states that the existing hedgerows and hedge banks will be retained, and although an arboricultural report has been submitted with the application, it does not provide clear evidence that this is actually achievable on site. The retention of the existing vegetated boundary treatments is essential to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, and as the application has not provided sufficient evidence to
demonstrate this will be retained, the full extent of the harm of the proposal cannot be assessed. This forms a reason for refusal.

The proposed dwelling has been described by the applicant as a traditional Pembrokeshire dwelling, although this is not an opinion shared by the Authority’s Conservation Officer. His view is that the dwelling “is akin to a modern dormer bungalow and does not reflect the character of the traditional buildings within the Conservation Area – neither does it “stand alone” as an innovative and contemporary design.” Although the applicant has proposed the use of natural slate, the use of smooth render with stone accents does not replicate the traditional design characteristics of the surrounding dwellings or their layout in the Conservation Area. The Victorian properties on the western side of the road have spacious side gardens which result in a semi-rural character to the Conservation Area. The proposed dwelling in fills the side gardens and only has a small garden, mostly used for parking, and is therefore at odds with this spacious character. In addition, the property to the rear has an extant permission for a stable block, which would parallel the proposed dwelling with a separation of approximately 3 metres. The combination of the two would therefore further erode the open character of the Conservation Area, and as a result is considered to harm the special qualities of the National Park and does not enhance the character or appearance of the Conservation Area. This forms a further reason for refusal.

**Impact on the Historic Landscape:**

Policy 8 of the Local Development Plan seeks to protect the special qualities of the National Park, including amongst other things, the protection and enhancement where possible of the historic landscape. Policy 13 refers to the presence of Historic Landscapes as a designation on the Proposals Maps, and the supporting text of this Policy requires consultation with Dyfed Archaeological Trust where development occurs in these designations. The Trust has responded to the consultation on this application and have required a condition protecting potential archaeological interests through a watching brief. This is because the site lies on the periphery of the medieval town of Newport. If permission were to be granted, this could be a conditional requirement. Notwithstanding this, there are concerns with the impact of this proposal on the character of the Historic Landscape as set out above.

**Affordable Housing Matters:**

Policy 3 of the Local Development Plan states that the land use priorities in Newport will be to aim to meet the housing, in particular, affordable housing needs of the local area. Policy 45 states that “To deliver affordable housing the National Park Authority will as part of the overall housing provision” require under caveat (d) “seek a commuted sum to help with the delivery of affordable housing on housing developments below the threshold of 2 units (i.e. on proposals for single residential units).” Under the terms of the Affordable Housing Supplementary Planning Guidance this would be at £150 per square metres of floor space. The applicant has not concluded any
agreement for the commuted sum within the application or indicated that it intends to conclude one. The Design and Access Statement briefly discusses the matter by stating that "While it could never be argued that the design is "affordable housing" it is a small compact and obvious "small family or retirement" dwelling, and as such it will always be in the more affordable end of the housing market". The lack of agreement to provide the required commuted sum for affordable housing is therefore contrary to adopted Development Plan policy and forms a further reason for refusal.

**Sustainable Design:**

Both national and local Development Plan Policy requires sustainable design. Policy 29 of the Local Development Plan expects all proposals for development to demonstrate an integrated approach to design and construction, whilst Policy 32 requires sustainable drainage systems for the disposal of surface water. The application has been supported by a Code for Sustainable Homes Pre-Assessment Report. This states that the dwellings will meet a Code Level 3 rating. Subject to the standard conditioning requiring compliance with these levels, the proposal is acceptable in terms of the sustainable requirements of national and local Policy requirements. It is also situated within settlement units in an accessible location.

**Highways and Rights of Way Matters:**

Policies 52 and 53 of the Local Development Plan refer to traffic impacts of proposed development. The application has shown a vehicular access in the south-eastern corner of the site, leading onto a parking and turning head. The Highways Section at the County Council have considered the application and are concerned that it does not have a visibility sight line looking south towards oncoming traffic. This will clearly cross private third party land, where a portion of the wall will need removing or lowering. In such circumstances it is open to the Authority to impose a "Graupion" condition or Section 106 Agreement requiring the works to be carried out on third party land. No offer has been made in this respect and in light of other issues this has not been pursued. As a result at this time the access cannot be satisfactorily constructed within the curtilage of the site, and this forms a further reason for refusal.

**The Water Environment and Drainage Matters:**

Policy 32 of the Local Development Plan requires development to incorporate sustainable drainage systems for the disposal of water on site. The application has stated that the property would be connected to the mains sewer, and that surface water would be drained via a sustainable drainage system. Both the Environment Agency (now part of Natural Resources Wales) and Welsh Water have been consulted on the application. The former have raised no objection to the development, although they have requested a condition requiring permeable materials for new drives, turning and parking.
areas. Welsh Water requires standard foul and surface water drainage conditions to be attached to any permission.

Protected Species and Habitats Matters:

Policy 8 of the Local Development Plan seeks to protect the special qualities of the National Park, including amongst other things, the restoration and enhancement of the National Park’s ecosystems. Policy 9 seeks to minimise light pollution. Policy 11 states that development that would disturb or otherwise harm protected species or their habitats will only be permitted where the effects can be acceptably minimised or mitigated. The current application was submitted without a protected species report. On the basis of the information submitted the application has been considered by the County Council’s Ecologist, and she has raised no objection to the proposal nor suggested any conditional requirements.

Privacy and Amenity Matters:

Policy 30 of the Local Development Plan refers to amenity in a general sense, seeking to avoid incompatible development and significant adverse impact upon the amenity enjoyed by neighbouring properties. The proposed dwelling lies within approximately 16m of the nearest dwelling, Llyndale, which borders the northern edge of the site. The distances between the existing and proposed dwellings are felt to be sufficient to protect the amenity of the neighbouring properties, although if permission were to be granted, it is felt that due to the elevated nature of the site, permitted development rights should be removed concerning further openings.

However, the property bordering the west of the property, Talar Wen, has an extant permission for a stable block bordering the site along its north-western edge. The permitted building would measure approximately 11.8m x 5.7m x 4.5m at its maximum extent and would include two stables and a store room. The two buildings would be within 3m of each other, separated by an existing hedgerow. This proximity would result in the loss of the hedgerow plus and thus the potential for direct overlooking of the two properties. In addition, the proposed stables would overshadow the proposed dwelling which is not felt to be acceptable for any future occupiers of the dwelling. The poor levels of amenity that would be experienced by them are considered contrary to the adopted Local Development Plan, and this forms a further reason for refusal.

Conclusion

The application has been carefully considered against national and local policy, and raises significant objections that cannot be overcome by planning conditions. On balance it is recommended for refusal for the following four reasons: its harmful impact on the special qualities of the National Park and Newport Conservation Area; highways safety matters; and unacceptable amenity arrangements. The proposal is considered contrary to the national and local policy and is therefore recommended for refusal.
Recommendation
Refusal.

Reasons

1. Policies 3, 8, 15, 29 and 30 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seek to protect and enhance the pattern and diversity of the landscape, prevent development that fails to harmonise with or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park, protect or enhance the historic environment, prevents that which fails to incorporate traditional features, and that which is insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape and visually intrusive. The proposed dwelling, due to its elevated position, its siting and design, the loss of the open space between dwellings, and the visual dominance of its access and parking areas within the street scene, would result in a visually intrusive and discordant feature in the area that is harmful to the special qualities of the National Park nor would it preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Newport Conservation Area. It is therefore contrary to Adopted Development Plan Policy.

2. Policies 8 and 15 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seek to protect and enhance the pattern and diversity of the landscape, and prevent development that fails to harmonise with or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park and the historic environment. The application has not been submitted with a sufficiently detailed arboricultural report (compliant to BS5837 standards), nor proposed a sufficiently detailed landscaping plan, both of which are required in order to assess the impact of the proposal on existing and proposed trees, hedgerows and hedge banks, and the landscape. The lack of information provided on these matters means that the impact of the proposal on the special qualities of the National Park and the character and appearance of the Newport Conservation Area cannot be adequately assessed, and it is therefore considered contrary to Adopted Development Plan Policy.

3. Policies 52 and 53 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seek to ensure that new development is well designed in that is does not cause significant concerns about potential transport impacts that cannot be successfully mitigated. It appears impracticable to construct an access within the curtilage of the site which would provide the required visibility for the drivers of vehicles emerging onto the County Road. It is therefore contrary to Adopted Development Plan Policy and detrimental to highway safety.

4. Policy 30 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plans states that development that has an unacceptable impact on amenity will not be permitted. The proximity of the proposed dwelling to an extant permission for a stable block to the immediate west of the site
would result in an overbearing overshadowing and proximity to any future occupiers of the dwelling. It is therefore contrary to Adopted Development Plan Policy.

5. Policy 3 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Development Plan states that the land use priorities in Newport will aim to meet the housing, in particular, affordable housing needs of the local area. Policy 45 states that a commuted sum will be sought on housing developments below the threshold of two units (i.e. on proposals for single residential units). The proposal fails to justify not offering a commuted sum to help with the delivery of affordable housing. It is therefore contrary to Adopted Development Plan Policy.