SUBJECT: MEMBERS' DUTIES IN DETERMINING APPLICATIONS

1. The purpose of this report is to briefly summarise the role of this Committee within the planning system.

2. The planning system is a statutory code which regulates the rights of landowners and others interested in land in order to ensure that the development and use of land reflects the public interest. Planning decisions must be made in accordance with its provisions.

3. The public interest is expressed through the development plan. Currently, the plan for the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park is the Local Development Plan adopted by this Authority in September 2010. The law requires planning decisions to be taken in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

4. Material considerations can be:

   (a) National planning policy, which is set out in Planning Policy Wales and the accompanying Technical Advice Notes.

   (b) Considerations relating to the planning history of a site, highways, nature conservation, noise, loss of privacy, the layout, design and appearance of a proposed development, and any effects on a listed building or conservation area.

   (c) The need to conserve and enhance the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Park, and to promote opportunities for the understanding and enjoyment of the special qualities of the National Park by the public.

5. Non-material considerations must be disregarded when taking planning decisions. For example, issues such as loss of view, or negative effect on the value of properties, are not material considerations. Personal circumstances are only very rarely material to planning decisions.

6. From 1st April 2016 public bodies have a statutory duty to carry out Sustainable Development under the new Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 by meeting well-being objectives and achieving the well-being goals listed in the act. Members must demonstrate that they have applied the sustainable development principle when reaching planning decisions, in that they seek to ensure that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.

7. The Human Rights Act 1998 incorporated into domestic law the rights set out in the European Convention on Human Rights. Provided that Members apply the statutory code lawfully and in a fair and impartial manner, they will have complied with their statutory duties under the Planning Acts and will thereby also have acted in accordance with the Human Rights Act 1998.
8. The Authority has also adopted a Members' Planning Code of Good Practice, which explains and supplements the statutory Members' Code of Conduct in the context of the planning system. It is important that Members ensure that they apply the guidance contained in the Planning Code of Good Practice whilst carrying out their statutory duties.
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

Application Ref: NP/16/0364/FUL

Case Officer Kate Attrill
Applicant Mr & Mrs Beynon
Agent Mr D Brown, Mango Planning & Development Ltd
Proposal Proposed dwelling (Class C3) and associated works.
Site Location Zion Gardens, St Johns Hill, Tenby, Pembrokeshire, SA70 8HE
Grid Ref SN13040086
Date Valid 11-Jul-2016 Target Date 04-Sep-2016

Summary

The application is being brought before Committee as the Officer recommendation differs to the Community Council support for the scheme.

The site lies centrally within Tenby, and is enclosed by a substantial dressed stone wall. The site currently benefits from a temporary consent for seven static caravans which have been situated on the site under a variety of temporary consents since the site was first given planning approval for redevelopment in the 1970's.

The single dwelling proposed is considered to be an under-development of the site, which could be providing multiple dwellings and allowing for on-site affordable housing provision and is also out of character with the scale and density of surrounding residential development. The application as submitted is therefore considered to be an inappropriate development on this site and is not supported.

Consultee Response

Tenby Civic Society Chairman: Concern
PCNPA - Park Direction: Concern - Contrary to policies contained within the LDP.
PCC - Drainage Engineers: Advised on drainage

Tenby Civic Society Chairman: Broadly supportive for an unashamedly modern design hidden inside the high walls of the former walled garden of Sion House is to be welcomed.....

With two exceptions the design has much to recommend it.....(full comments summarised) so our view is that the proposal should be amended

a) to remove the need for a third storey and reduce the building's height and visibility from the other side of the existing old walls (especially from the north east and the north west):

b) there is space in the site to move the garage to beside the proposed turning area and to move the house down the slope to join with it

Could not some compact (affordable) housing units for local rent be housing in the site within the same tree, walls and drain easement constraints? The compact houses of adjoining Rectory Court illustrate the possibilities.
PCNPA - Tree and Landscape Officer: Conditional Consent
Dyfed Archaeological Trust: Conditional Consent
PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent
Tenby Town Council: Approve
PCNPA - Ecologist: No adverse comments

Public Response

The application was advertised in accordance with the requirements of The Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012 by a site notice on the 22nd July 2016 and neighbouring properties were written to.

A letter of representation was received from an adjoining property concerned with potential loss of privacy to the rear of their house and garden, the scale of the proposed dwelling, and potential risks to the stone wall which forms their boundary. The applicant has amended the plans to reduce the impact on neighbouring properties and no further objections have been received.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page
Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website -
http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 02 - Tenby Local Service and Tourism Centre
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 12 - Welsh Language
LDP Policy 13 - Historic Landscapes Parks and Gardens
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage
LDP Policy 44 - Housing
LDP Policy 45 – Affordable housing
PPW8 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions
PPW8 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
PPW8 Chapter 09 - Housing
SPG04 - Planning Obligations
SPG05 - Sustainable Design
TAN 13 - Tourism
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

TAN 22 - Planning for Sustainable Buildings

Constraints

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m
Biodiversity Issue
Hazardous Zones
Potential for surface water flooding
LDP Centre: 60pc aff housing; 30 units/ha
Recreation Character Areas

Officer's Appraisal

Relevant Planning History

In 1972 planning permission was granted for development of the application site and its adjoining land (to the west) for the erection of 26 holiday units, a private flat and detached house. The permission was part implemented in that the development to the west of the application site was completed although development was not carried out on the land subject of this application. A condition was attached to the planning permission restricting the use of the holiday units approved as holiday accommodation to not be used between the periods 1st March to 30th November and 14th December to 14th January in any year.

In 1991 an application was submitted to remove a holiday letting condition attached to the main planning permission for the site (TB/1707). The application sought removal of the condition from 10 of the completed holiday lets to allow for full residential use in the west portion of the site. It did not include the land subject of this application and planning permission was approved subject to additional details being submitted in respect of any external changes and removal of permitted development rights of the residential units.

Since that time the site has been used for the siting of 7 static caravans which has been granted permission through a succession of temporary planning permissions. The last temporary permission was granted in January 2016 and was given for a 12 month period which expires in January 2017.

In respect of the current application for a single dwelling, the Authority has responded to two pre-application requests, one made in January 2011 (PA/035/11) for a proposed residential development on the site, when the enquirer was advised of the current adopted Local Development Plan which prioritises the need for Affordable Housing in all new residential developments and another in 2015 (PA/15/0260) for a large single dwelling. The LPA responded in 2015 to the effect that the proposals represented an under-development of a site within the town centre which could provide affordable housing in a sustainable location, the agent was informed of the £250 per square metre commuted sum category for the area, and invited further pre-application discussions prior to submitting an application.
History

- PA/15/0260 – Pre-application for a large single dwelling – response sent 25th August 2015
- NP/12/0075 – Application for Removal of condition: The use of the holiday units to be restricted to the periods 1st March to 30th November and 14th December to 14th January in each year to allow the erection of the units with no restriction. This would enable their use for permanent accommodation as opposed to only holiday accommodation. Recommended for refusal but non-determination appeal lodged and then withdrawn.
- PA/035/11 – Zion Gardens, Tenby – 4 Residential Properties – Pre Application Advice given on 11 March 2011
- NP/10/426 – Land at Zion Gardens, Tenby – Renewal of temporary consent for NP/05/375 for caravan site – Approved 24 November 2010
- NP/05/375 – Zion Gardens Caravan Site, Tenby – Renewal of temporary consent NP/00/149 for caravan site – Approved – 26 September 2005
- NP/00/149 – Zion Gardens Caravan Site, Tenby - Caravan site (renewal of consent) – Approved – 25 May 2000
- NP/390/91 – Zion Gardens Apartments, Tenby – Change of use from holiday to permanent residential dwellings – Approved – 9 August 1991
- TB/1707 – Zion Gardens, Tenby – Use of land for erecting 28 holiday units and house – Approved 29 August 1972

Description of Proposal

The design proposes a large single dwelling of contemporary design featuring an almost entirely glazed frontage on a partial stone plinth which takes into account the multiple levels of the site, with a monopitch roof and a large flat roofed area to the southern end and over the parking area to provide a terrace first floor terrace.

The flat roof is described as ‘alumasc green roofing system’ with a metal monopitch on second floor with electricity and water panels system, cedar cladding to the south east and north east elevations and natural stone walling to replicate the walls surrounding the site.
The interior design incorporates lower ground undercroft parking for three cars with a lower level plant and utility area, a raised ground floor living area with a master bedroom and three further bedrooms on the first floor above.

**Key Issues**

The application raises the following planning matters:

- Policy and Principle of Development
- Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park
- Amenity and Privacy
- Landscaping
- Archaeology
- Affordable Housing Contribution

**Policy:**

The site is within the Centre of Tenby, as defined in the Local Development Plan and is currently used as a small caravan park.

Policy 2 of the Local Development Plan sets out the strategic policy position for Tenby and includes the aim to meet the housing (and in particular affordable housing) needs of the local area. The principle of housing development in this location would be acceptable as the surrounding land is largely residential.

The proposal is for a large, single dwelling with a modern design. The site is contained within the built area of Tenby and is accessed through a narrow lane which currently serves eleven dwellings on the western side of the original site, and seven static caravans on the proposed site.

Whilst it may well be that the site cannot be developed at a density of 30 plots per hectare, as required by Policy 44 of the Local Development Plan the use of the site for a single dwelling represents under-development of the land. Sites such as this are rare in Tenby and there are opportunities to make use of the land to fulfil the strategy for the town, as set out in Policy 2 of the Local development Plan. Whilst a modern design may be acceptable here, efficient use of the land which respects the amenity of the users of surrounding properties is required. The current application fails to do this and therefore is contrary to policies 2 and 44 of the Local Development Plan.

**Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park**

Planning Policy Wales (edition 8, January 2016) makes the following statements on design which are considered relevant to this application:

4.11.5 **Good design should promote the efficient use of resources, including land.** It should seek to maximise energy efficiency and the efficient
use of other resources, minimise the use of non-renewable resources and minimise the generation of waste and pollution.

4.11.9 The visual appearance of proposed development, its scale and its relationship to its surroundings and context are material planning considerations. Local planning authorities should reject poor building and contextual designs. However, they should not attempt to impose a particular architectural taste or style arbitrarily and should avoid inhibiting opportunities for innovative design solutions.

4.11.10 In areas recognised for their landscape, townscape or historic value, such as National Parks, Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty and conservation areas, and more widely in areas with an established and distinctive design character, it can be appropriate to seek to promote or reinforce traditional and local distinctiveness. In those areas the impact of development on the existing character, the scale and siting of new development, and the use of appropriate building materials (including where possible sustainably produced materials from local sources), will be particularly important. The impact of development on listed buildings should be given particular attention.

TAN12 at paragraph 4.9 states that: Opportunities for innovative design will depend on the existing context of development and the degree to which the historic, architectural, social or environmental characteristics of an area may demand or inhibit a particular design solution. Thorough appraisal of context can provide design pointers, which help to inspire an innovative design response, which meets present and future needs. A contextual approach should not necessarily prohibit contemporary design.

A modern design, in itself would be acceptable here, as the area already has a mix of designs which have developed over the years with no one type being particularly characteristic of the area. The proposed property however, is of significant proportions which puts it very much at odds with the scale and density of the neighbouring buildings, and as such is considered to be out of character with the surroundings, contrary to Policy 15 criteria a and b, and Policy 8 criterion b of the Local Development Plan.

Amenity and Privacy:

Policy 30 of the Local Development Plan seeks to protect amenity enjoyed by people in their homes, workspaces and recreational areas and prevent development which is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings.

As described above, the scale of the dwelling has been considered to be out of character with the immediate surroundings, and by virtue of its height and siting.

The rear elevation of the dwelling has been amended during the course of the application to provide high level windows on the eastern (rear) elevation in response to objections from neighbouring properties concerned about privacy.
The dwelling proposed is considered to be poorly design in response to its setting. The application is therefore considered to be contrary to Policy 30, criteria b and d.

Landscaping:

Tree Preservation Order 63 is on and immediately adjacent to the proposed development site, and so the Authority's Tree and Landscape Officer was consulted with regards the application and the arboricultural details originally provided. Based on his comments, a further revised plan was then received on the 1st August 2016.

The summary of the consultation response is that there would be no objection to the proposed development if carried out based upon the documents received and following provision of further information relating to Landscaping which can be conditioned. A condition is recommended requiring details of the soft landscaping to be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Archaeology:

Dyfed Archaeology's consultation response on the application is copied below:

We have checked this proposal against the Regional Historic Environment Record, which currently stands at over 55,000 sites of archaeological and historical interest. These records have been formally adopted by resolution of your Authority for the purposes of the Town & Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995.

This search has revealed that the site in question lies within close proximity to several sites of historical and archaeological interest including the possible site of a medieval hospital, the extent of which is currently unknown (PRN 3691).

Consequently there is a strong possibility that archaeological material, may extend into the application area and that any remains surviving as buried archaeological features will clearly be adversely affected by the proposed development, should consent be forthcoming. In addition, in view of the proximity of the development to a designated heritage asset, we recommend that you consult with Cadw on the issue of the impact on the setting of this statutorily protected monument.

In order to protect potential archaeological interests, we recommend that a Grampian style condition should be attached to the application, should consent be given.

Cadw's comments will be verbally reported to Committee if they have been received before the date of Committee.
Affordable Housing:

Planning Policy Wales at para 9.2.14 states that: ‘a community’s need for affordable housing is a material planning consideration which must be taken into account in formulating development plan policies. Affordable housing for the purposes of the land use planning system is housing where there are secure mechanisms in place to ensure that it is accessible to those who cannot afford market housing, both on first occupation and for subsequent occupiers.

Where a single dwelling is proposed, Local Development Plan Policy 45 requires the applicant to make a contribution toward affordable housing, which is calculated on gross internal floor space.

The initial pre application advice offered in 2015 suggested that multiple units would enable for on-site affordable housing and the applicants agent (at that time) was invited to discuss alternative proposals, but the current application was submitted without opportunity for further discussion.

The application site falls within the £150 per square metre commuted sum area as defined in the Supplementary Planning Guidance. The applicant has claimed that the site restrictions are such that is not viable to be developed (for the current single dwelling) and to allow for the affordable housing contribution, and has begun the process of submitting viability information, but at the date of report writing, the information had not been submitted in full and thus could not be assessed.

On the basis of the current proposals, and excluding the lower parking level, the footprint of the dwelling at 339 square metres (approx.) would result in a commuted sum of £50,000. At the time of writing this report, and based on the lack of a valid Unilateral Undertaking and/or commitment to pay the affordable housing contribution, contrary to the requirement of Policy 45, this would constitute a further reason for refusal. Further information may be submitted by the date of Planning Committee which will be verbally reported to Committee.

Conclusion

The proposed design is an interesting contemporary design, but has not been designed to take into account the local character in terms of density, scale or proportion. The dwelling does not make the most efficient use of the site and represents an under development of the site in a sustainable location contrary to Local Development Plan policy and as such is recommended for refusal.
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

Recommendation

REFUSE, for the following reason(s):

1. The proposed dwelling is out of character with the scale and density of the surroundings, and as such is in conflict with the principles of good design as espoused by Welsh Government guidance within TAN12, Planning Policy Wales (Edition 8, January 2016), and Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan Policy 2, criteria a and e, Policy 44, Policy 15 a and b.

2. The application has failed to provide a valid Unilateral Undertaking and/or commitment to contribute towards affordable housing as required by Policy 45 d. As such the proposal is contrary to LDP Policy 45 of the Local Development Plan d and Supplementary Planning Guidance 04.
This Plan includes the following Licensed Data: OS Master-Map Black and White PDF Location Plan by the Ordnance Survey National Geographic Database and incorporating surveyed revision available at the date of production. Reproduction in whole or in part is prohibited without the prior permission of Ordnance Survey. The representation of a road, track or path is no evidence of a right of way. The representation of features, as lines is no evidence of a property boundary. © Crown copyright and database rights, 2015. Ordnance Survey 20100031573

Scale: 1:500, paper size: A4

RW 110104
Tenby
www.mangoplanning.com
October 2015
Item 5b) Report on Planning Applications

Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

Application Ref: NP/16/0377/FUL

Case Officer: Caroline Bowen
Applicant: Mr I Izzard
Agent: Glamping site of 10 bell tents with toilet & shower block
Proposal: (retrospective)
Site Location: Beavers Retreat, Beavers Hill, The Ridgeway,
Manorbier, Tenby, Pembrokeshire, SA70 8LQ
Grid Ref: SS05779971
Date Valid: 14-Jul-2016	Target Date: 07-Sep-2016

Summary

This planning application is reported to committee at the request of a member of the Development Management Committee, as it is considered that the application would assist the economic stability of Jameston and the surrounding area and would boost the choice of holiday accommodation in the Pembrokeshire area.

The application site comprises land located in a countryside setting, north of the village of Jameston. Planning permission is sought in retrospect for the use of the land as a seasonal campsite, together with the provision of ancillary facilities comprising a gas powered showers and compost toilets.

Following public consultation, no letters of objection have been received to the application.

The proposal has been considered against the policies of the current Local Development Plan, and whilst the applicant has sought to justify the retention of the campsite in this particular instance, the main Local Development Plan policy 38 – Camping, Touring Caravans, Statics and Chalet Sites - which is relevant to this proposal - is not criteria-based, and is clear that no new camping sites would be supported. There are no material considerations put forward by the applicant that would be considered to outweigh the very clear policy position regarding such developments. As such, the application cannot be supported by officers, and the recommendation is for refusal.

Consultee Response

PCNPA - Park Direction: Objecting - The proposal is contrary to adopted Local Development Plan policy.
Natural Resources Wales: Only grant planning permission for the scheme if it can meet requirements relating to the disposal of foul water and grey water, to address significant concerns that NRW have identified.
Manorbier Community Council: Reply
Dyfed Archaeological Trust: No objection
PCC - Transportation & Environment: No objection
PCNPA - Ecologist: No adverse comments

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 19 October 2016
Public Response

A site notice was posted in accordance with statutory requirements. No third party comments have been received.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 07 - Countryside
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage
LDP Policy 35 - Visitor Economy
LDP Policy 38 - Camping, Touring Caravans, Statics and Chalet Sites
LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic
PPW8 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions
PPW8 Chapter 07 - Economic Development
PPW8 Chapter 11 - Tourism, Sport and Recreation
SPG06 - Landscape
TAN 06 - Planning for Sustainable Rural Communities
TAN 12 - Design
TAN 13 - Tourism
TAN 23 - Economic Development

Constraints

LDP Mineral Safeguard
Historic Landscape
Potential for surface water flooding
Recreation Character Areas

Officer’s Appraisal

Background and site description

The application site is located on the eastern flank of the minor rural road linking Jameston to The Ridgeway to the north, and is immediately east of Beavers Hill Crossing, adjacent to the railway line. The site falls outside of any Centre or Rural Centre Boundary, as defined in the Pembrokeshire Coast
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

National Park Local Development Plan, and is in open countryside for policy purposes. The area of land, subject of this application, falls within the existing boundary for the property, Beavers Hill Farm.

The site itself measures approximately 0.99 hectares in area and is a broadly level field, bordered by mature hedgerow and trees to the west, north and east, and by the railway line to the south.

The application is made for retrospective planning permission, and the applicant states that the use began in June 2015.

Planning History

There are no related applications for this site.

Constraints

- LDP Mineral Safeguard
- Historic Landscape
- Potential for surface water flooding
- Recreation Character Area

Current proposal

Planning permission is sought for the retention of the following works;

- 10 bell tents
- 5 timber sheds on palettes, which provides two showers, compost toilets and washing up facilities.

The site operates between April and September, and the bell tents and associated picnic tables and bin facilities are removed from the site. The showers and toilets are kept on the land, but are unused.

Key issues

- Policy and principle of development.
- Amenity and privacy
- Access, parking and Highway Safety
- Drainage
- Biodiversity
- Other material considerations

Policy and Principle of development

Policy 7 states that development in the countryside will only be permitted where it would fall into one of eight categories. Criterion (e) allows tourist attractions or recreational activity where the need to locate in the countryside is essential.
Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) is a strategic policy which refers to the special qualities of the National Park and lists priorities to ensure that these special qualities will be protected and enhanced. This policy is supported by supplementary planning guidance on landscape assessment. The application site falls within Landscape Character Area (LCA) 4 – Manorbier/Freshwater East, which is a large tract of rolling lowland with an indented cliff coastline. The area is characterised as agricultural coastal hinterland of small to medium sized fields interdispersed with settlements; and which has a strong historical and cultural sense of place. The management guidance suggests that the area is generally in a well maintained condition and that tourism development in the landscape should be improved in its integration.

Policy 15 of the LDP seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria ‘a’ and ‘b’ resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion and/or, that would be insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape. It further resists development that would not be compatible with its location (criterion ‘c’), fail to harmonise with, or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park (criterion’d’).

Policy 30 of the LDP seeks to avoid development that is visually intrusive (criterion’d’).

Policy 35 reiterates Policy 7 and states that visitor attractions, recreational and leisure activities in the countryside will need to demonstrate why a countryside location is essential.

Policy 38 states that in the National Park, new camping, caravanning static caravan or chalet sites will not be permitted.

The use for which permission is sought is for seasonal camping, and the bell tents and associated paraphernalia are removed, as opposed to being permanent features of the landscape, at the end of the summer season. Whilst the toilet/shower facilities are currently kept on site all year round, they are capable of being removed from the site as they are not connected to mains services. However, there are mature trees and hedges surrounding the site to the east, north and west - the land offers an aspect toward a bank of trees to the south over the railway line and glimpses of the site are possible on approach from Jameston, however, the mature planting offers a good level of screening from the rural road and access, and the site is set well back inland from the more sensitive coastal belt. There are no immediate residential dwellings neighbouring the site.

However, Policy 38 is not criteria-based, and is clear in that no new camping sites would be allowed in the National Park. The context of this policy is set out in paragraph 4.168 of the LDP – the majority of caravan and camping sites are concentrated in the National Park, which occupies only 37% of the total land area of the County. In light of this, the proposal is contrary to policy 38 of the Local Development Plan, and cannot be supported, unless there