A Committee site visit took place on 17 September 2018 where Members viewed the application site and the surrounding site context. Since the site visit amended plans have been received.

Consultee Response

St Davids City Council: Supporting
PCNPA Buildings Conservation Officer: No objection to replacement dwelling and no adverse impact on the setting of the Conservation Area
Natural Resources Wales: No objection
PCNPA Planning Ecologist: No objection
PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent
Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional Consent
Dyfed Archaeological Trust: No adverse comments

Public Response

A site notice and neighbour notification letter were posted in accordance with the requirement of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012. Two letters of representation have been received from the occupiers of neighbouring properties.

One letter has stated they have no grounds for worry about a two-storey house, but they are concerned that the new house should not be any further forward than the front of the existing building. They are concerned that treating the front of the house as a parking area will spoil the neighbourhood.

The other letter raised the following concerns.
- Loss of privacy
- The proposal results in three new parking spaces, two adjacent to the porch.
- The increase in bedrooms and the provision of parking spaces leads us to believe that there will be an increase in traffic
- The proposed porch crosses the existing building line
- Concerned about the impact on the granary building, which is listed. The height of the proposed new property will significantly impact rear-facing views from and of the granary. In addition, when considering
rearward views of the granary, the design is not in keeping with the listed building.

- The area is currently occupied by four properties, built contemporaneously, each a bungalow and each with similar design principles. They form a harmonious whole which in any terms will be fundamentally disrupted by the proposed building.

In both letters, some non-material planning considerations have also been raised.

Further objections have been received following the receipt of the amended plans which reiterated concerns previously raised and identified the following additional concern:-

- The application site is not wholly within the ownership of the applicant.

The comments received are addressed in the main body of the report.

**Policies considered**

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page of Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website - http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty
LDP Policy 05 - St Davids Local Centre
LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities
LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity
LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park
LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design
LDP Policy 30 - Amenity
LDP Policy 52 - Sustainable Transport
LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic
PPW9 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability
PPW9 Chapter 05 - Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast
PPW9 Chapter 06 - Conserving the Historic Environment
SPG05 - Sustainable Design
TAN 12 - Design

**Constraints**

LDP Mineral Safeguard
Biodiversity Issue
Historic Landscape
Safeguarding Zone
Ancient Monument - within 50m
Hazardous Zones
LDP Centre:50pc aff housing;30 units/ha
Recreation Character Areas
Landscape Character Assessment

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 17th October 2018
Officer’s Appraisal

The application site comprises a small detached bungalow known as 24 Catherine Street, on the western edge of St David’s, within the centre boundary as defined by the Local Development Plan.

The site is set back from Catherine Street, with some vegetation between the dwelling and the highway and is accessed via a private shared drive which serves only a handful of properties. These properties define the character for the setting of the application site, that of relatively small, detached, single storey dwellings with a similar design. Whilst Catherine Street itself has quite a diverse range of housing in varying sizes, styles and materials, the definitive boundary of planting which is adjacent to the highway means that the application site is not seen in the context of Catherine Street as a whole.

The application site is directly to the west of the St David’s Conservation Area boundary, but it is not within it. There is a Grade II Listed former warehouse building, which is vacant, adjacent to the site which directly fronts Catherine Street. Glimpsed views of the application site are possible from the main highway looking north, adjacent to the listed warehouse building.

The supporting statement submitted with the application acknowledges that the existing dwelling is ‘a small single storey with a slate roof. It has a small side porch to the west, adjacent to no. 26. The green frontage, historic context and simple recessive appearance make for an unobtrusive property’ … which they go on to qualify; occupying a site which has capacity for a larger contextually appropriate replacement dwelling’.

Planning History

NP/17/0637 proposed a single storey rear extension, raising the roof (400mm to accommodate loft conversion) and 2 no. rear dormers plus a rooflight. No changes were proposed to the front elevation, other than raising the roof. This application was approved under delegated authority on 22 December 2017.

Current Proposal

This application seeks approval for the demolition of the existing single storey dwelling and replacement with a 2-storey dwelling.

The replacement dwelling will occupy a similar position within the plot, but the footprint of the building has been enlarged and an additional storey added. Two no. parking spaces are marked directly to the front of the dwelling with a third space perpendicular to the house and adjacent to a garage, which belongs to the neighbouring property. A small porch is proposed on the front of the dwelling. The front façade of the dwelling has been proposed with a traditional design and choice of materials (including natural stone, sash windows and a slate roof). To the rear, the property has a more modern design and palate of materials including render and larger areas of glazing.
The accommodation at ground floor includes a porch, hall, study, shower room, utility room, kitchen and dining area and rear lounge and at first floor four no. bedrooms, two with en-suite and a family bathroom. A Juliet balcony is proposed on the master bedroom.

**Key Issues**

- Policy and Principle of Development
- Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park and Historic Assets
- Amenity and Privacy
- Access and Parking
- Biodiversity

**Policy and Principle of Development**

The application site is within the Local Centre of St Davids and the principle of a replacement dwelling is therefore acceptable.

Policy 5 of the LDP refers to St Davids Local Centre where land use priorities include e) to ensure developments permitted contribute to the protection and enhancement of the City’s special qualities.

Policy 8 of the LDP refers to Special Qualities where priorities will be to ensure that b) The identity and character of towns and villages is not lost through coalescence and ribboning of development or through the poor design and layout of development. The identification of Green Wedges will assist in achieving this priority and d) The historic environment is protected and where possible enhanced.

Policy 11 of the LDP requires biodiversity and landscape considerations to be taken into account in determining individual applications.

Policy 15 of the LDP states that development will not be permitted where this would adversely affect the qualities and special character of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park by: a) causing significant visual intrusion; and/or, b) being insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape; and/or c) introducing or intensifying a use which is incompatible with its location; and/or d) failing to harmonise with, or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park; and/or e) losing or failing to incorporate important traditional features.

Policy 29 of the LDP refers to Sustainable Design and states all proposals for development will be expected to demonstrate an integrated approach to design and construction, and will be required to be well designed in terms of: a) Place and local distinctiveness

Policy 30 of the LDP refers to amenity and states that development will not be permitted where it has an unacceptable impact on amenity, particularly where: a) the development is for a use inappropriate for where people live or visit;

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 17th October 2018
Item 5a)

and/or b) the development is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings; and/or c) the development leads to an increase in traffic or noise or odour or light which has a significant adverse impact; and/or d) the development is visually intrusive.

Siting, Design and Impact upon the Special Qualities of the National Park and Historic Assets.

The principle of a replacement dwelling is accepted in policy terms, however, the most important consideration particularly when considering the relevant criteria of policies 8, 15, 29 and 30 (as above) is to ensure that the replacement is not of a poor design, is of a scale compatible with its surroundings and is not visually intrusive.

The amended scheme proposes a replacement dwelling which is two storey reaching an approx. height of 6.8m. The existing dwelling is approx. 5.5m to ridge and the approved extensions and alterations to the property allowed under the 2017 application had a new ridge to approx. 5.9m. The character of the immediate vicinity of the application site is that of rather unassuming single storey detached dwellings which are more modest in scale, massing and proportions, the property to the south east is a three storey Grade II listed building. The amended plans have reduced the scale of the dwelling, and whilst it is still two storey, given its location at the end of the cul de sac and its position adjacent to a three storey building it is considered that the two storey appearance at this location is considered acceptable.

The PCNPA Buildings Conservation Officer has been consulted due to the location of the site adjacent to the boundary of the St David’s Conservation Area and a Grade II listed building. The Officer acknowledges that the existing bungalow is of no real architectural/historical merit and that he does not object to its replacement. The façade of the replacement dwelling is of traditional scale, design and materials, and as such it is considered to pay regard to the setting of the adjacent listed building. In turn, it is considered that the proposal does not have an adverse impact on the setting of the St Davids conservation area.

Amenity and Privacy

Since the committee meeting of 5th September 2018 the agent has submitted amended plans to attempt to overcome officers concerns in respect of amenity.

The lower roof lights serving bedroom No.2 has been removed, and replaced with a single roof light higher up the roof, the roof light has been removed from bedroom No.1 and the ensuite bathroom will be fitted with obscurely glazed glass.

Having regard to the amendments made, including the reduction in height of the building by 30cm, it is not considered that the development will give rise to an adverse overlooking to such an extent as to warrant refusal of this scheme.

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 17th October 2018
Whilst some view of the neighbouring property may still be possible these will be at an acute angle, therefore, the overlooking caused is not so significant as to warrant refusal of the scheme.

The reduction in height of the proposed dwelling at the section nearest the neighbouring property, now resembles similar proportions to those approved under the 2017 permission, as such, it is not considered that the development will have such an overbearing impact on the adjacent property.

**Access and Parking**

The Highway Authority has been consulted on the application. They refer to the fact that a private drive leads to this plot. They have no objection to the development but recommend a condition to secure that the parking facilities (for all vehicles, including cycles) as shown on the plan shall be provided before the building is first occupied and thereafter retained for that purpose.

An objection has been received since the committee meeting of 5th September which states that the land is not wholly within the ownership of the applicant, whilst this is a civil matter the claim has been put to the applicant, who has responded with copies of title deeds advising that they consider the land to be within their ownership. Amended plans have been received which amends the front boundary by a reduction of approximately 1m.

**Biodiversity**

A Report called ‘Updated Report on a Bat Survey at 24 Catherine Road [sic], St Davids’ by Rowan Ecological was submitted with the application.

Both NRW and PCNPA Ecologist have been consulted, and no objections have been raised in respect of the proposed development.

**Conclusion**

Notwithstanding the objections raised and following detailed consideration of the planning issues identified, including responses from statutory consultees and neighbours, it is concluded that the proposed replacement dwelling is considered to be acceptable in terms of planning policy and the impact on neighbours and the immediate street scene. Consequently the development is recommended for approval subject to conditions.

**Recommendation**

The application is recommended for approval for the following reason:

1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.
   **Reason:** Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).
2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:
   Drawing ref: P01 (Received 22.05.2018)
   Drawing ref: P02 (Received 22.05.2018)
   Drawing ref: P03 (Received 29.08.2018)
   Drawing ref: P04 Rev. B (Received 20.09.2018)
   Drawing ref: P05 Rev. C (Received 20.09.2018)
   Drawing ref: P06 Rev. B (Received 18.09.2018)
   Drawing ref: P07 Rev. B (Received 18.09.2018)
   Bat Survey Report (Received 22.05.2017)
   **Reason:** In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

3. The off-street parking facilities shown on the plan hereby approved shall be provided before the building is first occupied, and thereafter retained for that purpose.
   **Reason:** To ensure the satisfactory provision of parking facilities and in the interests of highway safety and the amenity of the area.

4. No surface water and/or land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage network.
   **Reason:** To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment.

5. Following site clearance and prior to the commencement of any construction work, site profiles of the external ground and internal finished floor levels shall be set out on site for approval by the National Park Authority. The works shall thereafter be carried out and retained in accordance with the approved plans.
   **Reason:** To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan - Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, Policy 8 - Special Qualities, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, 29 - Sustainable Design and 30 - Amenity.