Application Ref: NP/18/0198/FUL

Case Officer: Caroline Bowen
Applicant: Ms Owen Owen & Owen
Agent: Mr T McEwan, Murray John Architects
Proposal: Erection of a new bungalow
Site Location: Land at Mead Lane, Manorbier, Tenby, Pembrokeshire
Grid Ref: SS06629781
Date Valid: 28-Mar-2018  Target Date 06-Jun-2018

This application is reported to committee as the officer recommendation is contrary to that of the Community Council.

Consultee Response
PCNPA Tree and Landscape Officer: Further information required
Natural Resources Wales: No comment
CADW - Protection & Policy: No objection
Dyfed Archaeological Trust: Conditional Consent
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional Consent
PCNPA Buildings Conservation Officer: Conditional Consent
PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent
PCNPA Planning Ecologist: No comment
Manorbier Community Council: Recommend Refusal

Public Response
The application has been appropriately advertised in accordance with statutory requirements. A letter of objection has been received from neighbours to the application site, raising (in summary) the following land use planning concerns:

- Impact of development on visual amenity
- Effect on the character of the neighbourhood.
- Noise, disturbance, overlooking and loss of privacy to neighbouring property
- Structural impact of development on historic walls.
- Concern at the principle of the development within the Conservation Area and National Park.
- Concern at the chosen design and materials and their impact on neighbours and wider neighbourhood.
- Concern at the impact of noise and light of protected species that roost in and around this location.

Policies considered
Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 6th June 2018
LDP Policy 06 - Rural Centres
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage
LDP Policy 44 - Housing
LDP Policy 45 – Affordable housing
LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic
PPW9 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions
PPW9 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
PPW9 Chapter 09 - Housing
SPG08 - Affordable Housing
SPG17 - Conservation Area Proposals
TAN 02 - Planning and Affordable Housing
TAN 10 - Tree Preservation Orders
TAN 12 - Design

Constraints
LDP Mineral Safeguard
Biodiversity Issue
Historic Landscape
Safeguarding Zone
Rights of Way Inland - within 50m
Ancient Monument - within 50m
Hazardous Zones
LDP Centre:50pc aff housing;30 units/ha
Recreation Character Areas
Landscape Character Assessment

Officer’s Appraisal

Background
The application site is located to the northern flank of Mead Lane, and immediately
adjacent to its junction with the main B4585 which travels through the village. The
site is set out as a modest allotment garden, surrounded by low stone walls and
slopes down from north-east to south-west. There is an existing access to the
proposed plot itself which is at the eastern side of the site frontage to Mead Lane,
and is set away from the junction.

The plot falls to the entrance of an existing residential ‘no-through lane’, and is
surrounded by existing development. To the north lies Ashleigh House a residential
property, to the east lies another residential property, The Close. To the south, set
down in level below the application site is a hotel, Castle Mead. There are mature
trees to the western elevation facing the B4585.
A public right of way runs to the south of the site following the path of Mead Lane.

**History**

There is no planning history for the application site.

Pre-application advice was originally sought on the proposal, and officers advised that the principle of the development was acceptable in the Rural Centre. The dwelling is set back into the plot, which was considered to relate well to the existing built form of the village, and the retention of the garden to the front preserves a sense of openness to this corner of the village.

**Current Proposal**

Full planning application is sought for the creation of a single storey detached dwelling.

The new dwelling will be single storey in scale, and sited toward the rear of the plot. A small single storey studio will be positioned to the east of the house, with two parking spaces to its front. The access will remain unaltered, creating a short pull-in area of hard standing to the front of the new dwelling. All existing boundary walls will be retained.

**Key Issues**

The application raises the following planning matters:-

- Policy
- Scale, siting and design
- Impact on the Conservation Area setting
- Amenity and Privacy
- Access and parking
- Landscaping
- Biodiversity
- Drainage/Water issues
- Other material considerations

**Policy:**

The site lies within the Rural Centre boundary of Manorbier as defined under Policy 6 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan. One of the land use priorities of Policy 6 is to meet the housing needs of the Rural Centre as such the principle of a dwelling in this location is acceptable.

On proposals for a single residential dwelling, Policy 45 (d) states that, to deliver affordable housing, the Authority will - as part of the overall housing provision - seek a commuted sum to help with the delivery of affordable housing. For this proposal, the commuted sum is levied at £250 per square metre of gross internal floor space. The applicant indicates in the planning statement that they agree to the provision of an affordable housing sum.

**Scale, siting and design:**

Policy 15 refers to the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, with criteria (b) and (c) resisting development that would be insensitively and
unsympathetically sited within the landscape, and would introduce or intensify a use which is incompatible with its location. The scale of the new property is single storey, and, when viewed against the scale of existing dwellings in the wider street scene, the new property would be subservient in height. The proposed plot is considered to comparable with the existing plot sizes at this location, and, as such would be capable of being developed for a modest single dwelling. As the new dwelling would be set back into the site, its siting allows sufficient garden and amenity space for the household, and the retention of this space retains the open nature of the street scene.

In respect of the chosen design and external materials, the dwelling will take a simple rectangular shape with a pitched roof, which would be reminiscent of a traditional cottage. The materials and design are modern – the dwelling will be slate hung to roof and external walls, save for a section of glazing and timber to the front elevation. The adjacent studio will be timber clad.

**Impact on the Conservation Area setting:**

Policy 8 of the Local Development Plan states in criterion (d) that the historic environment should be protected and enhanced wherever possible. In the Authority’s Conservation Area Proposals guidance for Manorbier (adopted 2011), the site is identified as being important for its openness, its trees and having local features.

In light of its position in the Conservation Area, the Authority’s Conservation Officer was consulted. He has recommended conditional consent, advising that;

‘The application site is defined as important open space in the Conservation Area Proposals SPG. The trees to the west are also important to the character of the Conservation Area, including a Tree Preservation Order.

The scale and siting of the proposed dwelling is, in my view, well-considered. The dwelling is set well back into the site against the existing retaining wall, preserving the attractive frontage/historic boundary wall almost intact. This, coupled with the modest scale of the single-storey dwelling ensures that the open nature of the site remains pre-eminent. The proposed materials are of high quality, a blend of natural (slate and timber) and simple modern (aluminium clad windows). The property therefore should appear appropriately recessive within its context – as opposed, say, to painted render.

This, in my view, is a careful response to the site. The preservation of historic open spaces within Conservation Areas is critical – all too many have been despoiled by overdevelopment within former gardens, orchards etc. In my view, the proposal preserves the character and appearance of Manorbier Conservation Area…’

The suggested conditions refer to the requirement for a landscaping scheme that retains the open nature of the front of the site and does not appear inappropriately ‘suburban’, together with a detailed colour scheme for rainwater goods and fenestration.

Given the proximity of the site to a scheduled historic asset – Manorbier Castle, officers also consulted Cadw as to its view on the proposal. Its assessment was as follows:-

‘The scheduled monuments PE004 Manorbier Castle and PE459 Manorbier Dovecot are located within 500m of the application site’

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 6th June 2018
PE459 is not inter-visible with the proposed bungalow due to the intervening topography

The proposed bungalow is located c 30m to the east of the scheduled area of PE004 Manorbier castle, c 75m from the outer ward and c 170m east of the inner ward. The bungalow which has a pitched roof is to be located on a slight terrace to the rear (north east) of the application area. The bungalow will not be visible from the near eastern part of the scheduled area or from the outer ward due to intervening buildings and trees. There is a possibility it could be visible from the most elevated parts of the inner ward; the north tower and round tower, particularly in winter when screening from deciduous trees at the east of the scheduled area is reduced. However its scale, elevation and position amongst adjacent buildings means the damage to the setting of the scheduled monument would be very slight and not significant.'

Amenity and Privacy:

Policy 30 seeks to avoid incompatible development and significant adverse impact upon the amenity enjoyed by neighbouring properties, particularly where the development is an inappropriate use, is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings, development leads to an increase in traffic, noise, odour or light or the development is visually intrusive.

The proposed dwelling would be considered compatible with the mixed residential and commercial nature of the village, and the plot size is such that the siting of a new dwelling, together with off-street parking and garden space would result in a development that would be in keeping with its developed surroundings. The proposal would not, therefore, be considered harmful to the character of the developed village setting.

In respect of privacy, the new dwelling will sit between Ashleigh House and Castle Mead, with The Close to its east. The new dwelling will have fenestration to all four elevations, however, the rear fenestration faces the existing rear wall to the north, and the windows to the east gable will be screened by the studio to the east (which itself does not have fenestration facing east). The distance between the front elevation of Castle Mead and the new dwelling is in excess of 25 metres. It is considered that there is sufficient separation between the existing two-storey properties and the new single storey property to ensure that there would be adequate amenity retained between occupants.

Access and parking:

Following consultation, no objections were raised in respect of highway safety or parking provision. The Highways Authority recommended conditional consent, advising that ‘...An existing gateway off the private farm road will give access to a driveway where three cars can park. This will be ample for the small 3-bedroom cottage which is proposed...’

Landscaping:

The application site falls within a Conservation Area, and Tree Preservation Order 12 (G5) is on and immediately adjacent to the application site. The Authority's Tree and Landscape Officer has assessed the proposed development in light of the existing
TPO designation on trees within and adjacent to the site, and has recommended conditional consent, requiring further information in respect of site specific details of proposed landscaping and new planting, together with details of an arboricultural method statement and proposed tree protection to ensure that there is no damage or destruction of the protected trees during development.

**Biodiversity:**
Following consultation, neither Natural Resources Wales nor the Authority’s Ecologist had any comments to make in respect of the proposal.

**Drainage/Water issues:**
Policy 32 of the LDP requires development to incorporate sustainable drainage systems for the disposal of surface water on site.

Both Natural Resources Wales and Welsh Water have been consulted as to the impact of the proposal on the water and drainage environment. The Agency has raised no objection to the proposal. Welsh Water has recommended conditional consent.

**Other material considerations:**
The site falls within a Historic Landscape – Dyfed Archaeological Trust have assessed the proposal and recommended conditional consent, requiring an assessment of the site according to an approved written scheme of investigation.

Manorbier Community Council have objected on the grounds that … *Members felt that the proposed development could be smaller in scale and was not looking to use materials that were consistent to those used on adjacent and other local buildings. The location is at the very centre of Manorbier village and the proposed development would be intrusive and disrespectful to its village location, A more sympathetic design was needed. In addition, Members thought there could be highway issues, with cars exiting the site into a narrow road, often busy with pedestrians, particularly in the summer months.*

The Community Council was also concerned that the applicant was looking to reduce the affordable housing contribution required under Policy 45.

The concerns of the Community Council and of the neighbour have been carefully considered. Whilst the report has addressed the issues relating to the impact on the historic fabric, highways, amenity and biodiversity through the consultation of the relevant specialist consultees, officers would also refer to Planning Policy Wales Edition 9, in response to the concern regarding the proposed design and its place in context to the village. Paragraphs 4.11.9 and 4.11.10 advise that the visual appearance of proposed development, its scale and its relationship to its surroundings and context are material planning considerations; and that in areas recognised for their landscape, townscape or historic value, such as National Parks, it can be appropriate to seek to promote or reinforce traditional and local distinctiveness. It also states that local planning authorities should not attempt to impose a particular architectural taste or style arbitrarily, and should avoid inhibiting opportunities for innovative design solutions.

In respect of the affordable housing contribution required under Policy 45, the Authority is clear in the supplementary planning guidance that the viability of

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 6th June 2018
proposals can be discussed. The applicant has made it clear that they propose to make a contribution in accordance with policy requirements.

**Conclusion**

Officers consider that the proposed dwelling would be an acceptable form of development at this location as it is shown that the size, design and external materials to be used for the proposed dwelling plot would be in keeping with the historic setting and the existing development pattern of properties in the immediate street scene. As such the proposal would be in accordance with the relevant policies of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan, subject to a legal agreement and conditions.

**Recommendation**

That the application be delegated to the Chief Executive (National Park Officer) / Director of Park Direction and Planning / Team Leader to grant planning permission subject to the following;

The interested person(s) first entering into a satisfactory unilateral undertaking to include the following necessary planning obligations:

- To pay an affordable housing contribution.

If the Unilateral Undertaking is not completed within 3 months of the foregoing resolution then delegated power be given to the Chief Executive (National Park Officer) / Director of Park Direction and Planning / Team Leader to exercise discretion to refuse the application on the grounds of non-compliance with Policies 45, 52 and 53 of the Local Development Plan.

And subject to the following conditions;

1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.
   **Reason:** Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).

2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:
   - Location Plan - Scale 1:1250,
   - Topographical Survey - 700417 - Scale 1:50,
   - Section drawing,
   - Proposed Plan & Front Elevation - 754 PL0004 - Scale 1:50
   - Proposed Side and Rear Elevations - 754 PL005 - Scale 1:50
   All received on 28th March 2018
   **Reason:** In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

3. No development shall commence, including any works of demolition, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The approved statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period. The statement shall provide for:
   i) the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors;

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 6th June 2018
ii) loading and unloading of plant and materials;
iii) storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development;
iv) the erection and maintenance of security hoarding including decorative displays and facilities for public viewing, where appropriate;
v) wheel washing facilities;
vi) measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during demolition and construction; and
vii) a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works.

**Reason:** To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway, danger to road users, to conserve public health and local amenity, to ensure satisfactory standard of sustainable development and in order to ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 25 (Recycled, Secondary and Waste Materials), 29 (Sustainable Design), 30 (Amenity), 31 (Minimising Waste) and 53 (Impacts of Traffic).

4. No development or site clearance shall commence until the local planning authority have been informed in writing of the name of a professionally qualified archaeologist who is to be present during the undertaking of any excavations in the development area so that a watching brief can be conducted. No work shall commence until the local planning authority has confirmed in writing that the proposed archaeologist is suitable. A copy of the watching brief report shall be submitted to the local planning authority within two months of the archaeological fieldwork being completed.

**Reason:** To assess the archaeological value of the site. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policy 8 (Special Qualities) and Planning Policy Wales (Edition 9, November 2016) – Chapter 6 (Conserving the Historic Environment).

5. The parking and turning area as shown on the submitted drawings shall be completed before the development is brought into use and thereafter shall be used for no purpose other than parking and turning.

**Reason:** To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway or danger to road users. Local Development Plan, Policy 53 - Impacts of Traffic.

6. A schedule of external colours to be submitted to the National Park Authority for approval, in writing, prior to the commencement of work. The development thereafter shall be carried out and retained in accordance with the approved plans.

**Reason:** To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan, Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and 29 - Sustainable Design.

7. Before installation, details of any external illumination proposed for the dwelling, including measures to control light spillage, shall be submitted to the National Park Authority for approval, in writing. Development shall be carried out and maintained in accordance with the approved details.
Reason: To ensure that animal and plant species which within the terms of the Conservation (Habits 2c) Regulations 1994 are effectively protected and the Local Development Plan – Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity.

8. No development, demolition or site clearance shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority a scheme relating to the immediate landscape. The approved scheme shall include the following details:

• Initial tree, hedge and hedgebank site information
• Proposed site specific tree, hedge and hedgebank work
• Tree, Hedge and Hedgebank Protection
• Arboricultural Method Statement (AMS)
• Proposed landscaping details

All works to be carried out as approved

Reason: In the interests of maintaining a suitable scheme of landscaping to protect the visual amenity of the area, to maintain the special qualities of the landscape and habitats through the protection, creation and enhancement of links between sites and their protection for amenity, landscape and biodiversity value. Policy: Local Development Plan - Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 11 (Protection of Biodiversity), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 30 (Amenity).

9. No surface water and/or land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage network.

Reason: To prevent hydraulic overload of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment. Local Development Plan Policy 32 (Surface Water Drainage)

10. Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995, (or any Order revoking or re-enacting that Order) any electricity or telephone supplies to the site shall be by underground cables.

Reason: To preserve the character of the area. Local Development Plan - Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty and 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park.

11. Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995, (relating to extensions to, and changes to the external appearance of, the dwelling and to development or the siting of a caravan within the curtilage of the dwellinghouse), no development of Parts 1, 2, 6 and 40 of Schedule 2 to that Order (or any Order revoking or re-enacting that Order) shall be carried out without specific planning permission being obtained.

Reason: To preserve the character of the area. Local Development Plan - Policy 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, 8 - Special Qualities, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and 30 - Amenity.