Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

Application Ref: NP/15/0363/FUL

Case Officer: Caroline Bowen
Applicant: Mr R Evans, Wentwood Property Ltd
Agent: Mr A Rewbridge, J A Rewbridge Development Services
Proposal: Replacement dwelling
Site Location: Westfields, Wisemans Bridge, Narberth, Pembrokeshire, SA67 8NU
Grid Ref: SN14960650
Date Valid: 24-Jun-2015  Target Date: 18-Aug-2015

Summary

The application site is a detached dwelling located in a small group of dwellings to the north-east of Wisemans Bridge. The site falls outside of any Centre boundary, as defined for the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority Local Development Plan. This application comes before committee as the officer recommendation is contrary to the Community Council's objection.

Planning permission is sought for a replacement dwelling.

Officers consider that the proposal is acceptable – the replacement dwelling incorporates very modern design and construction with a pitched roof form, the external materials to be used would be considered to be in keeping with those already found within the setting; and private parking and amenity space is available to the property. As such, officers consider that the proposal can be supported and the recommendation is of approval, subject to conditions.

Consultee Response

Amroth Community Council: Objecting
PCNPA - Tree and Landscape Officer: Conditional consent
PCC - Ecologist: No evidence of bats using the buildings recorded during the scoping and emergence survey however there was some activity recorded with bats foraging around the property. Recommend a precautionary approach to demolition works and if bats or evidence found work should stop and ourselves or NRW be contacted. Furthermore external lighting should be designed to be as dim as possible, on a timer and not point at roost features or habitat corridors so as not to deter foraging bats.
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: No objection
Development Planning: No objection - See NRW comments and advice to applicant
Coal Authority: No objection - however the Coal Authority would recommend that an informative is included with any approval.
PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent
Public Response

A site notice was posted in accordance with statutory requirements, and neighbouring properties notified by letter. Four letters/emails were received, with the issues of concern (in summary) being:

- The dwelling is two storeys under the guise of a 1 and a half dormer bungalow.
- The dwelling will be very visible in the landscape, as the ridge line is 1.2 metres above neighbouring properties.
- The dwelling will impact on views.
- The dwelling will require a cesspit for foul water drainage, and it is likely that the existing cesspit would not be able to accommodate a larger property.
- The dwelling is too big for the plot.
- The hedgerow between Willow Lodge and Westfields does not belong to the developer.
- Both the siting of the high timber fence and the fact that the side wall of the proposed dwelling is considerably higher and closer than the existing building will result in a considerable loss of light and overshadowing to Willow Lodge’s south and east elevations.
- Section 12 of the planning application states that the new dwelling will connect to mains drainage, however, there is no mains sewerage in the Cliff Road area. The current plans make no provision for the siting of any foul sewerage collection facility and do not show where the proposed soakaways will be sited.
- The northern boundary is an existing hedgerow which is to be replaced by a 1.8 metre timber fence. This will have an impact on biodiversity, and the loss of a mature hedgerow would impact on local landscape character.
- The existing access is not in the applicant’s ownership and heavy vehicular traffic would have an adverse impact.
- A larger dwelling would suggest greater traffic, and any increase in traffic is likely to have an adverse effect on road safety, pollution and traffic noise.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 07 - Countryside
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 45 - Affordable housing
LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic
PPW7 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions
SPG06 - Landscape
TAN 12 - Design

Constraints

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m
Special Protection Area - within 500m
Site of Special Scientific Interest - within 50m
Biodiversity Issue
Recreation Character Areas
Low Coal Risk
Surface Coal
High Coal Risk

Officer's Appraisal

Background and site description

Westfields sits in a modest plot behind existing houses, and is accessed by a minor road which runs north east off the main road between Amroth and Wisemans Bridge. The site falls in open countryside outside of any Centre Boundary for Newport, as defined for the purposes of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan, but as the proposal involves the replacement of an existing lawful dwelling, the rural restraint policies of the Local Development Plan would not be applicable here.

The existing dwelling is single storey and sits immediately behind existing single storey dwellings which front onto Cliff Road. The house sits in a long plot, which rises to the east, and is bordered by mature hedgerows and trees. There is an existing access off Cliff Road running to the west of the plot and onto the agricultural land to the south over which the applicant has a right of way. In the wider landscape setting, the development pattern is made up of individual dwellings located to either side of Cliff Road, and are largely modern in appearance.

Current proposal

The proposed development involves;

- A replacement dwelling.
  The new structure falls mainly on the footprint of the existing dwelling, but is taller in height. The dimensions of the dwelling are 11.5 metres in width, 12.1 metres in depth and 7.2 metres in height to the roof ridge. The external finishes are to be larch clad vertical timber boarding above stone and render external walls, with fibre cement slate to the
pitched roof. The fenestration will be powder-coated aluminium in Anthracite Grey.

- Landscaping of the plot to include a new timber fence to the northern elevation and the creation of three parking spaces to the front of the site.

Planning history

There is no recent planning history for the application site.

Constraints

- Biodiversity
- Historic Landscape
- Low/Surface/High Coal
- Recreation Character Area

Key issues

- Policy
- Design and siting
- Access and parking
- Amenity and Privacy
- Landscaping
- Biodiversity
- Other material considerations.

Policy

All planning applications are required by statute to be determined in accordance with the policies of the current development plan, which is the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP). The Plan is supported by Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG's) on a variety of subjects.

National policy advice is contained in Planning Policy Wales Edition 7 and accompanying Technical Advice Notes (TAN's). Planning Policy Wales Edition 7, paragraphs 4.11.9 and 4.11.10 advise that the visual appearance of proposed development, its scale and its relationship to its surroundings and context are material planning considerations; and that in areas recognised for their landscape, townscape or historic value, such as National Parks, it can be appropriate to seek to promote or reinforce traditional and local distinctiveness. It also states that local planning authorities should not attempt to impose a particular architectural taste or style arbitrarily, and should avoid inhibiting opportunities for innovative design solutions.

Policy 7 generally directs new development in the countryside either to infill or rounding off sites, for essential agricultural or forestry needs, or to conversions of appropriate buildings. In this instance, however, the new
dwelling is as a result of the replacement of an existing lawful dwelling house, thus the proposal would not be contrary to this policy.

**Design and siting**

In the Authority’s Supplementary Planning Guidance on Landscape Character Assessment, which supports Policy 8 - Special Qualities, the application site falls within Landscape Character Area 1 - Saundersfoot Settled Coast. This is an area of valleys fronting a broad bay containing several small villages. The strong link to the coast provides a strong sense of place, and the landscape has an open nature and attractive views along the coast. The guidance does not make any reference to the residential development within this part of the landscape, nor recommends any specific management guidance for the developed elements of this landscape.

Policy 29 - Sustainable Design states that all proposals for development will be expected to demonstrate an integrated approach to design and construction, and will be required to be well designed in terms of (amongst other issues) place and local distinctiveness, environment and biodiversity, energy use and materials and resources. This proposed scheme intends to replace the chalet structure with one that is constructed of sustainable materials and incorporates high levels of thermal insulation.

The new building would be visible in the immediate landscape setting, as the landscape is relatively open in aspect at this site, and the new property will be taller than the dwellings to the road frontage by approximately 1.0 metre. In the wider setting, and on approach to the application site, long ranging views of the dwelling would be confined to Cliff Road running to the north of the site, as the existing topography and soft landscape on approach would prevent significant long-ranging views.

The prevailing character of the immediate setting is that of detached dwellings loosely interdispersed along the rural roads between Summerhill, Pleasant Valley and Wisemans Bridge landscape. The existing dwellings are of varied height, form and appearance. The new dwelling is modern and will be a visual contrast to the adjacent dwellings, which is different, but is not considered to be insensitive nor incongruous. The new dwelling uses materials that would be appropriate to the countryside landscape - the timber clad detail to the upper part of the external walls softens the massing of the building.

**Access and parking**

The existing access is retained, and a new parking area to the front of the dwelling created. The Highways Development Control Officer recommended conditional consent, subject to a condition requiring the off-street parking facilities to be provided prior to occupation.
Amenity and Privacy

The proposed use as a single dwelling house would be both compatible and appropriate to the existing residential use of the application site, as required under Policy 30 - Amenity. In terms of visual impact, whilst the replacement dwelling is taller in form, the building will be located within the setting of existing residential development, within which the dwellings are of varying sizes and designs, therefore, would not be considered inappropriate to the setting.

There are neighbours in proximity to the north of the new dwelling, and officers had raised the issue of privacy and amenity as a potential issue, particularly where the replacement dwelling was to be taller. In light of this, the applicant's agent undertook an overshadowing report in respect of the likely impact of the new dwelling. This assessed overshadowing using the British Research Establishment (BRE) document 'Site Layout Planning for Sunlight and Daylight -2011'. In respect of the existing windows to the neighbour, Willow Lodge, there were no windows to the gable end facing the application site, therefore no overshadowing would occur. The analysis of overshadowing to the rear gardens of Willow Lodge and Hillcrest found that whilst some overshadowing would occur, the proposed development did not result in significant overshadowing of 50% of the gardens for more than 2 hours, which would fall within acceptable guidelines.

Landscaping

There are no tree preservation orders on the site, and the site is not within a conservation area. The proposal retains private garden space and the existing parking area will be surfaced with permeable hard standing. The Authority's Tree and Landscape Officer was consulted and recommended conditional consent, requiring no development to take place until a detailed scheme for the soft landscaping was submitted and approved. This can be dealt with by planning condition. There were several representations made in respect of the loss of the existing hedge between Willow Lodge and the application site - the retention of this hedgerow can be suitably addressed by the same planning condition.

Biodiversity

The protected species report, submitted with the planning application, identified that whilst the existing house itself, the landscape surrounding was used by various bat species. The Authority's Ecologist was consulted, and recommended that a precautionary approach be taken, with further details submitted in respect of external lighting. These details can be adequately controlled by planning conditions, and would meet the requirements of Policy 11.

Other material considerations

- Affordable Housing
As the proposal is for a replacement dwelling, there would be no net increase in dwellings provided, and an affordable housing contribution is not required.

- **Concerns raised following public consultation**
  The comments received following the public consultation of the planning application have been carefully considered. It is clear that the main concern in respect of the proposal relates to the height and proximity of the new dwelling, and the impact on the existing context of the setting.

It is recognised that the new dwelling will visually contrast with the existing local vernacular. Design is subjective in nature, thus consideration of whether a design is acceptable to its surroundings has to look at the elements comprising the scheme. In this instance, whilst the form of the building takes a more contemporary approach, the materials used can be seen in existing buildings in the locale. The existing bungalow is low in height, therefore any increase in height of structures on this footprint would be inevitably more apparent in the street scene, however, the proposed difference in height would be limited to approximately 1.0 metre, which is not considered overwhelming in this instance.

In respect of the concerns regarding the arrangements for foul water drainage, the applicant's agent has clarified that there is an existing cesspit, and that the reference to mains drainage on the application form was an error. No objections have been received from Welsh Water, and Natural Resources Wales have recommended a non-mains drainage assessment be carried out prior to construction. This can be adequately addressed by planning condition to ensure that the existing arrangement is capable of serving the new development.

**Conclusion**

The proposal is considered a suitable design approach, which relates appropriately to the existing curtilage and setting, and provides adequate facilities for parking and amenity. In light of this, the proposed is considered to accord with the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan.

**Recommendation**

The recommendation is for approval, subject to conditions relating to time, accordance with plans, and conditions suggested by statutory consultees.