

## REPORT OF THE HEAD OF DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT ON APPEALS

The following appeals have been lodged with the Authority and the current position of each is as follows:-

<b>NP/13/0071</b>	Change of use of Fort to Visitor Centre – St Catherines Island, Tenby
<b>Type</b>	Hearing
<b>Current Position</b>	A hearing has taken place and the Inspectors decision is awaited.
<b>NP/13/0216</b>	Installation of 1 x 15kw wind turbine – Trelessy Farm, Amroth
<b>Type</b>	Hearing
<b>Current Position</b>	A hearing has taken place and the Inspectors decision is awaited.
<b>NP/13/0260</b>	Certificate of Lawfulness for touring and camping field for up to 35 touring caravans or tents at any one time on a seasonal basis for holiday purposes only from 1st March up to 28th September in any one year - Buttyland Caravan Park, Station Road, Manorbier
<b>Type</b>	Public Inquiry
<b>Current Position</b>	This appeal was withdrawn on 10 <sup>th</sup> March, 2014
<b>NP/13/0264</b>	Section 73 Application: Variation of Condition 1 of NP/08/060 to extend the period for further five years - Burgage Green Close, St Ishmaels.
<b>Type</b>	Written Representation
<b>Current Position</b>	The initial paperwork has been forwarded to the Inspector
<b>NP/13/0267</b>	Demolition of existing dwelling and erection of two-storey dwelling with integral garages and associated landscaping, parking and boat storage areas - The Elms, Llanrhian
<b>Type</b>	Hearing
<b>Current Position</b>	A hearing has taken place and the Inspectors decision is awaited.
<b>NP/13/0325</b>	Installation of domestic 100kw wind turbine measuring 30m to hub and 39m to blade tip - Broomhill, Angle, Pembroke
<b>Type</b>	Hearing
<b>Current Position</b>	A hearing has been arranged for 25 <sup>th</sup> June, 2014
<b>NP/13/0406</b>	Sub-division to create two separate dwellings - Sunnysdene, Valley Road, Saundersfoot
<b>Type</b>	Hearing
<b>Current Position</b>	A hearing has taken place and the Inspectors decision is awaited.

**NP/13/0471**      Erection of a single 10kw wind turbine measuring 20m to hub & 23.5m to blade tip - Parsonage Farm Caravan Park, Amroth,  
**Type**              Hearing  
**Current Position**      A hearing has been arranged for 9<sup>th</sup> July 2014

**NP/13/0481**      The addition of a glazed sun room extension to side (west facing) elevation & new porch to the front of the property – 26 Swanswell Close, Broad Haven, Haverfordwest,  
**Type**              Written Representation  
**Current Position**      This appeal has been partly allowed and a copy of the decision is attached for your information.

**EC11/0117**      Material change of use of land to use as 2 separate dwellings  
2 Maes-y-Bont, Mynachlogddu  
**Type**              Written Representations  
**Current Position**      The paperwork has been forwarded to the Inspector and his decision is awaited.

## Penderfyniad ar yr Apêl

## Appeal Decision

Ymweliad â safle a wnaed ar 11/03/14

Site visit made on 11/03/14

gan Melissa Hall BA(Hons) BTP MSc  
MRTPI

by Melissa Hall BA(Hons) BTP MSc  
MRTPI

Arolygydd a benodir gan Weinidogion Cymru

an Inspector appointed by the Welsh Ministers

Dyddiad: 26/03/14

Date: 26/03/14

Appeal Ref: APP/L9503/A/14/2212463

Site address: 26 Swanswell Close, Broad Haven, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire  
SA62 3LW

The Welsh Ministers have transferred the authority to decide this appeal to me as the appointed Inspector.

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
- The appeal is made by Mr Lewis Gee against the decision of Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority.
- The application Ref NP/13/0481, dated 8 October 2013, was refused by notice dated 3 December 2013.
- The development proposed is the addition of a glazed sun room extension to side (west facing) elevation and new porch to the front of the property.

### Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed insofar as it relates to the new porch to the front of the property. The appeal is allowed insofar as it relates to the remainder of the application and planning permission is granted for addition of a glazed sun room extension to side (west facing) elevation at 26 Swanswell Close, Broad Haven, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire SA62 3LW in accordance with the terms of the application, Ref NP/13/0481, dated 8 October 2013 and the plans submitted with it so far as relevant to that part of the development hereby permitted and subject to the following conditions:
  - 1) The development hereby permitted shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.
  - 2) The elements of the development hereby permitted shall be carried out strictly in accordance with approved plans ref. GA01 and GA02 received on 10 October 2013.

### Procedural Matters

2. I have used the Council's description of development as it is more concise.

### Main Issue

3. This is the effect of the proposed development on the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and the surrounding area.

## Reasons

4. Swanswell Close lies within the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, where the statutory purpose is to conserve and enhance its natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage. It must therefore be afforded the highest status of protection from inappropriate developments.
5. The appeal site is part of a modern residential development consisting of some 36 dwellings located in the coastal village of Broad Haven. The development is a mix of detached single storey and two storey dwellings with a rendered finish to the external walls and pitched slate roofs.
6. No 26 is a single storey dwelling sited off the main road through the development. It is accessed off a shared drive serving two other dwellings. The slab level of the appeal dwelling is below the level of the access, such that its roof is most visible from public vantage points in Swanswell Close. The property is elevated in relation to, and visually prominent from, a public footpath and playing fields to the west.

### *The porch*

7. The proposed porch would, in part, comprise of a flat roof section positioned in the corner of the 'L' shaped front elevation, and would accommodate a utility room. It would project forward of a pitched roof element incorporating an entrance door located at a 45 degree angle to its front gable.
8. The use of a flat roof, which is not a feature of the existing dwelling or prominent elevations in the wider development, would result in the introduction of a visually discordant element. In relation to the pitched roof element, it would appear awkward and together they would lack an overall coherence. The angle of the entrance door in relation to the pitched roof above would exacerbate such an effect. In this context, the proposed porch would not relate well to the appearance of the existing dwelling.
9. I accept that this change would not be highly prominent in the wider street scene given the set back of the dwelling from the main access through the site. However, when viewed at close range, and for the above reasons, its complicated design would appear at odds with the simplicity of the host dwelling. It would also be read in the context of the two other single storey dwellings of similar design and external appearance, which are characterised by pitched roofs and whose front elevations appear largely unaltered.
10. Consequently, I consider that the proposal would unacceptably harm the appearance of the existing dwelling and would not represent good design. Despite the limited public views, it would have an adverse effect on the appearance of its immediate surroundings. The proposal would therefore conflict with the objectives of Policies 8, 29 and 30 of the adopted Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) insofar as it would be visually intrusive and of a poor design that would not have regard to the identity and character of the existing dwelling and the wider development.
11. Although the Authority has also cited LDP Policy 15 in the reason for refusal, given that the adverse impact of part of the proposal is of a relatively local nature and seen in the context of built form, I do not find that it would conflict with this policy to protect the special landscape quality of the National Park.

### *The extension*

12. The proposed extension would be positioned on the prominent and elevated west facing elevation. It would have a shallow mono pitched roof and, together with the existing single storey projection, would extend almost the entire width of this elevation.
13. The design and external appearance of the extension would respect the character and appearance of the host dwelling. Its scale, form and massing would ensure that it would remain subordinate to the existing. Although its roof pitch differs from that of the main part of the dwelling and single storey projection, the treatment of the junctions between the roofs would represent an appropriate design response which would integrate well. The alterations to the existing single storey projection would further assist in harmonising the separate elements.
14. Although it would be highly visible in the surrounding area, the complementary design that I have described above would result in this element of the proposal having an acceptable visual impact when viewed from prominent public vantage points. As such, it would meet with the requirements of LDP Policies 8, 29 and 30 to protect the special qualities of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park.

### **Other Matters**

15. Although the Authority's evidence includes a copy of a document entitled '*Guidance for Sustainable Design in the National Parks of Wales*' (2009) it has not cited this document in its reason for refusal nor explained its relevance in the determination of this appeal. However, I do not consider that it adds anything significant to the objectives sought by the relevant LDP policies and have not therefore afforded it significant weight.

### **Conclusion**

16. Those elements of the proposed development that I have found to be unacceptable are severable from the remainder of the proposal. Therefore, for the reasons given above, I conclude that the appeal should be dismissed in relation to the new porch. However, it should succeed in relation to the addition of a glazed sun room extension to the side elevation.

### **Conditions**

17. Other than the standard time limit, the Authority has suggested a condition requiring the development to be completed and retained in accordance with the approved plans, which I have considered in accordance with the advice contained in Welsh Office Circular 35/95: *The Use of Conditions in Planning Permissions*. Such a condition is both reasonable and necessary to ensure a satisfactory appearance, albeit I have slightly amended its wording. This permission would not override the removal of permitted development rights in relation to the existing planning permission and I have therefore removed the reference to 'thereafter retained'.
18. Whilst a condition has also been suggested relating to the proposed roof light over the utility room, as the appeal has been dismissed in relation to the porch and utility room such a condition would not be required.

*Melissa Hall*

INSPECTOR