Application Ref: NP/15/0571/FUL

Case Officer: Kate Attrill
Applicant: Mr E Lambert
Agent: Mr M Davies
Proposal: Extension & alterations including conversion of garage to granny flat & restoration of cottage front, also replacement of shed with new stable block
Site Location: Pengawse Isaf, Mountain West, Newport, Pembrokeshire, SA42 0QY
Grid Ref: SN04123791
Date Valid: 07-Oct-2015  Target Date: 18-Dec-2015

Summary

The application is being brought before Committee as Newport Town Council's recommendation is contrary to officers recommendation.

Pengawse Isaf sits to the south west of Newport, in an elevated position in Mountain West. The cottage is of traditional construction with a natural Caernarfon slate roof over limewashed roughcast and timber casement windows. The house is oriented to the north east, with the gable end facing the road. It sits within a small cluster of four dwellings.

The proposed scheme seeks to attach the single storey garage to the north of the property, raise the roof and convert into a “granny annexe”, construct a stable building to the north east of the dwelling, and extend the dwelling at the rear with a two storey extension.

The proposed extensions are considered to be sympathetic and in keeping with the character of the original cottage and in accordance with Local Development Plan Policies and are therefore recommended for Approval.

Consultee Response

PCC - Ecologist: A licence will be required from NRW to undertake the work. A lighting scheme should be submitted to and agreed in writing by the National Park Authority, prior to commencement of works on site.

PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent

Newport Town Council: Recommend Refusal

Public Response

The application was advertised by site notice on the 20th October 2015 on the telegraph pole opposite the application site. Three neighbouring properties were also written to.

One neighbour has formally objected to the proposal on the basis that they believe it to be contrary to Policies 7, 8 and 15. The objection mainly relates to
the proposal for a two storey extension to the rear of the property which it is suggested will be highly visible and obtrusive within the National Park.

The submitted objection relates to the two storey extension but refers to Policy 7 for ‘conversion of appropriate buildings’ whereas the submitted objection in fact relates to the element of extension of an existing dwelling.

The Town Council were previously consulted on an application in the same terms as the present one (NP/15/0164) earlier in 2015 prior to its being Withdrawn on the basis of issues with the bat survey and NRW’s consultation response.

The comments of Newport Town Council on NP/15/0164 were: “No issues with design, appearance or materials. No conflict with the Development Plan”.

When re-consulted on the current application (which has not changed), the Town Council’s comments were: “Layout and density of building considered to be too large for the size of the plot. NTC happy with the house proposal but were dubious about the scale of the stable block”.

**Policies considered**

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page
Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website –
http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

Circular 60/96 - Planning and the Historic Environment: Archaeology
LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 07 - Countryside
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity

**Constraints**

LDP Mineral Safeguard
Biodiversity Issue
Historic Landscape
Rights of Way Inland - within 50m
Recreation Character Areas

**Officer's Appraisal**

**Site and Context**

Pengawse Isaf sits within a small cluster of dwellings on Mountain West overlooking Newport. A converted chapel lies to the east of the dwelling with a
two storey house with a modern two storey extension to the west. Opposite and to the south west lies a bungalow on higher ground.

Relevant Planning History

NP/15/0164 Extensions and alterations including granny flat and stables. Withdrawn 6th May 2015.

Description of Proposal

The current dwelling has a cat-slide roof to the rear with a single storey rear extension which measures 9 metres (including a small lean-to) from the junction with the roof.

The proposal seeks to replace the existing single storey extension and extend the dwelling to the rear by a total of 10.5 metres from the ridgeline, but only by 5.8 metres if measured from the end of the cat-slide roof.

The height of the rear roof is proposed to alter from 4.1 metres to 5.8 metres high.

The existing single storey detached garage lies to the north of the property and measures 9.2 by 5 metres. The proposal seeks to attach the garage and raise the roof from its current height at 3.5 metres to 3.7 metres and extending its length to 10.3 metres to provide a living room, bathroom and bedroom described as an annexe.

Pre-application advice given by the Planning Authority in 2011 related to converting the garage to a holiday let indicated that such a proposal would not be supported on the basis of accessibility.

A detached single storey stable block measuring 11.9 by 8.4 metres in an ‘L’ shape to a height of 4.4 metres is also proposed to the east of the dwelling. Proposed materials are rendered blockwork under a corrugated roof and the interior contains two loose boxes, a tack room and a hay store. The building also contains bat mitigation.

There is a concrete hardstanding indicating the presence of a previous building to the north of the proposed stable site.

Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:

- Policy and Principle of Development
- Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park
- Amenity and Privacy
- Access and Parking
- Biodiversity
Policy:

For the purposes of the Local Development Plan, the site lies within open countryside and therefore Policy 7 is the most applicable Spatial Strategy policy.

Policy 7 reads:

Outside the identified Centres of the Local Development Plan area development will only be permitted where:

a) it constitutes sensitive filling in of small gaps or minor extensions (ie rounding off) to isolated groups of dwellings is proposed.

The supporting text then goes on to say at 4.47 that: 'National planning policy refers to buildings needing 'to be of a form, bulk and general design which are in keeping with their surroundings'. In this National Park these are considered to be those that make a positive contribution to the character of the area through their intrinsic architectural merit or their setting in the landscape. Their interest and charm stems from an appreciation of the functional requirement of the building, their layout and proportions, the type of building materials used (including those constructed of stone, clom and slate), and their display of local building methods and skills.

In this instance, the proposal suggests the use of natural Welsh slates, and actively improves the character of the building through restoring a more appropriate style of fenestration in combination with a sympathetic scheme for extension and can be therefore seen to comply with Policy 7.

Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park

Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) is a Strategy policy which refers to the special qualities of the National Park and lists priorities to ensure that these qualities will be protected and enhanced.

The principle of providing alterations and extension to the dwelling can be supported subject to the development proposed reflecting the special qualities of the area by constituting an appropriate design in accord with Policy 8 of the Local Development Plan. The proposed extensions and alterations are sympathetic to the historic building, does not cause any harm to the sense of remoteness and tranquillity, and is therefore in accord with Policy 8.

Policy 15 of the LDP seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria ‘a’ and ‘b’ resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion and/or, that would be insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape. Criterion ‘c’ resists development that would introduce or intensify a use which is incompatible with its location. Criteria ‘d’ and ‘e’ resist development that would fail to harmonise with, or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park and/or fail to incorporate important traditional features. The development is in accordance with Policy 15.
Policy 29 of the LDP requires all development proposals to be well designed in terms of place and local distinctiveness (criterion ‘a’). The development proposes replacing the unattractive casement windows with windows of a more traditional appearance and material, extending in a traditional form and with traditional materials and will respect the local distinctiveness of the area. The development is in accordance with Policy 29.

The proposed alterations are would not cause significant visual intrusion, or be insensitive to the landscape.

*Amenity and Privacy:*

Policy 29 and 30 of the Local Development Plan seek to protect community cohesion and health and to avoid incompatible development that would lead to a significant adverse impact upon amenity. The supportive text at paragraph 4.136 explains that the policy aims “to protect the amenity enjoyed by people in their residences, workspaces and recreational areas. Amenity is defined as those elements in the appearance and layout of town and countryside which makes for pleasant life rather than mere existence. Anything ugly, dirty, noisy, crowded, intrusive or uncomfortable is likely to adversely affect amenity”.

Although one objection has been received from a near neighbour, it is not an immediately adjacent neighbour, and concerns over privacy and amenity have not been raised, rather concerns over the principle of development.

In looking at the immediate street-scene, a two storey extension was approved in 2000 at Maesteg (the adjacent dwelling) to the south west, which is judged to have a greater potential impact on the street-scene that those currently under consideration and yet received no objections.

Pengawse, opposite the development site, had extensions and alterations approved in 2006 (NP/06/013 & 014), in addition to stables, so the proposals currently under consideration can be seen to be in character with minor extensions and alterations approved in the immediate area.

In terms of Policies 29 and 30, there is not considered to be any potential detriment to residential amenity as a result of this proposal which is in accord with Policies 29 and 30.

*Access and Parking:*

The County Highways department have no objection to the proposed scheme and have suggested a condition requiring parking to be completed before the scheme is brought into operation, but this could be altered to suggest parking be maintained throughout works as the dwelling is already in operation.
Biodiversity:

Protected Species

A Bat Survey was undertaken at Pengawse Isaf, Mountain West, Newport in relation to the current planning application. A scoping and two dawn surveys were undertaken in August and September 2014. A period of remote sensing was also undertaken using static detectors.

Soprano and common pipistrelle, Myotis and Brown long-eared bats were recorded roosting at the property. Pipistrelle and Myotis (Whiskered/Brandts) bats were recorded roosting behind weather boarding around the lean to extension on the south elevation and on the south gable wall of the original building. It is likely these roosts are transitory or possibly autumnal mating sites. The Brown long-eared bats are roosting within the roof voids of the original building and the extension and given the age and number of droppings it is likely to be a well established maternity roost.

Mitigation

The proposed mitigation incorporates the retention of existing roosts along with the provision of a new dedicated bat roost. The Brown long-eared roost above the original building is to be retained and sectioned off from the roost above the extension. Improvements will then be made to the retained roost to provide optimum roosting conditions. The roost above the extension will be destroyed. To compensate for the destroyed roost a new dedicated roost is to be provided above the tack room of the new stable block.

All of the existing roosts used by the crevice dwelling bats, under weatherboarding, soffits and fascias are to be replaced like for like.

In the opinion of the County Ecologist, the proposed mitigation and compensation is adequate to ensure the Favourable Conservation Status (FCS) of the population of Brown long-eared bats will not be affected and will allow continued use of the maternity roost. The other roost sites are to be replaced like for like so there is no potential for any long term adverse impact on the FCS.

This assessment is made on the following conditions being included should permission be given:

- A licence will be required from NRW to undertake the work. More detail will be required by NRW at the time of licensing in relation to materials, location of internal roost features and timing. To ensure the development is in accordance with the details agreed here a copy of the licence issued by Natural Resources Wales pursuant to Regulation 53 of the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations (2010) should be submitted to the LPA prior to the commencement of works to the property.
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

- External lighting may impact on the roosting and foraging bats and should be as dim as possible, on a sensor to reduce the amount of ‘on’ time and not point at roost access features or habitat corridors. A lighting scheme should be submitted to and agreed in writing by the LPA prior to the commencement of works no site.

Licensing

As bats have been found at the development site a Development License will be required to authorise the proposed mitigation and works. The License is separate from the LPA Planning Permission and should be sought from NRW. To comply with the Habitats Directive and as part of the License 3 tests must be satisfied. These are:

1. That there is no satisfactory alternative
   There are no alternative means of meeting the need of the proposed development, including the option of doing nothing, whilst causing less damage to the species in question.
2. It will not be detrimental to the maintenance of the population of the species concerned at a favourable conservation in their natural range
   The development itself will have no impact on the Favourable Conservation Status (FCS) of local bat species as part of the existing roost can continue to be used and enhancement in the form of a new roost is to be provided.
3. It is in the interests of public health and public safety, or for other imperative reasons of overriding public interest, including those of a social and economic nature
   It is in the interests of IROPI of a social nature for the benefit of the applicant.

The tests of derogation have been considered in the processing of this application and the Local Authority is satisfied that this development complies.

Conclusion

The application proposes a sensitive and sympathetic extension to the main dwelling house whilst providing additional accommodation in an annexe converted from an existing building. The proposals for the stable are considered to be in keeping with the character of the area and of a suitably vernacular style.

Recommendation

APPROVE, subject to the following conditions:

1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.
   Reason: Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).

2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents: [insert plan nos. with revision]
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

references, if relevant.
Reason: In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

3. The annexe hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the dwelling known as Penglawse Isaf.
Reason: In accordance with the policy of the Local Development Plan - Policy 29 - Sustainable Design.

4. The stables shall be used for the private stabling of horses incidental to the enjoyment of the dwelling house known as Penglawse Isaf and shall not be used for livery or any commercial purpose.
Reason: To preserve and maintain the residential character of the existing dwellinghouse and to protect the amenities of neighbouring occupiers. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 30 (Amenity).

5. Adequate facilities for parking and turning shall be made available at all times within the curtilage of the site to the satisfaction of the National Park Authority. These works are to be completed before the development is brought into use.
Reason: To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway or danger to road users when vehicles are leaving the site. Local Development Plan, Policy 53 - Impacts of Traffic.

6. All windows, doors and other external joinery to be in timber with a painted finish.
Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan, Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and 30 - Amenity.

7. Windows to be traditionally constructed double box sliding sash type in timber with a painted finish.
Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan, Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty and 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

8. The development hereby permitted is for the conversion of the existing garage only and does not give approval for any demolition or rebuilding works.
Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan, Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, 8 - Special Qualities, 11 - Protection of Biodiversity, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and 29 - Sustainable Design.

9. External lighting may impact on the roosting and foraging bats and should be as dim as possible, on a sensor to reduce the amount of ‘on’ time and not point at roost access features or habitat corridors. A lighting scheme should be submitted to and agreed in writing by the LPA prior to the commencement of works no site.

10. The external surfaces of the building(s) shall be constructed of the materials specified on plans: Proposed Stable (stamped 7th October 2015), Proposed Extension and Alterations to Pengawse Isaf, Newport (stamped 7th October 2015). Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

Informative: A licence will be required from NRW to undertake the work. More detail will be required by NRW at the time of licensing in relation to materials, location of internal roost features and timing. To ensure the development is in accordance with the details agreed here a copy of the approved licence issued by Natural Resources Wales pursuant to Regulation 53 of the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations (2010) should be submitted to the LPA prior to the commencement of works to the property.
PROPOSED STABLE TO REPLACE SHED AT PENGAWSE ISAF, NEWPORT 1:50