Application Ref: NP/14/0708

Case Officer: Caroline Bowen
Applicant: Mr E Williams, Pembrokeshire County Council
Agent: Mr A Humphreys, Atkins
Proposal: Flood alleviation scheme to involve the installation of rock armour along the eastern sea wall, with a wave return top section fixed on top. Construction of a new central wall to join the two sea walls, a new culvert built along the existing slipway, installation of a flood gate and a small section of sea wall to be tied into the western sea wall. Associated regrading and landscape works to build up beach profile in front of the western sea wall, to extend and landscape the village green and the provision of a replacement timber footbridge. Provision of a site compound within Little Haven car park.

Site Location: Grove Place, Little Haven, Haverfordwest, Pembrokeshire
Grid Ref: SM85681293
Date Valid: 19-Dec-2014  Target Date: 12-Feb-2015

Summary

This application is presented to Committee at the request of the Head of Development Management, as the Community Council, who originally did not object, has now indicated that it supports the residents’ petition, which is not to go ahead with the scheme.

Planning permission is sought for a range of engineering works to provide flood defence works for the village of Little Haven. The application site is located on the western coastline, south west of Broad Haven, and falls within the Rural Centre of Little Haven for the purposes of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan. The proposed works will be carried out directly adjacent to the Newgale to Little Haven Site of Special Scientific Interest, and the Pembrokeshire Marine Special Area of Conservation.

Following consultation, a number of objections have been received to the proposal, which raise concerns in respect of the impact that the flood defence works will have on the appearance and amenity of the beach itself, and to residents and visitors who use the beach for a variety of activities.

The application site borders a designated Special Area of Conservation and SSSI; and an Habitats Regulations Assessment (HRA) has been carried out under Regulation 61 of the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010, where there is a legal requirement to consider the impacts of a plan or project on a European site where it is not directly connected with the management of the site. In this context the term ‘plan or project’ includes development proposals or anything else that could result in an activity that could have implications for the integrity of a European site and the Natura
2000 network. The HRA concluded that an Appropriate Assessment was not required, and that the project could proceed subject to conditions.

Officers consider that sufficiently detailed information has been submitted with the planning application to demonstrate that the proposed engineering works are reasonably required for the flood defences of the properties nearest to the beach. The objection received following consultation have been considered in detail – whilst the proposed development would inevitably impact upon the existing appearance of the small beach, and would result in residents and visitors having to change how they use and enjoy the beach, on balance, it is considered that the continuing flooding of the properties nearest the beach is disruptive to the use and enjoyment of those properties. In light of this, it is considered that the proposal can be supported, subject to conditions.

Consultee Response

The Havens Community Council: Reply - The Havens responded on the 12th January 2015, recommending support. A copy of an emailed letter to the applicant was forwarded to the National Park Authority on the 13th April 2015, in which the Community Council advised that in view of the petition, the Community Council have held further discussions with representatives from the Little Havens residents and after considering their comments, I must advise you that the Council wish to fully support the residents decision not to go ahead with the scheme.

Natural Resources Wales: Reply - No objection, subject to the implementation of appropriate construction management and pollution controls; and to the undertaking of a Habitats Regulations Assessment prior to a decision being made.

PCNPA - Access Manager: Reply - Advertise as Affecting a Public Footpath as within the red site line.

PCNPA - Estates Officer: Reply - No objection, subject to full details of the temporary storage compound being agreed prior to the commencement of development.

PCNPA - National Trail Officer: Reply - Not to be obstructed by materials, recommend that the work be carried out of main season.

PCC - Common Land Officer: Reply - No objection - it will be for the landowner and applicant to satisfy themselves that any proposed works are not in breach of the legislation.

PCC - Transportation & Environment: No objection

PCNPA - Park Direction - Minerals: No objection

Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional Consent
PCNPA - Ecologist: Conditional Consent - The Habitats Regulations Assessment was carried out and the proposed development did not require appropriate assessment, subject to a condition requiring a Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) to be submitted and agreed by the National Park Authority prior to the commencement of works.

PCNPA - Access Manager: Conditional Consent

PCNPA - Buildings Conservation Officer: Conditional Consent

Public Response

A site notice was posted in accordance with statutory requirements, and neighbouring properties notified by letter. Two residents have written to express concern at the proposal, and a petition of 125 signatures was received, who oppose the proposed new sea defences and wish to discuss future less invasive actions. The main issues raised are;

- Impact on boat parking, and the use of the beach for boat users and RNLI
- Appalling in appearance, and would impact the Conservation Area setting.
- The works would make the beach inaccessible at high tide.
- Rock armour would be unsafe to beach users
- The proposed culvertting of the stream with the proposed grating at the outlet will change the environment of the stream outlet.

One of the objections did not object to the principle of the proposed scheme, but did raise the same concerns as above, and concern at appropriate long term management being carried out.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembroke Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 34 - Flooding and Coastal Inundation

Constraints

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m
Site of Special Scientific Interest - within 50m
Technical Advice Note 15
LDP Mineral Safeguard
LDP Open Space
Biodiversity Issue
VILLAGE-GREENS
Safeguarding Zone
Rights of Way Inland - within 50m
Hazardous Zones

Officer’s Appraisal

Background

The small beach at Little Haven lies to the south of St Brides Bay, within the rocky western coastline of Pembrokeshire. To the north lies the more expansive beach of Broad Haven, and the Marloes and Dale headland lies to the south. The application site is a small enclosed bay, sheltered by Borough Head.

The village has historically suffered from flooding through overtopping of the seawall, direct flooding via the existing slipway and through the gap in the seawall at the top of the foreshore (which currently provides beach access). Tidal flooding regularly affects two properties to the west of the outfall onto the beach, with properties to the east also affected by overtopping of the sea wall. Extreme tidal events can have an impact further into the village.

Relevant Planning History

There is no recent planning history for the site

Constraints.

- Special Area of Conservation
- Site of Special Scientific Interest
- Flooding
- LDP Mineral Safeguard
- LDP Open Space
- Biodiversity
- Village Green
- Safeguarding Zone
- Rights of Way Inland
- Hazardous Zone
- Conservation Area

Current Proposal

The proposed works comprise;

- The construction of a new culvert (alongside the existing slipway) from the existing stream outfall under the bridge at the top of the beach. This will require a concrete slab to be laid, on which the culvert will be built. The concrete slab will be supported by approximately 60 piles driven into the beach to a depth of approximately 5 – 6 metres.
The construction of scour rock armour protection in front of the new culvert.

Placement of a length of 45 metres of rock armour defences along the seawall to the east of the slipway. These defences will be approximately 4.5 metres high and extend between approximately 3.5 and 6.5 metres onto the foreshore.

The construction of approximately 17 metres of new seawall (4 metres on the western side of the slipway and 13 metres across the central portion) with wave return coping top section.

The realignment of the central portion of the coastal frontage, including creating made ground, backfilled with approximately 100 cubic metres of material, to allow the eastern and western seawalls to meet at the top of the slipway. This will also encompass the extension and landscaping of the village green.

The installation of a flood gate at the top of the slipway

Drainage improvement works within Little Haven village

A temporary construction compound within Little Haven car park.

Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:-

- Principle of development
- Policy
- Impact on the Conservation Area setting
- Siting and Design
- Amenity and Privacy
- Access and Parking
- Landscaping
- Biodiversity
- Other material considerations

Principle of Development

The proposed flood defence works seek to address the continued physical impact of tidal flooding and overtopping of the existing sea wall. The chosen means of defence aims to improve on the defences currently provided by the existing sea wall by specifically addressing fluvial and wave ‘run-up’ impact on the village.

The creation of a new culvert from the existing stream outfall will extend the outfall of the culvert to below the shingle line on the beach, and will reduce the occurrence of shingle impeding the discharge from the stream. To reduce the impact from waves overtopping, the existing sea wall is extended and has a wave return coping installed, together with the installation of a flood gate. The existing shingle bank will be built up on the western part of the beach in front of the seawall, in order to prevent shingle being deposited within the highway bridge area and blocking the stream outfall.
The works will inevitably have an impact on the existing landscape setting, as rock armour will be installed to support the seawall and culvert, and the works to provide a new section of seawall will involve the realignment of the coastal frontage. The scheme will result in resident and visitors having to adapt to a new coastal profile and it is recognised that some activities will no longer be able to be carried out, namely the mooring of small boats off the seawall. The works are to prevent the continuous flooding of the properties and village nearest to the beach, and this issue is considered to outweigh the recreational uses, which could continue, but in an alternative form. The option to increase the height of the seawall was discounted at an early stage on the discussions, as this would have an impact on the aspect over the beach. On balance, the works are considered essential, and officers accept the principle of the development.

Policy

Whilst the Local Development Plan should be read as a whole, the following policies are considered to be of most relevance;

8 – Special Qualities: This policy seeks to protect the landscape characteristics that define the National Park, and is supported by Supplementary Planning Guidance on Landscape Character Assessment. The application site falls within Landscape Character Area 12 – St Brides Bay, which covers a very large area rolling lowland and associated coastal cliffs and beaches. Little Haven is a small village tucked into a sheltered bay, and has a strong sense of place for both residents and visitors. The proposed works will modify the coastal setting but, given that the works are to protect the village from on-going tidal and fluvial flooding and are natural appearance, the impact on the landscape can be accepted.

15 – Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park: Criterion "b" advises that development should not be insensitively or unsympathetically sited within the landscape, criterion "c" that development should not introduce or intensify a use which is incompatible with its location and/or, in criterion "d", development should harmonise with or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park. The proposed flood defences will have a visual impact on the setting, but the development will retain the small village green and beach area beyond the rock armour, which is compatible with the existing use of the site.

30 – Amenity: states that development will not be permitted where, in criterion “b”, the development is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings and/or criterion “d” that the development is visually intrusive. Whilst the structure will be visible, it is not of an appearance which would be incompatible with the coastal character at this setting. Furthermore, coastal defence works are being carried out along the coastline of Pembrokeshire, and it is accepted that the coastal landscape is changing in character.

Policy 34(b) refers to the issue of Flooding and Coastal Inundation, and advises that the sustainable defence of the coast will be permitted to protect
Item 5b) - Report on Planning Applications

existing communities or assets where practicable, and where they do not jeopardise the longer term and natural evolution of the coast. In the Shoreline Management Plan for the West of Wales, it advises that it can be argued that improved defences at Little Haven in the short term could be justified but highlights that this may not be sustainable in the longer term due to predicted sea level rises.

The critical element of this proposal is that it is a response to continued tidal and fluvial flooding, which is disruptive and damaging. It is considered, therefore that despite the inevitable visual impact of the works, the weight that can be afforded to the protection the works will afford to existing communities and assets means that they are in accordance with the policies of the Local Development Plan.

Siting and Design

The siting of the flood defences has been chosen after analysis of the impact and frequency of flooding events on the village, and the proposed works directly address the gaps in the current sea wall, and slipway. In respect of design, information provided with the application advises that discussion was held prior to the submission of a planning application on the options for the flood defence works, and that an increase in the height of the existing sea wall was discounted as it was considered that this would obstruct the existing public views of the beach and sea. The use of rock armour is more natural than an engineered formal wall structure, and the alterations to the sea wall and installation of flood gates will not significantly increase the overall height of the existing structure, and the associated works to the culvert would not create a profile that would be unacceptable in the existing coastal landscape.

Impact on the Conservation Area setting

The application site falls within the Little Haven Conservation Area boundary, with the key historic features identified as the sea walls and the 19th century bridge. The Authority’s Conservation Officer was consulted and made no objection but recommended that conditions would be required to deal with the stonework detail, the finishes of the proposed flood gates and the specification of the proposed rails.

Access

The existing vehicular access will be disrupted temporarily by the works, but otherwise will be unaffected by the proposal. The Highways Planning Liaison Officer was consulted on the proposal, and advised that there was no objection to the proposal on highways grounds as the works would not alter the route of the adopted road.

Biodiversity

The application site falls within the protected sites of the Afordir Site of Special Scientific Interest and the Pembrokeshire Marine Special Area of...
Conservation (a European designation); consequently under Regulation 61 of the Conservation of Habitats and Species Regulations 2010 ("Habitats Regulations") there is a legal requirement to consider the impacts of a plan or project on a European site where it is not directly connected with the management of the site. In this context the term 'plan or project' includes development proposals or anything else that could result in an activity that could have implications for the integrity of a European site and the "Natura 2000" network of Special Areas of Conservation. The appropriate Habitats Regulations Assessment has been carried out, and has concluded that an Appropriate Assessment is not required.

Other material considerations

Construction of the flood defences, and associated storage compounds
Given the confined site area, a contractor's compound will be required, and will be temporarily sited to the southern end of the existing PCNPA car park. Whilst the construction works are considered to have a high visual impact on the landscape setting, this is considered to be temporary with no long term visual impact; and a detailed schedule of construction works can be subject of a condition of the planning permission, to ensure that disturbance is kept to the minimum necessary.

Common Land

The proposed development will affect registered Common Land, however, where works are carried out to assist in the enjoyment of recreation, this would not contravene the requirements. This would fall outside of the direct remit of the planning system.

Response to public objection

In respect of the concerns raised during the public consultation of the proposal, the issues raised have been considered carefully in the preparation of this report.

It is recognised that the carrying out the proposed works to improve the flood defences for the village, will impact on the way that both residents and visitors currently use and enjoy the beach and coastal landscape. Little Haven is a small sheltered beach and attracts a large number of visitors in summer.

This use has to be considered against the issue of flooding, which is shown in the application submission to be harmful to the lower part of the village and to nearby residents. It is considered that the use of the beach can adapt to the addition of the proposed flood defences, but, if left to flood, the ability to use this beach may cease to exist at all. In light of this, while the level of public concern expressed is noted, it is not considered sufficient to outweigh the considerations supporting recommendation of approval.
Conclusion

The works will inevitably have an impact on the existing landscape setting, as rock armour will be installed to support the seawall and culvert and the works to provide a new section of seawall will involve the realignment of the coastal frontage. The scheme will result in residents and visitors having to adapt to a new coastal profile and it is recognised that some activities will no longer be able to be carried out, namely the mooring of small boats off the seawall. The works are to prevent the continuous flooding of the properties and village nearest to the beach, and this issue has to be considered to outweigh the recreational uses, which could continue, but in an alternative form. The option to increase the height of the seawall was discounted at an early stage of the discussions with the local community, held prior to the submission of this planning application, as this would have an impact on the aspect over the beach. On balance, the works are considered essential and officers accept the principle of the development.

Recommendation

That the application be approved subject to the following conditions

1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.
   **Reason:** Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).

2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents: 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0100 Rev P1, 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0101 Rev P1, 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0102 Rev P1, 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0103 Rev P1 – received 19th Dec 2014, 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0104 Rev P3 – received 23rd Jan 2015, 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0105 Rev P1, 5133202-ATK-XX-ZZ-DR-C-0106 Rev P1 – received 21st Jan 2015.
   **Reason:** In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

3. No development shall commence, including any works of demolition, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The approved statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period. The statement shall provide details of;
   i) the proposed period of operation,
   ii) the hours of use
   iii) the proposed footprint of the compound, which shall not extend over any soft landscaping surfaces:
   iv) the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors;
v) loading and unloading of plant and materials;
vi) storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development;
vii) the erection and maintenance of security hoarding including decorative displays and facilities for public viewing, where appropriate;
viii) wheel washing facilities;
ix) measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during demolition and construction; and
x) a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works.
xii) appropriate pollution controls

Reason: To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway, danger to road users, to conserve public health and local amenity, to ensure satisfactory standard of sustainable development and in order to ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area.

Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 25 (Recycled, Secondary and Waste Materials), 29 (Sustainable Design), 30 (Amenity), 31 (Minimising Waste) and 53 (Impacts of Traffic).

4. No development (including any works of demolition), shall begin until a Construction Environmental Management Plan has been submitted to and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The approved plan shall be adhered to throughout the construction period.

Reason: To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway, danger to road users, to conserve public health and local amenity, to ensure satisfactory standard of sustainable development and in order to ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area.

Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 25 (Recycled, Secondary and Waste Materials), 29 (Sustainable Design), 30 (Amenity), 31 (Minimising Waste) and 53 (Impacts of Traffic).

5. Prior to the construction of the flood defence works hereby approved details of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the stonework, rails and flood gates shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area.

Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).