Item 6e)

Application Ref: NP/13/0506

Application Type: Full
Grid Ref: SN05593901
Applicant: Mr & Mrs J & L Smith
Agent: Mr J Bishop
Proposal: Part demolition of existing attached domestic out-building and provision of single storey extensions to the south and west to enlarge out-building. In addition to associated external works to provide garden retaining wall and access steps.

Site Location: Glanafon, Upper West Street, Newport, Pembrokeshire, SA42 0TQ
Case Officer: Ceri Porter

Summary

This application is being reported to the Development Management Committee for consideration as the recommendation for refusal is contrary to the views expressed by Newport Town Council that raises no objections to this proposal.

Glanafon is a substantial detached property located within Newport Conservation Area with a single storey kitchen wing and rear ancillary wing. This application seeks full planning permission for an extension to the side and rear of the existing single storey wing plus associated landscaping to the rear. Whilst it is appreciated that the house itself is to remain unaltered externally, the existing juxtaposition of the large formal Edwardian house and the rubble-built rear ancillary range is an attractive one, the whole having preserved its character well and it is considered that the proposal erodes the character of the rear aspect of the property particularly in terms of detail. As such it is considered that the proposal by reason of the introduction of render, oak lintels, large areas of glazing and four rooflights within a relatively small roof slope fails to respect the simple vernacular character of the existing wing, diluting the important distinction between the main house and its ancillary building to the detriment of the traditional appearance of the host dwelling and the character and appearance of the Newport Conservation Area. The application is therefore recommended for refusal by reason of its detailed design and use of materials.

Consultee Response

PCNPA Conservation Officer - Recommend Refusal - as the proposal in its current form affects the character of the building and conservation area.
Newport Town Council: Approve - It is considered that the design is in keeping with the existing building and surroundings with no alteration to the principal elevation.
Dyfed Archaeological Trust: No adverse comments received at time of writing this report.
Ecologist - Pembrokeshire County Council: No objection

Public Response

The application has been appropriately advertised, and no public responses have been received at the time of writing this report.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 03 - Newport Local Centre
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
PPW5 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
PPW5 Chapter 05 - Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast
PPW5 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
SPG17 - Conservation Area Proposals
TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning
TAN 12 - Design

Officer’s Appraisal

Background

Glanafon is a substantial detached Edwardian property located to the south of Upper West Street directly on the corner of its junction with Mill Lane.

The property comprises of the main 3 storey double fronted house with a single storey ancillary wing set well back from the front elevation on the east side that runs parallel with the Afon Felin stream and projects further back into the garden than the main building. This wing is partially built into the ground and contains the kitchen, larder and store plus an outside WC all set on different levels as the land rises to the south.

History

NP/02/302 – Access plus car parking space - Refused: 14 Aug 2002
NP/02/333 – Provision of Parking Space – Refused 14 Aug 2002

Constraints

- Biodiversity Issue
- Historic Landscape
- Potential for Surface Water Flooding
- LDP Rural Centre
- Recreation Character Areas
- Newport Conservation Area

Current Proposal

Planning permission is sought to extend the kitchen wing by widening the building by 2m into the garden (west elevation) and increasing the length by 0.75m (south elevation).

The new west elevation would have a rendered masonry wall with folding timber glazed doors. The roof would be a continuation of the existing roof pitch and finished in matching slate with 4 no. roof lights proposed within the roof.

As the proposed extension intends for a level floor throughout the kitchen wing rather than the 3 changes in level as currently arranged, the existing south elevation will be 0.75m deeper to allow the required levels to be dug out. A small wood store structure is then proposed on the south elevation that would be accessed via a new set of steps up from the rear patio with new retaining walls constructed in association with this change of level.

Rendered walls will match the upper gable walls of the main house and all fenestration will be painted hardwood.

Key Issues

1. Visual amenity and impact on the Conservation Area and Special Qualities of the National Park;
2. Neighbouring Amenity
3. Ecology

Visual Amenity and impact on the Conservation Area and Special Qualities of the National Park:

When considering applications for planning permission in conservation areas, PPW reiterates the legislative provisions set out in the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (the LBCA Act 1990) which stipulates that local planning authorities shall pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the area.
Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) is a strategy policy which refers to the special qualities of the National Park and lists priorities to ensure that these special qualities will be protected and enhanced. Policy 15 of the LDP seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria ‘a’, ‘b’, ‘d’ and ‘e’ resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion, be insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape, fail to harmonise with, or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park, and/or failing to incorporate important traditional features. Policy 29 of the LDP requires all development proposals to be well designed in terms of place and local distinctiveness (criterion ‘a’). Policy 30 of the LDP seeks to avoid development that is of an incompatible scale with its surroundings (criterion ‘b’) or is visually intrusive (criterion ‘d’).

The existing juxtaposition of the large formal Edwardian house and the rubble-built rear ancillary range is an attractive one, the whole having preserved its character well. Although appreciated that the house itself is to remain unaltered externally (having been the recipient of conservation area grant funding in 2008), the proposal is considered to erode the character of the rear aspect of the property particularly in terms of detail.

The existing architectural ‘palette’ displays a distinct contrast between formal stuccoed elevations of the main house and the lesser rubble elevations, with typical painted joinery. The proposal introduces some new elements to include undulating render, oak lintels, large glazed areas plus four rooflights within a relatively small area of roof slope. These features are at odds with the simple vernacular character of the existing ancillary wing, with the proposal in general blurring the attractive and clear distinction between formal house and ancillary buildings. This distinction is considered to be very much part of the character of the Conservation Area in Newport.

The ‘lesser’ buildings within the Conservation Area are as important as the main ones, only much more vulnerable to change. Many are admittedly fairly hidden from view, but the rear elevation and garden of Glanafon is prominently visible from Mill Lane.

In light of the above, it is considered that the proposal by reason of the introduction of render, oak lintels, large areas of glazing and four rooflights within a relatively small roof slope fails to respect the simple vernacular character of the existing wing, diluting the important distinction between the main house and its ancillary building to the detriment of the traditional appearance of the host dwelling and the character and appearance of the Newport Conservation Area.

In light of the above, it is considered that the proposed extension, by reason of its design and introduction of new materials fails to respect the simple vernacular character of the existing wing, diluting the important distinction between the main house and its ancillary building to the detriment of the appearance of the host dwelling and the character and appearance of the Newport Conservation Area. As such the proposal is considered contrary to
policies 8(b), 8(c), 8(d), 15(a), 15(b), 15(d), 15(e), 29(a), 30(b) and 30(d) of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (Adopted: September 2010) and the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

Neighbouring Amenity:
Policy 30 of the LDP states that development will not be permitted where it has an unacceptable impact on amenity. The siting, size and detailed design of the extension, in relation to other properties in the vicinity, is such that it does not raise any significant neighbouring amenity concerns in terms of overlooking and overshadowing.

Ecology
A Bat Survey has been submitted with the application with no evidence of bats found and no bats were recorded during the activity surveys. The drawings show the recommended enhancement and provided the works are undertaken as per the methods stated in the survey report the proposal is acceptable.

Conclusion
The proposal introduces new materials and design details that fail to respect the simple vernacular character of the existing wing, diluting the important distinction between the main house and its ancillary building to the detriment of the appearance of the host dwelling and the character and appearance of the Newport Conservation Area; and fails to protect the special qualities of the National Park

Recommendation
That the application be refused for the following reason:

1. The proposed extension, by reason of its design and introduction of new materials fails to respect the simple vernacular character of the existing wing and would dilute the important distinction between the main house and its ancillary building to the detriment of the appearance of the host dwelling, the character and appearance of the Newport Conservation Area. As such the proposal is contrary to policies 8(b), 8(c), 8(d), 15(a), 15(b), 15(d), 15(e), 29(a), 30(b) and 30(d) of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (Adopted: September 2010) and the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.