Item 5d) Application Ref: NP/16/0323/OUT

Case Officer: Kate Attrill
Applicant: Mr J Griffiths, Griffiths Associates Ltd
Agent: Mr G John, Geraint John Planning
Proposal: Outline application for a single two storey dwelling
Site Location: Keeping Stone, Feidr Ganol, Newport, Pembrokeshire, SA42 ORT
Grid Ref: SN04693936
Date Valid: 29-Jun-2016 Target Date: 23-Aug-2016

Summary
The application is brought before Committee as the Town Council view is contrary to the recommendation of the Case Officer.

The site is located on the corner of Feidr Brenin and Feidr Ganol adjacent to a two storey detached dwelling built in the 1970’s which lies in a large plot oriented to the north and east.

This planning application originally proposed a two storey detached dwelling with scale parameters of 7m to 13m x 8 to 16m with a height of 7m to 10m. The height parameters have been revised to indicate a minimum height of 6 metres and a maximum of 8.5.

The application follows on from a pre-application request for a dwelling to the south eastern side of the property. The opinion given from the LPA was that an application would not be supported in that location due principally to Policy issues, but also due to the presence of a TPO in the same position of the proposed access and the scale of the proposed dwelling being out of character with its surroundings. The applicant has not sought pre-application advice on the site of the current application.

The application is not supported as it is contrary to Policies 1, 7, 11, 8, 15, and 30 of the Local Development Plan.

Consultee Response
PCNPA - Tree and Landscape Officer: Reply - Further information required
PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent
PCC - Ecologist: Conditional Consent
PCC - Drainage Engineers: Conditional Consent
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional Consent - Request that if minded to grant a planning permission we include the following condition and advisory note: Condition: No surface water and/or land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage network
Reason: To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment
Advisory Note: The applicant may need to apply to Dwr Cymru / Welsh Water for any connection to the public sewer under S106 of the Water Industry Act 1991.
Newport Town Council: Approve

Public Response

The application was advertised by site notice and neighbour letters in accordance with the requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012.

A number of representations (five) have been received from neighbouring properties relating to:

- Overlooking to the bungalows from the elevated land at Keeping Stone
- Damage to the hedgerow
- Loss of natural habitat
- New house would become a holiday let
- New building would dominate surroundings
- Increased traffic
- Problems with sewage capacity
- The application being submitted with Certificate B being served on an owner who is currently unwell and unable to understand the development proposed
- The current house is being let and a new house in the grounds would reduce the letting potential
- Overbearing height of the dwelling compared to Keeping Stone
- Keeping Stone is an iconic architect designed house of the 1970’s based on a Swedish design which was set in large grounds to maximize the views which would be ruined if a modern house were built in its grounds

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 07 - Countryside
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 12 - Welsh Language
LDP Policy 14 - Protection of Buildings of Local Importance
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 44 - Housing
LDP Policy 45 – Affordable housing
PPW8 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

PPW8 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
PPW8 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
PPW8 Chapter 09 - Housing
SPG20 - Accessibility
TAN 12 - Design

Constraints
LDP Mineral Safeguard
Historic Landscape
Rights of Way Inland - within 50m
Recreation Character Areas

Officer's Appraisal

Site and Context
The site lies to the north west of Newport Town Centre at the western end of Feidr Ganol as it joins Feidr Brenin. The site is enclosed with mature hedgebanks which are a strong characteristic of the area.

To the south east of the site there is a terrace of two storey cottages dating from the 1800’s, and the development on Feidr Brenin to the north west is limited to single storey dwellings along the northern side of the road.

Description of Proposal
The application is submitted in outline, proposing a two storey detached dwelling with a new access off the enlarged access for Keeping Stone onto Feidr Brenin. Although a new enlarged access is shown, all matters (including) access are reserved for a future application, so the access shown needs to be considered as indicative. The submitted details show the hedgebank being translocated to widen the road, but no arboricultural survey to establish the acceptability of this element of the proposal has been received at the date of the report being written.

The existing 1970’s dwelling on the plot is located at an angle within a large garden, and dates from the 1970’s with main windows facing to the north west and north east. It is rendered with concrete tiles and a shallow pitched roof. The house has its living areas on the first floor with bedrooms at ground floor level and balconies to the north, west and south.

The indicative outline for the dwelling shows it sited to the north west of the existing dwelling, approximately 26 metres away, and 35 metres to the south-west of the dwelling Brynceriós. Apart from the indicative scale parameters submitted, no design details have been suggested.

Key Issues
The application raises the following planning matters:

- Policy and Principle of Development
- Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park
Item 5 - Report on Planning Applications

- Amenity and Privacy
- Landscaping
- Other Material Considerations

Policy:
Planning legislation requires all planning applications to be determined in accordance with the current development plan, unless there are material considerations that are considered to outweigh the policy position.

The current development plan for the National Park is the Local Development Plan adopted in 2010. Whilst the Plan should be read as a whole, the policies considered to be of most relevance to this application are 7: Countryside, 8: Special Qualities, 15: Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, and 30 for Amenity.

The key policy to determination of this proposal is Policy 7: for development in the countryside. 'Outside the identified Centres of the Local Development Plan area development will only be permitted where:

a) it constitutes sensitive filling in of small gaps or minor extensions (i.e. rounding off) to isolated groups of dwellings is proposed.

Priority will be given to meeting affordable housing needs. Release of land will depend on the character of the surroundings, the pattern of development in the area and the accessibility to the Centres identified in the hierarchy.

The subtext to Policy 7 at point 81 clarifies that the site must be 'compatible with its setting in a small gap in an otherwise continuous, built up frontage'. In the opinion of the case officer, the site does not form a 'gap' but is the end of a frontage within a clearly defined garden area which forms a clear break between the character of the bungalows along Feidr Brenin and the terraces and semi-detached houses along Feidr Ganol, and were the site to be redeveloped, it should be done with a more efficient use of land which would necessitate the removal of Keeping Stone and the land then being used for affordable housing as an exception site.

The size and height parameters of the proposed dwelling are higher than those of the immediately adjacent building, and as such, to approve a dwelling higher than both its immediate neighbour and the bungalows on the other side of Feidr Brenin would be out of character with the surroundings, and contrary to LDP Policies 7, 8, 15, and to the principles of TAN 12 (Design).

The principle of allowing new housing development along the southern side of Feidr Brenin, outside of the development boundary for Newport would likely lead to further development setting an unfortunate precedent for ribbon-type development which is entirely contrary to the Local Development Plan.

Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park
Policy 8 states that the special qualities of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park (PCNP) will be protected and enhanced with priorities to ensure that the pattern and diversity of the landscape and the historic environment are protected and enhanced.

Policy 15 relates to the Conservation of the PCNP and states that development will not be permitted where this would adversely affect the
qualities and special character of the PCNP by being insensitivity and unsympathetically sited within the landscape and failing to harmonise with, or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park.

This proposal and the subdivision of the land to incorporate an additional plot as set out above would result in the loss of the sense of space which is a characteristic of the original dwelling and of the low-scale and openness of the area. As such, the application would be contrary to policy 15 of the LDP, and be detrimental to the special qualities of the National Park area.

Amenity and Privacy:
Policy 30 states that development will not be permitted where it has an unacceptable impact on amenity, particularly where:

a) the development is for a use inappropriate for where people live or visit;
and/or
b) the development is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings; and/or
c) the development leads to an increase in traffic or noise or odour or light which has a significant adverse impact; and/or
d) the development is visually intrusive.

All three properties surrounding the development site have objected to the proposals on the basis of privacy and amenity.

Bryncerrion to the east of the proposal is a traditional dwelling set at a lower level than the development site which is oriented to west and east. The new dwelling is proposed (albeit indicatively) to be set some 35 metres away from the dwelling across the lane, and it is not considered that a reason for refusal at this distance would be reasonable.

Similarly, the dwellings to the north and south of the proposed site are both situated in excess of 25 metres away, so although the outlook from Keeping Stone itself would be impacted, the loss of a private view is not usually considered a justifiable reason for refusal. At such a distance, privacy and amenity would not be considered to be so severely impacted upon as to support a reason for refusal.

However, Policy 30 does specify that development should be at a scale in keeping with its surroundings, and the proposal as submitted does not respect the existing character of the area or the house and its setting within a substantial plot for which it was designed, and as such, this would form an additional reason for refusal.

Access and Parking:
The County Highways Officer has no objection to the application as submitted and has suggested 5 conditions be attached to any grant of planning permission.

Landscaping:
The application has failed to submit information detailing the existing trees and hedges on the boundaries to the site. The lack of details in respect of a tree survey in accordance with BS5837 prevents a full consideration of any possible impacts on retained trees and hedges that the development may have, and whether the translocation which is specified on the plans is
possible. Although the agent states that a survey is being carried out, at the date of writing the report, the absence of a survey means matters cannot be fully addressed and this forms a reason for refusal.

Other Material Considerations:
Affordable Housing

Where a single dwelling is proposed, Policy 45 requires the applicant to make a contribution toward affordable housing, which is calculated on gross internal floor space, and if an outline application, this must agree to the principle of the payment at the appropriate rate. The applicant's agent has verbally agreed to provide a Unilateral Undertaking since the application was received, but have not yet (at the point of this report being written) provided the unilateral undertaking.

Conclusion

The application to develop a house on this site is contrary to Policies 1, 7, 8, 15, 30 and 45 and represents both an underdevelopment of the site, a scale which is out of character with the surrounding area, and a sporadic form of development which is detrimental to the setting of the dwelling and the character of the area.

Recommendation

REFUSE, for the following reason(s):

Reasons

1. Policy 1 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan requires development to be compatible with the conservation or enhancement of the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Park. Policy 7 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seeks to only permit development where it constitutes sensitive filling in of small gaps to isolated groups of dwellings. Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seeks to protect the special qualities of the National Park, including amongst other things, the pattern and diversity of the landscape is protected and enhanced. Policy 15 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan states that development that adversely affects the qualities and special character of the National Park will not be permitted. The proposal by reason of its plot size and layout is considered to be out of character with the surrounding area to the detriment of the special landscape character of this part of the National Park which the National Park has a statutory duty to conserve and enhance. The proposal is therefore considered contrary to Policies 1 – National Park Purpose and Duty (Strategy Policy), criterion (a) of Policy 7 – Countryside (Tier 5) (Strategy Policy), criteria (b & d) of Policy 8 - Special Qualities, criteria (a, b & d) of Policy 15 – Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and criteria (a, b, c & d) of Policy 30 – Amenity.
2. Policy 1 of the Pembrokeshire Coast national Park Local Development Plan requires development to be compatible with the conservation or enhancement of the natural beauty, wildlife and cultural heritage of the National Park. Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan seeks to protect the special qualities of the National Park, including amongst other things, to ensure that the identity and character of towns and villages is not lost through coalescence and ribboning of development or through poor design and layout of development. Policy 29 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan requires development to be well designed in terms of place and local distinctiveness, materials and resources. The proposal by reason of the lack of detail and information on the existing landscape features on the submitted application is insufficient to enable a comprehensive assessment to be made of the proposed new dwelling, and its impact on existing landscaping within and adjacent to the site. This would result in the likely loss of mature vegetation to the detriment of the special landscape character of this part of the National Park which the National Park has a statutory duty to conserve and enhance.. The proposal is therefore considered contrary to Policies 1 – National Park Purpose and Duty (Strategy Policy), criterion (a) of Policy 7 – Countryside (Tier 5) (Strategy Policy), criteria (b & d) of Policy 8 - Special Qualities, criteria (a, b & d) of Policy 15 – Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park.

3. The scale parameters given for the dwelling propose a two storey dwelling which would be higher than the closest adjacent dwelling. As such, the scale of the dwelling is out of character to its immediate surroundings and likely to lead to visual detriment to the character of the area and to negatively impact on residential amenity to Keeping Stone contrary to Policy 30 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan.